

Summary Minutes of the
Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee
Ozone Review Panel
Public Teleconference
July 6, 2011

Committee Members: Dr. Jonathan Samet, Chair
Mr. Ed Avol
Dr. John Bailar
Dr. Joseph Brain
Dr. David Chock
Dr. W. Michael Foster
Dr. Christopher Frey
Dr. Judith Graham
Dr. David Grantz
Dr. Jack Harkema
Dr. Ted Russell
Dr. Steven Kleeberger
Dr. Fred Miller
Dr. Ted Russell
Dr. Helen Suh
Dr. James Ultman
Dr. Sverre Vedal
Dr. Peter Woodbury

Date and Time: July 6, 2011: 10:00 am – 1:00 pm

Purpose: The Ozone Review Panel reviewed its draft letter on the *Integrated Science Assessment for Ozone and Related Photochemical Oxidants* (March 2011).

SAB Staff: Dr. Holly Stallworth, Designated Federal Officer

Other EPA Staff: Mary Ross, John Vandenberg, James Brown, Beth Owens, Steve Dutton, Tom Luben, Susan Stone

Others: Ted Steichen, American Petroleum Institute
Julie Goodman, Gradient Corporation
Linda Wilson, New York Attorney General's Office
Steve Gouze, California Air Resources Board
Michael Honeycutt, Texas Commission on Environmental Quality
Cara Kesler, Wyoming Department of Environmental Quality
Larry Gephart, Exxon Mobile Biomedical

Meeting Summary

The discussion followed the issues and general timing as presented in the meeting agenda. The meeting agenda and public comments may be found at this URL: <http://yosemite.epa.gov/sab/sabproduct.nsf/bf498bd32a1c7fdf85257242006dd6cb/b4c393858247e2fe8525789b0053cb92!OpenDocument&Date=2011-07-06>

WEDNESDAY, JULY 6, 2011

Opening of Public Meeting

Dr. Holly Stallworth, Designated Federal Officer (DFO), opened the meeting with a statement that the CASAC Ozone Review Panel is a federal advisory committee whose meetings and deliberations meet the requirements of the Federal Advisory Committee Act. Dr. Samet reviewed the agenda and purpose of the meeting.

On behalf of the American Petroleum Institute, Dr. Julie Goodman criticized the ISA for upgrading its causality determinations, particularly on the relationship between ozone and all-cause (non-accidental) mortality (“likely to be causal”). Dr. Goodman said the ISA lacked information on study selection criteria and the weighing of evidence. Dr. Goodman also said the impact of exposure measurement error on the results of epidemiology studies and the determination of a threshold must be considered. Dr. Goodman’s written comments may be found posted at the URL above.

Dr. Samet walked the Panel through the draft letter to the Administrator. Clarifying edits were discussed in reference to language on the characterization of temporal and spatial variability of ozone concentrations. Panelists agreed that the letter should call for transparency on when the search for new evidence is discontinued. In charge question 2, panelists decided to describe some of the paragraphs as “additional considerations” relevant to evidence interpretation and methodology. Panelists tightened the language in charge question 6 calling for better linkages between the discussion of modes of action and the corresponding effects in the effects chapter. With respect to charge question 8, panelists discussed whether the ISA’s conclusion for all-cause mortality should embody the positive association found between ozone and respiratory mortality, a component of all-cause mortality. In response to charge question 9, panelists discussed Dr. Samet’s memo on susceptibility and vulnerability (posted at the above URL) and the recent use of a large umbrella term “susceptibility” to encompass both individual- and population-level characteristics that operate through a variety of pathways.

In concluding the meeting, Dr. Samet said he would revise the draft letter in response to the Panel’s discussion on susceptibility as well as all-cause mortality. Dr. Stallworth noted that most of the other edits discussed during the call had already been made. Once Dr. Samet had made further revisions, a revised draft letter would be circulated to the Panel for their final concurrence within two weeks.

Respectfully Submitted:

Holly Stallworth, Ph.D. /s/
Designated Federal Officer

Certified as True:

Jonathan Samet, M.D., M.S. /s/
Chair

NOTE AND DISCLAIMER: The minutes of this public meeting reflect diverse ideas and suggestions offered by Committee member during the course of deliberations within the meeting. Such ideas, suggestions and deliberations do not necessarily reflect consensus advice from the panel members. The reader is cautioned to not rely on the minutes to represent final, approved, consensus advice and recommendations offered to the Agency. Such advice and recommendations may be found in the final advisories, commentaries, letters or reports prepared and transmitted to the EPA Administrator following the public meetings.