

**Summary Minutes of the
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee (CASAC)
Public Teleconference
May 8, 2013
1:00pm – 3:00pm**

CASAC Members: Dr. Christopher Frey, Chair
Dr. Ron Wyzga
Dr. Kathleen Weathers
Dr. Helen Suh
Dr. Jack Harkema
Mr. George Allen
Dr. Ana Diez-Roux

Purpose: To review draft letters on EPA's *Integrated Science Assessment for Lead* (Third External Review Draft – November 2012) and EPA's *Policy Assessment for the Review of the Lead National Ambient Air Quality Standards* (External Review Draft – January 2013).

Designated Federal Officer: Dr. Holly Stallworth, Designated Federal Officer

Other EPA Staff: Aaron Yeow, Rachel House, Suril Mehta, Meredith Pedde, Marion Hoyer, David Orlin, John Vandenberg, Mary Ross, Erin Hines, Lisa Vinikoor-Imler, Meredith Lassiter, David Svendsgaard, Elizabeth Owens, Ellen Kirrane, Molini Patel, Dennis Kotchmar, Jennifer Richmond-Bryant, Kevin Cavendar, Diedre Murphy

Public: Linda Wilson (New York Attorney General's Office), Roger Miksad (Battery Council International), Chris Knight (Inside EPA), John Howes (Redland Energy), Tony Roberts (Nevada Division of Environmental Protection)

Meeting Materials and Meeting Webpage:

The materials listed below may be found on the meeting webpage at:
<http://yosemite.epa.gov/sab/sabproduct.nsf/bf498bd32a1c7fdf85257242006dd6cb/c8927b033cbedfdb85257b1d00671864!OpenDocument&Date=2013-05-08>

- Agenda
- Federal Register Notice
- Public Comments from RSR Corporation and Kennecott Utah Copper LLC.
- Draft Reports:
 - 04-22-13 Draft CASAC Review of the EPA's *Integrated Science Assessment for Lead* (Third External Review Draft – November 2012)

- 04-22-13 Draft CASAC Review of the EPA's *Policy Assessment for the Review of the Lead National Ambient Air Quality Standards* (January 2013 Draft)

Meeting Summary

The discussion followed the plan presented in the meeting agenda.

WEDNESDAY, MAY 8, 2013

Dr. Stallworth convened the meeting and explained that CASAC operates under the Federal Advisory Committee Act. She also noted that all CASAC members were in compliance with conflict of interest and federal ethics rules. She then asked Dr. Helen Suh to chair the review of the draft letters since Dr. Christopher Frey had chaired the CASAC Lead Review Panel. There was one public commenter, Mr. Gerard Manley of RSR Corporation, who presented oral comments (posted at the meeting webpage at the URL above) that stressed the need for greater protection for exposed children than provided by the 2008 Lead (Pb) NAAQS.

Dr. Suh asked Dr. Frey to summarize the *Integrated Science Assessment* (ISA) letter and Dr. Frey walked members through the letter.

With respect to the ISA letter, CASAC members discussed the language for acknowledging there will be no further review of the ISA while asking EPA to consider the recommendations from CASAC.

CASAC discussed the causal determination for low level Pb exposure and renal dysfunction and Dr. Frey explained that panelists felt strongly enough about that recommendation (that the relationship was “suggestive of a causal relationship” rather than “likely to be causal”) to put it in the letter to the Administrator. By comparison, CASAC had less disagreement with EPA’s causal determination for the relationship between Pb exposure and attention-related behavioral problems. In response to a question from a CASAC member, Dr. John Vandenberg of EPA’s National Center for Environmental Assessment noted that EPA had already “downgraded” the causal determination for renal dysfunction from “causal” to “likely causal” in going from the 2nd draft to the 3rd draft.

One member asked for a change in the sentence referring to “relative magnitude of risk factors” to distinguish between effect modification versus increased exposure. Members agreed to revise the language to refer to the extent to which risk factors modify the effect of Pb exposure. Members agreed to make this revision in response to Question 6 on Potentially At-Risk Populations as well.

CASAC members turned their attention to the Policy Assessment (PA) letter. Dr. Frey summarized the letter and pointed out that CASAC was not expecting to review a 2nd

draft PA. One member stressed the need to distinguish between whether there is new information or whether new information exists but it is not sufficient to justify changing the standard. Dr. Frey explained that there is new literature but it doesn't make forward progress on reducing data gaps and uncertainty on the relationship between air Pb levels and blood concentrations. Members agreed to specify the remaining data gaps and research needs in the letter.

Dr. Frey explained that the Lead Review Panel wanted EPA to provide more context for Pb exposure, specifically that Pb exposure from air emissions were a small fraction of human exposure. Moreover, exposure pathways through outdoor soil and indoor dust in response to legacy Pb were more important in determining blood Pb levels.

Again a member asked for a distinction to be made between whether there was no information or whether new information exists but was not sufficient to justify lowering the standard. Members debated whether it was contradictory to say there is no scientific evidence of a threshold on the one hand, while still recommending retention of the current Pb standard. Dr. Frey referred to the choice of standard as a policy issue when there is no evidence of a threshold. Moreover, he said information was not available to assess air to blood level relationships at the current standard, making it difficult to assess the adequacy of the current standard.

Members agreed to delete language referring to risk communication and the setting of a standard based on implicit acceptance of a 1 - 2 point loss of IQ.

Mr. Aaron Yeow, Designated Federal Officer for the Lead Review Panel, said he would work with Dr. Frey to make final edits to the letters. Since some members expressed a desire to review the letters after these revisions, Mr. Yeow said he would send out the revised letters to the full CASAC for their final concurrence.

On Behalf of the Committee,
Respectfully Submitted,

Holly Stallworth, Ph.D. /s/
Designated Federal Officer

Certified as True:

Christopher Frey, Ph.D. /s/
Chair, Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee

NOTE AND DISCLAIMER: The minutes of this public meeting reflect diverse ideas and suggestions offered by committee members during the course of deliberations within the meeting. Such ideas, suggestions, and deliberations do not necessarily reflect definitive consensus advice from the panel members. The reader is cautioned to not rely on the minutes represent final, approved, consensus advice and recommendations offered to the Agency. Such advice and recommendations may be found in the final

advisories, commentaries, letters, or reports prepared and transmitted to the EPA Administrator following the public meetings