

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Science Advisory Board
Scientific and Technological Achievement Awards Panel
Final Minutes of Closed Meeting August 21-23, 2006

Committee: Scientific and Technological Achievement Awards (STAA) Panel of the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency's Science Advisory Board (SAB). (See attached Roster)

Date and Time: August 21-23, 2006 (See attached Federal Register Notice)

Location: Science Advisory Board, 3rd Floor Conference Room, 1025 F. Street, NW., Washington, DC.

Purpose: The purpose of the meeting was to allow the Committee to review papers nominated for the EPA's Scientific and Technological Achievement Awards and to discuss possible improvements to the process and program.

Materials Available: The agenda, roster, the papers to be reviewed, the nominating forms for those papers, and the nomination and review criteria, were circulated in advance of the meeting. The Committee Members had access to reports of previous years and Agency responses via the SAB website (www.epa.gov/sab) and hard copies were also available for review. A table summarizing the preliminary individual ratings of the papers was completed and shared at the face-to-face meeting as were tables summarizing the preliminary consensus scores and a summary table of awards by category.

Attendees: All Committee Members were present for the meeting. The attached roster identifies the Members and their institutions of employment.

Summary

There were no significant departures in timing from the agenda. The Committee's ultimate recommendations will be found in its final report.

Before the meeting, Committee Members read papers and reported their recommendations to the DFO who entered this information into a master table. (Later, the Committee Members provided the DFO with their individual personal notes from their reviews for the FACA files.)

At the start of the meeting, the Committee: entered the ratings for those papers reviewed but not reported earlier, assigned readers to those few papers that did not have at least two readers, and identified those papers where all the individual reviewers were agreed that the paper did not deserve an award. If any Committee Member wished to

challenge the preliminary assignment of those papers to a rating of “NR” (not recommended) they had the opportunity to do so.

The Committee then began discussing the other papers to reach consensus, a process which took the better part of two days.

After the Committee Members finished their preliminary consensus rankings of all papers, they compared their preliminary scores with the final scores of the previous year’s, between categories of this year’s papers. This was part of a discussion so that the Committee could be comfortable that it had “calibrated” its preliminary recommendations correctly. The Committee considered papers which had been flagged for further discussion when the Committee first considered them and any others which the Committee Members wished to reconsider.

The Committee agreed that of the 94 nominations, 45 were worthy of awards and another 26 deserving honorable mention. Of the papers recommended for awards, five were recommended for the highest award -- Level I, eleven for Level II awards, and twenty-nine for Level III awards. Also to be noted, there were three instances wherein the Committee grouped papers together to receive Level III awards. This action was based on recognizing the significance of the body of work as a whole.

The Committee identified comments it wished to make to the Agency in the final report accompanying its recommendations.

After Dr. Theis thanked the members for their efforts, the DFO adjourned the meeting.

Respectfully Submitted:

Certified as True:

_____/S/_____
Ms. Vivian Turner
Designated Federal Official
Scientific and Technological
Achievement Award Committee (STAA)

_____/S/_____
Dr. Thomas Theis, Chair

Dated March 12, 2007

Attachments

1. Agenda for the meeting
2. Committee roster
3. Federal Register Notices

STAA 2006 Committee Meeting (Closed to Public)

Agenda

Monday-Wednesday, August 21-23, 2006

Woodies Building

1025 F Street, NW, Suite 3700

Washington, DC

Phone: 202-343-9999 (SAB's main #)

Prior to Starting	Collection of any ratings not previously submitted. Completion of summary table. Copying	Ms. Vivian Turner, <i>DFO for STAA SAB Staff Office</i>
9:00 am	Convene the Meeting and Opening Remarks	<i>STAA DFO</i>
	Welcome	Dr. Vanessa Vu, <i>Director, SAB Staff Office</i>
	Introduction of Advisory Members	Dr. Thomas Theis, <i>Chair and Panel Members</i>
	Review of the Agenda Confirmation/Correction of Ranking Tables	Dr. Thomas Theis, <i>Chair STAA Committee Members</i>
	Initial Screening of Nominations into two Groups <ul style="list-style-type: none">- Recommended for Awards- Not Recommended for Awards Re-categorize Nominations as Appropriate Determine if Additional Reviews are Needed Screening of "Recommended Nominations" into Categories (I, II, III or Honorable Mention)	
12 noon to 1:00 pm	Lunch	
1:00 pm	Continue Screening of "Recommended Nominations" into Categories (I, II, III or Honorable Mention)	
	Screen "Not Recommended Nominations" to be sure none should be in the "Recommended Nominations" Group	
4:00pm	Additional Reading Assignments followed by Reading Time	

5:30 pm Adjourn for the Day

Ms. Turner, *DFO*

Tuesday, August 22, 2006

9:00 am Continue Screening of "Recommended Nominations" into
Categories (I, II, III or Honorable Mention)

10:30 General Discussion/Improving the Process

11:45 Identification of Main Process Points for Letter
Chair

12:00 Lunch

1:15 Continuation of previous Discussion/Screening

3:00 Additional Reading Assignments followed by Reading Time

5:00 Adjourn for the Day

Wednesday, August 23, 2006

9:00 am Reading Period
Draft Text of Process Portion of Letter Available

9:30 Panel Review of Process Portion of Letter

10:00 Last run-through of Recommendations for awards
Report Preparation

11:30 Lunch

1:00 pm Committee Review of Report for Approval of Content
and Final Language

3:00 DFO Adjourns the Meeting

**U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Science Advisory Board
Scientific and Technological Achievement Awards Committee**

CHAIR

Dr. Thomas L. Theis, University of Illinois at Chicago, Chicago, IL

MEMBERS

Dr. G. Allen Burton, Wright State University, Dayton, OH

Dr. James Bus, The Dow Chemical Company, Midland, MI

Dr. Stanley B. Grant, University of California, Irvine, Irvine, CA

Dr. Dale Hattis, Clark University, Worcester, MA

Dr. Byung Kim, Ford Motor Company, Dearborn, MI

Dr. Michael T. Kleinman, University of California, Irvine, Irvine, CA

Dr. Joseph Landolph, University of Southern California, Los Angeles, CA

Dr. Igor Linkov, INTERTOX, Inc., Brookline, MA

Dr. Randy Maddalena, Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory, Berkeley, CA

Dr. Paulette Middleton, Panorama Pathways, Boulder, CO

Dr. Michael C. Newman, College of William & Mary, Gloucester Point, VA

Dr. Barbara Zielinska, Desert Research Institute, Reno, NV

SCIENCE ADVISORY BOARD STAFF

Ms. Vivian Turner, Designated Federal Officer, 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
1400F, Washington, DC, Phone: 202-343-9697, Fax: 202-233-0643,
(turner.vivian@epa.gov)

Notification of an Upcoming Closed Meeting of the Science Advisory Board's Scientific and Technological Achievement Awards Committee--Closed Meeting

[Federal Register: July 31, 2006 (Volume 71, Number 146)]
[Notices]
[Page 43150]
From the Federal Register Online via GPO Access [wais.access.gpo.gov]
[DOCID:fr31jy06-66]

=====

ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY
[FRL-8204-3]
Science Advisory Board Staff Office

Notification of an Upcoming Closed Meeting of the Science
Advisory Board's Scientific and Technological Achievement Awards
Committee--Closed Meeting

AGENCY: Environmental Protection Agency (EPA).
ACTION: Notice.

SUMMARY: The U.S. Environmental Protection Agency's (EPA), Science
Advisory Board (SAB) Staff Office announces a closed meeting of the
SAB's Scientific and Technological Achievement Awards Committee to
recommend to the Administrator the recipients of the Agency's 2006
Scientific and Technological Achievement Awards.

DATES: August 21-23, 2006.

ADDRESSES: This closed meeting will take place at the U.S.
Environmental Protection Agency (EPA), Washington, DC.

FOR FURTHER INFORMATION CONTACT: Members of the public who wish to
obtain further information regarding this announcement may contact Ms.
Vivian Turner, Designated Federal Officer, by telephone: (202) 343-9697
or e-mail at: turner.vivian@epa.gov.

The SAB mailing address is: U.S. EPA Science Advisory Board
(1400F), U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, 1200 Pennsylvania
Avenue, NW., Washington, DC 20460. General information about the SAB as
well as any updates concerning the meeting announced in this notice,
may be found in the SAB Web site at:

http://www.epa.gov/sab/panels/staa_rev_panel_fy2006-fy2009.htm.

SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION: Pursuant to Section 10(d) of the Federal
Advisory Committee Act (FACA), 5 U.S.C. App. 2, and section (c)(6)
of the Government in the Sunshine Act, 5 U.S.C. 552b(c)(6), EPA has
determined that the meeting will be closed to the public. The purpose

of the meeting is for the SAB to recommend to the Administrator the recipients of the Agency's 2006 Scientific and Technological Achievement Awards. These awards are established to honor and recognize EPA employees who have made outstanding contributions in the advancement of science and technology through their research and development activities, as exhibited by publication of their results in peer reviewed journals. This meeting is closed to the public because it is concerned with selecting which employees are deserving of awards, a personnel matter with privacy concerns, which is exempt from public disclosure pursuant to section 10(d) of the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA), 5 U.S.C. App. 2, and section (c)(6) of the Government in the Sunshine Act, 5 U.S.C. 552b(c)(6). In accordance with the provisions of the Federal Advisory Committee Act, minutes of the meeting will be kept for Agency and Congressional review.

Dated: July 25, 2006.
Stephen L. Johnson,
Administrator.
[FR Doc. E6-12214 Filed 7-28-06; 8:45 am]
BILLING CODE 6560-50-P