

**Summary Minutes of the
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee (CASAC)
Public Teleconference
June 17, 2009
9:00 am – 11:00 am, Eastern Time**

CASAC Members: Dr. Jon Samet, Chair
Dr. James Crapo
Dr. Donna Kenski
Dr. Ellis Cowling
Dr. Ted Russell
Dr. Christopher Frey
Dr. Joe Brain
Dr. Russ Dickerson (CASAC Carbon Monoxide Review
Panel member)

Purpose: CASAC approved the draft letter to the Administrator regarding its peer review of EPA's *Integrated Science Assessment for Carbon Dioxide (March 2009)*

Designated
Federal Officer: Dr. Holly Stallworth, Designated Federal Officer

Other EPA Staff: John Vandenberg, Ellen Rubin, Ines Pagan, Tom Long, Beth Owens, Jason Sacks, Mary Ross, Steve Dutton, Jan Richmond Bryan, Connie Meacham

Public: The following individuals requested the dial-in number:
Jacqueline Smith, PhD, Harris County PHES
Sharan Campleman PhD, Electric Power Research Institute
Dona deLeon, no affiliation given
Gregg Recer, New York State Department of Health

Webpage: The meeting agenda, draft letter on the *Carbon Monoxide (CO) Integrated Science Assessment (ISA)* and other material may be found at:
<http://yosemite.epa.gov/sab/sabproduct.nsf/bf498bd32a1c7fdf85257242006dd6cb/a802ecb57c090508852575b600678016!OpenDocument&Date=2009-06-17>.

Meeting Summary

The discussion followed the issues and general timing as presented in the meeting agenda.

Wednesday, June 17, 2009

Opening of Public Meeting

Dr. Stallworth convened the meeting and explained that CASAC operates under the Federal Advisory Committee Act. Dr. Samet reviewed the agenda and turned the floor over to Dr. Brain who chaired the CASAC Carbon Monoxide Review Panel. Dr. Brain expressed his appreciation for the Panel's work. Dr. John Vandenberg of EPA's National Center for Environmental Assessment (NCEA) also thanked the Panel. Dr. Vandenberg had no requests for clarification on any of the language in the draft letter on the *Carbon Monoxide Integrated Science Assessment* (March 2009).

Dr. Samet walked the members through the draft letter on the CO ISA. The members generally agreed that the letter should emphasize the need to clarify the relative contribution of clinical studies versus epidemiological studies and call for a more comprehensive and transparent strategy. Dr. Dickerson of the Panel explained how CO plays a role in the composition of the atmosphere on a global scale that affects climate. He also explained that although U.S. levels of CO are dropping, global levels are rising due to increased emissions in developing countries. Dr. Dickerson expressed the Panel's consensus view that the ISA should highlight the importance of global levels of CO. One member noted that this discussion on global CO levels (and CASAC's comments in the draft letter) pertained to the charge question #3 inasmuch it asked about "policy-relevant background CO."

One topic of discussion was the declining sensitivity of epidemiological studies in the face of declining CO levels in the U.S. Members also discussed the need for using the available monitoring and micro-environmental data to assess the likely distribution of CO concentrations and whether any linkages could be made to resulting changes in COHb (CO bound to hemoglobin), particularly at the upper tail of the distribution.

Members noted that the current ambient monitoring network is not well designed to characterize spatial and temporal variability in ambient concentrations, rendering it inadequate for detailed assessments of human exposure. As captured in the draft letter, members pointed out that reliance on EPA's fixed monitoring network CO measurements may underestimate CO exposures for specific vulnerable populations such as individuals residing near heavily trafficked roads and who commute to work on a daily basis. Also captured in the draft letter was the members' view that central-site monitor concentrations are the best available data, while limited for gauging the ambient component of personal CO exposure.

In closing the meeting, Dr. Samet asked for and received approval of the draft letter, with the minor edits discussed on the call.

On Behalf of the Committee,
Respectfully Submitted,

Holly Stallworth, Ph.D. /s/
Designated Federal Officer

Certified as True:

Jonathan Samet, M.D. /s/
Chair, Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee
Sulfur Oxides Primary NAAQS Review Panel

NOTE AND DISCLAIMER: The minutes of this public meeting reflect diverse ideas and suggestions offered by committee members during the course of deliberations within the meeting. Such ideas, suggestions, and deliberations do not necessarily reflect definitive consensus advice from the panel members. The reader is cautioned to not rely on the minutes represent final, approved, consensus advice and recommendations offered to the Agency. Such advice and recommendations may be found in the final advisories, commentaries, letters, or reports prepared and transmitted to the EPA Administrator following the public meetings.