

Minutes of the Closed Meeting on July 23-24, 2012

**U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA)
Science Advisory Board (SAB)
Scientific and Technological Achievement Awards Committee (STAA)**

Date and Time: Monday, July 23, 2012, 8:00 A.M. – 6:00 P.M. ET, and Tuesday, July 24, 2012, 8:00 A.M. – 2:30 P.M. ET

Location: Fourth Floor Conference Center North (N-4830), EPA Potomac Yard Conference Center, South Building, 2777 S. Crystal Drive Arlington, VA 22202, and via Teleconference.

Purpose: The purpose of the July 23-24, 2012 closed meeting was for the SAB Scientific and Technological Achievement Awards (STAA) Committee to review scientific publications nominated by EPA managers and make recommendations to the Administrator for STAA awards, and to discuss possible improvements to the process and program.

Participants:

STAA: SAB STAA Committee (See Roster, Attachment A):

Dr. George Daston, Chair
*Dr. Gregory Biddinger
Dr. Jerry Campbell
Dr. Peter Chapman
Dr. Judith Chow
Dr. James R. Clark
Dr. John Giesy
Dr. Philip K. Hopke
Dr. Arpad Horvath
*Dr. Wayne Landis
Dr. Timothy Larson
Dr. Cindy M. Lee
Dr. Michael I. Luster
*Dr. James Mihelcic
Dr. Fred J. Miller
Dr. Eileen Murphy
Dr. Kenneth Portier
Dr. Jay Turner
*Dr. Thomas Young
Dr. Yousheng Zeng

*Participated via teleconference

EPA SAB Staff: Mr. Edward Hanlon, Designated Federal Officer
Dr. Vanessa Vu, Director, EPA Science Advisory
Board Staff Office

Meeting Summary

The meeting was announced in the Federal Register¹. A summary of the meeting follows.

EPA's Office of Research and Development (ORD) submitted a total of 106 nominations comprised of 160 publications in 14 science and technology categories for review by the SAB STAA Committee for the 2012 STAA awards.

The fourteen topical categories and total number of nominations per category that were submitted to the Committee for review were: \

- Control Systems and Technology - 2
- Ecological Research - 24
- Energy and the Environment - 1
- Environmental Policy and Decisionmaking Studies - 6
- Health Effects Research and Human Health Risk Assessment - 16
- Homeland Security - 2
- Industry and the Environment - 3
- Integrated Risk Assessment - 3^a
- Monitoring and Measurement Methods - 13^b
- Other Environmental Research - 6
- Review Articles - 9
- Risk Management and Ecosystem Restoration - 1
- Sustainability and Innovation - 4
- Transport and Fate - 16

^a One nomination submitted a news article for award. The SAB excluded this nomination because it did not meet the eligibility requirements for peer review (i.e., it was not published in a peer reviewed journal or as a peer reviewed book chapter).

^b One nomination submitted ten publications for award. The SAB excluded this nomination because it did not meet the eligibility requirements for multiple publications within a single nomination (i.e., the STAA program limits each nomination to three publications).

In the weeks prior to the meeting, Committee Members reviewed the nominations and reported their initial recommendations to the Designated Federal Officer (DFO) who entered this information into a master table.

July 23, 2012

Opening Statements and Welcome

Mr. Ed Hanlon, the DFO, opened the meeting, and made a brief opening statement noting that the STAA is a Federal Advisory Committee under the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA). He noted the meeting and teleconference was closed to the public because it was concerned with selecting which employees are deserving of awards, a personnel matter with privacy concerns, which is exempt from public disclosure pursuant to section 10(d) of FACA and section (c)(6) of the Government in the Sunshine Act. He noted that the SAB Staff Office had assessed whether there were any conflict-of-interest or appearance of a lack of impartiality issues for any of the STAA committee members for this review. He noted that the SAB Staff Office recused some members from the review of certain 2012 STAA nomination packages upon review of the submitted ethics information. Mr. Hanlon also noted that minutes were being taken to summarize discussions and action items in accordance with requirements under FACA. Dr. Vanessa Vu also welcomed everyone for their attendance and participation. Mr. Hanlon then turned the meeting over to the Chair, Dr. George Daston.

Dr. Daston welcomed everyone and noted this was a new STAA Committee, with several members who served recently on the prior STAA Committee. He also noted this was an Advisory effort where an SAB report seeking consensus would be prepared by the Committee, reviewed by the chartered SAB, and sent to the EPA Administrator.

The Committee then discussed each nomination. Each nomination was assigned to at least two Committee members for review, and the principal reviewers started the discussion on each nomination followed by full Committee deliberation. The Committee decided whether it agreed on a preliminary final ranking for each nomination. In instances where there was a significant difference between recommendations for award, the nomination was slated for additional review by a third Committee member and reserved for later discussion by the Committee members. The Committee's preliminary final rankings for each nomination were recorded.

July 24, 2012

The Committee continued discussion on each nomination and the Committee's preliminary final rankings for each nomination were recorded, until all nominations were discussed. After the Committee developed preliminary final rankings for all nominations, the Committee considered nominations which had been flagged for further discussion and a few other nominations which the Committee Members wished to reconsider. The Committee then reviewed each nomination to make sure there were no clerical errors, and compared the preliminary final rankings with recommendations from the previous several years of STAA awards to provide a level of comfort that the Committee had "calibrated" its initial recommendations correctly.

The Committee then agreed upon the final recommendations for awards. The Committee recommended 43 nominations for 2012 STAA monetary awards and another 36 for honorable mention. Of the works recommended for monetary awards, 4 were recommended for Level I, 10 for Level II, and 29 for Level III.

The Committee then discussed and identified several administrative improvements to certain aspects of the STAA nomination process that would be documented in the final SAB Report to the Administrator.

Dr. Vu and Dr. Daston thanked the STAA Committee members for their efforts. With the meeting business concluded, the Designated Federal Officer Ed Hanlon adjourned the meeting at 2:30 pm ET.

Respectfully Submitted:

/signed/

Mr. Edward Hanlon
Designated Federal Officer
Scientific and Technological
Achievement Award Committee

Certified as Accurate:

/signed/

Dr. George Daston, Chair

NOTE AND DISCLAIMER: The minutes of this closed meeting reflect diverse ideas and suggestions offered by Committee members during the course of deliberations within the meeting. Such ideas, suggestions and deliberations do not necessarily reflect consensus advice from the Committee members. The reader is cautioned to not rely on the minutes to represent final, approved, consensus advice and recommendations offered to the Agency. Such advice and recommendations may be found in the final advisories, commentaries, letters or reports prepared and transmitted to the EPA Administrator following the meeting.

Attachments:

- A. 2012 SAB STAA Committee Roster

Materials Cited

The following meeting materials are available on the SAB website:

<http://www.epa.gov/sab>, at the July 23-24, 2012 meeting website:

<http://yosemite.epa.gov/sab/sabproduct.nsf/a84bfee16cc358ad85256ccd006b0b4b/9fafb9c068953346852579f300452193!OpenDocument&Date=2012-07-23>:

¹ Federal Register Notice announcing the meeting.

ATTACHMENT A – ROSTER

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Science Advisory Board SAB 2012 Scientific and Technological Achievement Awards Committee (STAA)

CHAIR

Dr. George Daston, Victor Mills Society Research Fellow, Proctor & Gamble Company, Cincinnati, OH

MEMBERS

Dr. Gregory Biddinger, Managing Director, Natural Land Management, Inc., Houston, TX

Dr. Jerry Campbell, Scientist and Associate Director of the Center for Human Health Assessment, Institute for Chemical Safety Sciences, The Hamner Institutes for Health Science, Research Triangle Park, NC

Dr. Peter Chapman, Principal and Senior Environmental Scientist, Golder Associates Ltd., Burnaby, British Columbia, Canada

Dr. Judith Chow, Nazir and Mary Ansari Chair in Science and Entrepreneurialism, and Research Professor, Division of Atmospheric Sciences, Desert Research Institute, Reno, Nevada

Dr. James R. Clark, Independent Consultant, Edmonds, WA

Dr. John Giesy, Professor and Canada Research Chair in Environmental Toxicology, Department of Veterinary Biomedical Sciences and Toxicology Centre, University of Saskatchewan, Saskatchewan, Canada

Dr. Philip K. Hopke, Bayard D. Clarkson Distinguished Professor, Director of the Center for Air Resources Engineering and Science, and Director of the Institute for a Sustainable Environment, Clarkson University, Potsdam, NY

Dr. Arpad Horvath, Professor, Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering, University of California, Berkeley, Berkeley, CA

Dr. Wayne Landis, Professor and Director, Institute of Environmental Toxicology, Huxley College of the Environment, Western Washington University, Bellingham, WA

Dr. Timothy Larson, Professor of Civil and Environmental Engineering and Professor of Environmental and Occupational Health Sciences, University of Washington, Seattle, WA

Dr. Cindy M. Lee, Professor, Department of Environmental Engineering and Earth Sciences, Clemson University, Anderson, SC

Dr. Michael I. Luster, Professor, Department of Community Medicine, School of Medicine, West Virginia University, Morgantown, WV

Dr. James Mihelcic, Professor of Civil and Environmental Engineering, University of South Florida, Tampa, FL

Dr. Fred J. Miller, Independent Consultant, Fred J. Miller and Associates LLC, Cary, NC

Dr. Eileen Murphy, Director of Research and Grants, Ernest Mario School of Pharmacy, Rutgers University, Piscataway, NJ

Dr. Kenneth Portier, Managing Director, Statistics and Evaluation Center, American Cancer Society, Atlanta, GA

Dr. Jay Turner, Associate Professor, Department of Energy, Environmental and Chemical Engineering, Washington University, St. Louis, MO

Dr. Thomas Young, Professor, Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering, University of California, Davis, Davis, CA

Dr. Yousheng Zeng, Managing Partner, Providence Engineering & Environmental Group LLC, Baton Rouge, LA

SCIENCE ADVISORY BOARD STAFF

Mr. Edward Hanlon, Designated Federal Officer, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Science Advisory Board Staff, Washington, DC