

Summary Minutes of the
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA)
Science Advisory Board (SAB)
Advisory Council on Clean Air Compliance Analysis
Public Teleconference
November 1, 2004

COUNCIL Members: Dr. Trudy Cameron
Dr. Nino Kuenzli
Dr. Dallas Burtraw
Dr. Wayne Gray
Dr. F. Reed Johnson
Dr. Katherine Kiel
Dr. Chris Walcek
Dr. James Hammitt
Ms. Laurie Chestnut

Subcommittee Members: Dr. Bart Ostro, HES Chair
Dr. Michael Kleinman
Dr. Mort Lippmann

Date and Time: 1:00pm – 2:00pm, November 1, 2004

Location: Teleconference

Purpose: The purpose of this teleconference was to present a draft letter from the Health Effects Subcommittee (written in response to the August 11, 2004 letter of request from EPA's Office of Policy, Economics and Innovation and EPA's Office of Air and Radiation) to the full COUNCIL for review and approval. (Attachment A).

SAB Staff: Dr. Holly Stallworth, Designated Federal Officer

Other EPA Staff: Ted Helmar

Other Attendees: Alex Karafilidis, Thermo Electron Corp
Marcin Skomial, Air Daily
Stephanie Cohen, CBS Marketwatch
Anthony Lacey, Inside EPA
Christy Kubista, Nat'l Agricultural Statistics Service
Lisa Herschberger, Minnesota Pollution Control Agency
Jim Newman, Industrial Economics

Meeting Summary

The discussion followed the issues and general timing as presented in the meeting agenda (Attachment B).

MONDAY, NOVEMBER 1, 2004

Opening of Public Meeting

Dr. Holly Stallworth, Designated Federal Officer (DFO), opened the meeting with a statement that the Health Effects Subcommittee, a standing subcommittee of the chartered Advisory Council on Clean Air Compliance Analysis, is a federal advisory committee whose meetings and deliberations must meet the requirements of the Federal Advisory Committee Act which provides for open meetings and making available to the public summaries of meetings, and providing opportunities for public comment. The COUNCIL members and Health Effects Subcommittee members were all in compliance with Federal ethics laws and have been evaluated for any conflict-of-interest or appearance of a lack of impartiality issues.

Teleconference

Dr. Cameron reviewed the agenda and introduced the new members, Dallas Burtraw and Wayne Gray. Dr. Bart Ostro then reviewed the history of the recent draft letter that is being presented to the COUNCIL. See Attachment A. Dr. Ostro summarized the HES thoughts on the cessation lag, indicating the differences under the previous 5 year lag structure versus the currently proposed 20 year lag. Dr. Ostro briefly touched on the recent studies that indicated health benefits accruing early in the process. Another member added that the lung cancer process accounts for the longer lag structure (20 years).

One member asked about the effect of different lag structures on costs and benefits calculations. Discussion continued on this, resulting in a consensus to add a sentence or two simply acknowledging the general tendency – resulting from discount rates -- for lower monetized benefits when effects are distributed further into the future. Members pointed out that it was important to note that any such difference in the calculation of monetized benefits stemmed from discounting, not from the lag structure.

Dr. Ostro and Ms. Chestnut volunteered to add a sentence or two in the letter to acknowledge the possible effects of lag structure on monetized benefits.

HES members were polled for their consent to the addition of a sentence or two and all agreed.

COUNCIL members were polled as to their consent with the HES draft letter and the suggested minor additions and e-mail process of final approval. All agreed and no objections were voiced. Dr. Stallworth volunteered to compose an appendix of studies used for the HES draft letter.

Respectfully Submitted:

/Signed/ Holly Stallworth

Designated Federal Officer

Certified as True:

/Signed/ Trudy Cameron

Chair

NOTE AND DISCLAIMER: The minutes of this public meeting reflect diverse ideas and suggestions offered by Committee member during the course of deliberations within the meeting. Such ideas, suggestions and deliberations do not necessarily reflect consensus advice from the panel members. The reader is cautioned to not rely on the minutes to represent final, approved, consensus advice and recommendations offered to the Agency. Such advice and recommendations may be found in the final advisories, commentaries, letters or reports prepared and transmitted to the EPA Administrator following the public meetings.