

**U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Advisory Council on Clean Air Compliance Analysis (Council)**

Public Teleconference
November 22, 2010
11:00 a.m. – 12:00 p.m. Eastern Time

Minutes of the Meeting

Attendees:

Council Members: James Hammitt (Chair), John Bailar, Michelle Bell, Sylvia Brandt, Linda Bui, Dallas Burtraw, Ivan Fernandez, Shelby Gerking, Wayne Gray, Alan Hansen, Jon Levy, Rich Poirot, Arden Pope, Ted Russell and Michael Walsh (for details, see Council Roster¹)

SAB Staff Office: Stephanie Sanzone (Designated Federal Officer)

Other EPA Staff: Jim DeMocker,

Other Attendees, Including Persons Who Requested the Call-in Number:

Doug Austin, Institute of Clean Air Companies
Andrew Childers, BNA
Danielle Dancho, Arizona DEQ
Gabe Nelson, eenews.net
Colin C. O'Brien, NRDC
Stuart Parker, Inside Washington
Aaron Weston, Dow Lohnes Government Strategies

Purpose:

The purpose of the meeting was to discuss the Council's draft (October 4, 2010) report, *Review of the Second Section 812 Prospective Study of the Benefits and Costs of the Clean Air Act*

Meeting Materials:

All materials discussed at the meeting are available on the Council website, <http://www.epa.gov/advisorycouncilcaa>, at the [November 22, 2010 Council Meeting](#) page.

Summary of Discussions:

The meeting was announced in the Federal Register² and proceeded according to the meeting agenda³ as revised. **Ms. Stephanie Sanzone**, Designated Federal Officer for the Council, convened the meeting and noted that the Council operates in accordance with the Federal Advisory Committee Act. This means that meetings are announced and open to the public, meeting minutes are prepared, and all materials prepared for or by the Council are available to the public. Ms. Sanzone noted that Dr. Keohane had notified her that he was on jury duty and would be unable to participate in the meeting.

Dr. James Hammitt, Chair of the Council, thanked Council members for submitting written comments on the October 4, 2010, draft Council letter⁴. He referred to his proposed edits to the letter⁵ in response to member comments, and asked for discussion and reaction to the proposed changes.

The following is a summary of the issues discussed and conclusions reached during the meeting.

Members considered recommending that EPA compare the 812 benefits estimates with published estimates developed using econometric approaches, but ultimately concluded that too many caveats would have to be included because of differences between the studies. Instead, members agreed to mention that there are alternative approaches, including econometric studies of housing and other markets, for estimating benefits of reducing air pollution and EPA should acknowledge this in the report.

Members discussed whether information in the EPA document on benefits per ton emitted is useful, given that it aggregates across different pollutants with vastly different characteristics.

Members agreed to omit the reference to the per capita benefits as being around 10 percent of average income, because of different possible definitions of household median or average income.

Other suggested edits in the Chairman's Proposal were accepted. Council members then concurred in principle with the draft report, and authorized Dr. Hammitt to make the revisions discussed on the call. In response to a question from Mr. DeMocker, Dr. Hammitt clarified that Appendix A (which had been a placeholder for detailed technical comments) had been dropped from the Council report.

The DFO adjourned the meeting at 12:00 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted:

/s/

Stephanie Sanzone,
Designated Federal Officer
EPA Science Advisory Board Staff Office

Certified as Accurate:

/s/

James K. Hammitt, Chair
EPA Advisory Council on Clean
Air Compliance Analysis

NOTE AND DISCLAIMER: The minutes of this public meeting reflect diverse ideas and suggestions offered by Panel members during the course of deliberations at the meeting. Such ideas, suggestions and deliberations do not necessarily reflect consensus advice from the Panel. The reader is cautioned not to rely on the minutes to represent final, approved, consensus advice and recommendations offered to the Agency. Such advice and recommendations may be found in the final advisories, commentaries, letters or reports prepared and transmitted to the EPA Administrator following the public meetings.

Materials Cited

The following meeting materials are available on the Council website,
<http://www.epa.gov/advisorycouncilcaa>, at the [November 22, 2010 Council Meeting](#) page:

¹Council Roster, November 22, 2010

² Federal Register Notice of the Meeting (75 FR 68787, November 9, 2010)

³ Agenda, Advisory Council on Clean Air Compliance Analysis, November 22, 2010

⁴ Council Draft Report (dated October 4, 2010), Review of the Second Section 812 Prospective Study of the Benefits and Costs of the Clean Air Act

⁵ Chairman's Proposed Revisions to October 4, 2010 Council Draft Report