

**Summary Minutes of the
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA)
Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee (CASAC)
Public Teleconference
July 16, 2014**

Date and Time: Wednesday, July 16, 2014, 10:00 AM – 1:00 PM ET

Location: Telephone only

Purpose: The purpose of the meeting was to conduct quality reviews of draft CASAC reports on EPA's Integrated Review Plan for the Primary National Ambient Air Quality Standard for Sulfur Dioxide¹ and EPA's Recommendation for an additional Federal Reference Method for Ozone²

Participants: Chartered CASAC
Dr. H. Christopher Frey, Chair (for full CASAC, see roster³)
Mr. George Allen
Dr. Ana Diez-Roux
Dr. Jack Harkema
Dr. Kathleen Weathers
Dr. Ronald Wyzga

Mr. Aaron Yeow, Designated Federal Office (DFO), EPA SAB Staff Office
Mr. Ed Hanlon, EPA SAB Staff Office
Dr. Diana Wong, EPA SAB Staff Office

Other Attendees (See Attachment A)

Wednesday, July 16, 2014

Opening Remarks

Mr. Aaron Yeow, DFO, opened the meeting. He noted that as required under the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA), the CASAC's deliberations are held in public with advanced notice given in the Federal Register⁴, and the meeting minutes will be made publicly available after the meeting. He noted that there was one member of the public who registered in advance with the SAB Staff Office to make an oral comment. He noted that the CASAC received written public comments, which were also posted on the meeting webpage. He stated that the SAB Staff Office determined that there were no issues with conflict-of-interest nor any issues with an appearance of a lack of impartiality for any of the CASAC members. He then turned it over to Dr. Chris Frey, Chair of the CASAC.

Dr. Frey welcomed everyone and provided an overview of the Agenda⁵.

Public Comments on the Draft CASAC IRP Report

There were no public comments on the draft CASAC IRP Report.

Discussion of the Draft CASAC IRP Report

Dr. Ana Diez-Roux, chair of the CASAC Augmented for Sulfur Oxides Review Panel provided an overview of the Draft CASAC IRP Report.

Consensus Responses to Charge Questions

The CASAC had discussion on strengthening and clarifying the recommendation that the REA planning document be peer-reviewed on page 1. The CASAC agreed to revise the first bullet on page 3 to be less prescriptive about the indicator. There was some discussion about clarifying the recommendation for a strategy to use the existing monitoring network for exposure analysis of the target population. For lines 24-33 on page 5, the CASAC agreed to revise some of the language regarding the modeling and may refer to individual panel member comments for further details.

Letter to Administrator

There was discussion about making the recommendation regarding the peer review of the REA planning document consistent with the consensus response. For lines 22-24 on page 2 of the letter, the CASAC agreed to revisions to make it consistent with previously discussed changes to the consensus response.

Disposition of Draft IRP Report

The Chartered CASAC members approved the report with the discussed changes.

Public Comments on Draft CASAC Ozone FRM Report

Will Ollison, American Petroleum Institute, made an oral statement⁶, noting written comments submitted by Alan Leston⁷. Mr. Ollison focused his comments on agreeing that the current ethylene chemiluminescence (ET-CL) Federal Reference Method (FRM) is obsolete, preference for the ultraviolet-scrubberless measurement method (UV-SL) Federal Equivalent Method (FEM) as a FRM candidate, and asking the CASAC to encourage EPA to conduct additional testing rather than affirming a new FRM now.

Mr. George Allen, Chair of the CASAC Air Monitoring and Methods Subcommittee (AMMS), noted that the AMMS members were aware of the ET-CL issues raised by Mr. Ollison and that the EPA Office of Research and Development's (ORD) recent testing of the ET-CL method in Houston did not show significant levels of interference. Mr. Allen also noted that the CASAC was encouraging EPA to continue testing of the Nitric Oxide-Chemiluminescence (NO-CL) measurement method, as well as the UV-SL method, and that there needs to be more data for the UV-SL method.

Discussion of Draft CASAC Ozone FRM Report

Mr. George Allen provided some background and an overview of the CASAC Ozone FRM Report.

Consensus Responses to Charge Questions

For page 3 lines 8-25, the CASAC agreed to shorten the discussion. The CASAC also agreed to add some detail to page 3, lines 37-39 on comparability of the NO-CL with the ET-CL method. In addition,

the CASAC agreed to add a recommendation to this section of the draft report that ORD assess results of its additional field tests on the NO-CL method that ORD planned to conduct in late June, 2014 in Denver. The CASAC agreed to deleting lines 6-17 on page 5, and adding a short summary of that discussion to page 4 lines 26-27. For the response to charge question 4, the CASAC agreed to revise the language regarding conclusions on the suitability of low-cost sensors. There was also agreement to define a sensor in comparison to a FRM, and “low-cost” as several hundred dollars. There was discussion about the use of low-cost sensors for measuring secondary pollutants in rural areas and it was agreed to revise the discussion for clarity.

Letter to Administrator

There were discussions on making revisions to lines 38-40, 42, and 45-46 on page 1 and lines 1-2 on page 2 of the letter for clarity. For lines 4-5 on page 2, it was agreed to revise the statement to clarify that the CASAC recommends that ORD continue to evaluate the UV-SL method. The CASAC agreed to shorten lines 4-11 on page 2, removing some of the unnecessary detail and breaking up lines 13-28 on page 2 into two paragraphs. The CASAC also agreed to delete the sentence beginning on line 30.

Disposition of Draft CASAC Ozone FRM Report

The Chartered CASAC members approved the report with the previously discussed changes.

Summary and Action Items

Dr. Frey discussed action items and the remaining schedule for finalizing the reports.

The meeting was adjourned by Mr. Yeow at 12:15 pm.

Respectfully Submitted:

Certified as Accurate:

/SIGNED/

/SIGNED/

Mr. Aaron Yeow
Designated Federal Officer
EPA SAB Staff Office

Dr. H. Christopher Frey
Chair
CASAC

NOTE AND DISCLAIMER: The minutes of this public meeting reflect diverse ideas and suggestions offered by Panel members during the course of deliberations within the meeting. Such ideas, suggestions and deliberations do not necessarily reflect consensus advice from the Panel members. The reader is cautioned to not rely on the minutes to represent final, approved, consensus advice and recommendations offered to the Agency. Such advice and recommendations may be found in the final advisories, commentaries, letters or reports prepared and transmitted to the EPA Administrator following the public meetings.

Materials Cited

The following meeting materials are available on the CASAC website: <http://www.epa.gov/casac>, at the [July 16, 2014 CASAC Meeting page](#):

¹ 07-01-14 Draft CASAC Review of the EPA's Integrated Review Plan for the Primary NAAQS for Sulfur Dioxide

² Review of EPA's Recommendation for an Additional Federal Reference Method for Ozone: Nitric Oxide-Chemiluminescence-07-01-14 Draft

³ CASAC Roster

⁴ Federal Register Notice Announcing the Public Meeting

⁵ Agenda

⁶ Oral Statement on the Draft FRM Report from Will Ollison, American Petroleum Institute

⁷ Comments on the Draft FRM Report from Alan Leston, AirQuality Research & Logistics, LLC

**ATTACHMENT A – Other Attendees
CASAC Public Meeting**

Name	Affiliation
Ambrosio, Patrick	BNA
Aucoin, Vivian	Louisiana Department of Environmental Quality
Breen, Michael	USEPA
Buckley, Barbara	USEPA
Dutton, Steve	USEPA
Graham, Stephen	USEPA
Hall, Eric	USEPA
Hemby, James	USEPA
Hines, Erin	USEPA
Hulse-Moyer, Laurie	Washington State Department of Ecology
Jansen, John	Southern Company
Kaushik, Surender	USEPA
Kwong, Jenette	California Air Resources Board
Langstaff, John	USEPA
Lester, Alan	AirQuality Research & Logistics, LLC
Long, Tom	USEPA
Manis, David	Texas Commission on Environmental Quality
Ollison, Will	American Petroleum Institute
Peterka, Amanda	Greenwire
Radick, Lea	Inside EPA
Rice, Joann	USEPA
Ross, Mary	USEPA
Rothschild, Tara	US House Committee on Energy and Commerce
Stevens, Tina	USEPA
Stewart, Michael	USEPA
Vandenberg, John	USEPA
Vinikoor-Imler, Lisa	USEPA