

Summary Minutes of the
Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee
Particulate Matter Review Panel
Public Teleconference
May 7, 2009

Committee Members:

Dr. Jonathan Samet, Chair
Dr. Lowell Ashbaugh
Professor Ed Avol
Dr. Joseph Brain
Dr. Wayne Cascio
Dr. Ellis Cowling
Dr. James Crapo
Dr. Christopher Frey
Dr. Joseph Helble
Dr. Philip Hopke
Dr. Rogene Henderson
Dr. Donna Kenski
Dr. William Malm
Dr. Tom Moore
Dr. Robert Phalen
Dr. Kent Pinkerton
Mr. Richard Poirot
Dr. Ted Russell
Dr. Frank Speizer
Dr. Helen Suh
Dr. Sverre Vedal

Date and Time:

May 7, 2009: 11:00 am – 2:00 pm Eastern time

Purpose:

The Clean Air Scientific Committee Review Panel (CASAC) reviewed its draft letters on the *Integrated Science Assessment for Particulate Matter* (ISA, First External Review Draft, December 2008) and two planning documents: *Particulate Matter National Ambient Air Quality Standards: Scope and Methods Plan for Health Risk and Exposure Assessment* and *Particulate Matter National Ambient Air Quality Standards: Scope and Methods Plan for Urban Visibility Impact Assessment*.

SAB Staff:

Dr. Holly Stallworth, Designated Federal Officer

EPA Staff:

Lindsay Stanek, Doug Johns, Tim Hanley, John Vanderberg, Joann Rice, Beth Hassett-Sipple, Lydia

Wegman, James Hemby, Karen Martin, Perdee Rogin,
Mark Pitchford, Mark Schmitt, Tom Long

Other:

Phil Wakelyn, National Cotton Council*
Heidi King, Office of Management and Budget*
Kelli M. Brown, American Trucking Association*
Stephen L. Goldman, Caterpillar*
Deborah Shprentz, American Lung Association*
Doug Austin, Ozone Transport Commission*
Scott DiBiase, Pinal County (Arizona) Air Quality) *
Deborah L. King, Regulatory Group Legal Services*
Deborah M. Drechsler, California Air Resources Board*
Patricia Fritz, New York State Department of Health*
Wig Zamore, Mystic View Task Force*
Lucinda Langworthy, Hunton & Williams LLP*
Kurt E. Blasé, Counsel for the Coarse PM Coalition
Management*
Jenny Johnson, Clean Air Report*
David W. Heinold, AECOM Environment*
Leisha Bell, Aircraft Owners and Pilots Association
Julie Goodman, Gradient
W. Ollison, American Petroleum Institute (API)
Andrew Childers, Daily Environment Report
Annette Rohr, Electric Power Research Institute
Dennis Ransel, Clark County (NV) Department of Air
Quality & Environmental Management John Koswan,
Clark County (NV) Department of Air Quality &
Environmental Management
Russell Merle Jr., Clark County (NV) Department of Air
Quality & Environmental Management
Jean-Paul Huys, Clark County (NV) Department of Air
Quality & Environmental Management
Russell S. Merle, Clark County (NV) Department of Air
Quality & Environmental Management

Meeting Materials:

The meeting agenda, draft letters to the Administrator and
public comments may be found posted at:
<http://yosemite.epa.gov/sab/sabproduct.nsf/bf498bd32a1c7fd85257242006dd6cb/9993356334d54f84852575930051be8d!OpenDocument&Date=2009-05-07>

* / These people requested the phone number for the teleconference but did not announce themselves on the phone.

Meeting Summary

The discussion followed the issues and general timing as presented in the meeting agenda posted at the URL above.

THURSDAY, MAY 7, 2009

Opening of Public Meeting

Dr. Holly Stallworth, Designated Federal Officer (DFO), opened the meeting with a statement that the CASAC Particulate Matter Review Panel is a federal advisory committee whose meetings and deliberations meet the requirements of the Federal Advisory Committee Act.

Dr. Samet reviewed the agenda and purpose of the meeting. Dr. John Vandenberg of EPA's National Center for Environmental Assessment (NCEA) thanked the Panel for their comments. Dr. Julie Goodman, on behalf of the American Petroleum Institute, presented public comments that emphasized the heterogeneity of the population and possible exposure misclassification as factors that heightened uncertainty about the concentration response function for particulate matter (PM).

Dr. Samet led the Panel through the draft letter on the PM Integrated Science Assessment (ISA). Panelists discussed the need to more fully integrate the body of evidence related to PM size and composition for both health and welfare outcomes throughout the document. In terms of ecological effects of PM, panelists discussed the need to expand the ISA to focus on more sensitive receptors (rather than more tolerant species). Panelists noted that to the degree EPA can identify gaps in species specific data, the ISA can provide useful guidance for future research. Panelists expressed a desire to see EPA highlight the evidence leading to the assignment of classifications regarding the strength of evidence within the five-level hierarchy. Accordingly, edits to the draft letter were suggested to incorporate these points.

In discussing the CASAC's draft letter on EPA's *Particulate Matter National Ambient Air Quality Standards: Scope and Methods Plan for Health Risk and Exposure Assessment*, representatives from the Office of Air Quality Standards and Planning (OAQPS) clarified that the Scope and Methods Plans were based on the ISA as published in December of 2008, not an earlier draft. The CASAC Panel agreed that the letter should state that EPA should provide a transparent algorithm for selecting endpoints based on the level of certainty and the relevant attributable risk. Accordingly, edits to the draft letter were made to incorporate these and other (minor) points.

In the discussion of CASAC's draft letter on EPA's *Particulate Matter National Ambient Air Quality Standards: Scope and Methods Plan for Urban Visibility Impact Assessment*, the CASAC Panel decided to rephrase the second paragraph so that CASAC suggests EPA *consider* (rather than implement) ways of developing and implementing a visibility

monitoring approach. Likewise, it was agreed the letter should say that EPA should *consider* network design and operation plans to use direct measurement of visibility.

In closing the meeting, Dr. Stallworth pledged to make edits to the draft letters to reflect the discussion in the teleconference then transmit the files to Dr. Samet for final review, editing and approval.

Respectfully Submitted:

Holly Stallworth, Ph.D. /s/
Designated Federal Officer

Certified as True:

Jonathan Samet, M.D., M.S. /s/
Chair

NOTE AND DISCLAIMER: The minutes of this public meeting reflect diverse ideas and suggestions offered by Committee member during the course of deliberations within the meeting. Such ideas, suggestions and deliberations do not necessarily reflect consensus advice from the panel members. The reader is cautioned to not rely on the minutes to represent final, approved, consensus advice and recommendations offered to the Agency. Such advice and recommendations may be found in the final advisories, commentaries, letters or reports prepared and transmitted to the EPA Administrator following the public meetings.