

**Summary Minutes of the
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee (CASAC)
Public Teleconference
April 19, 2010
10:00 am – 1:00 pm, Eastern Time**

CASAC Members: Dr. Jonathan Samet, Chair
Dr. Ted Russell
Dr. Christopher Frey
Dr. Joe Brain
Dr. Donna Kenski

CASAC Carbon Monoxide
Review Panel: Dr. Paul Roberts
Dr. Tom Dahms
Dr. Michael Kleinman
Dr. Joel Kaufman

Purpose: To review the draft letters on the *Risk and Exposure Assessment for the Review of the Carbon Monoxide Primary National Ambient Air Quality Standards* (Feb 2010) and the *Policy Assessment for the Review of the Carbon Monoxide National Ambient Air Quality Standards* (Mar 2010).

Designated
Federal Officer: Dr. Holly Stallworth, Designated Federal Officer

Other EPA Staff:
Public: Kyndall Barry, Ines Pagan, Tom Long

Requests for
Phone Number: Todd Russellburg, Siemens Energy, Inc.*
Molly Davis, Inside Washington Publishers*
Steve Gouze, California Air Resources Board*

Webpage: The meeting agenda and the draft CASAC letters may be found at the following URL:

<http://yosemite.epa.gov/sab/sabproduct.nsf/bf498bd32a1c7fdf85257242006dd6cb/481afe8d72f8bf8f852576cf0051e288!OpenDocument&Date=2010-04-19>

* These individual requested the phone number but did not announce themselves on the phone.

MONDAY, APRIL 19, 2010

Meeting Summary:

The discussion followed the plan presented in the meeting agenda.

Dr. Stallworth convened the meeting and explained that CASAC operates under the Federal Advisory Committee Act. Dr. Samet reviewed the agenda and then asked Dr. Joseph Brain, Chair of the Carbon Monoxide Review Panel, to walk the Committee through the draft letter on the *Risk and Exposure Assessment for the Review of the Carbon Monoxide Primary National Ambient Air Quality Standards* (REA, Feb 2010).

After thanking the panel for its expertise and contribution to the Carbon Monoxide (CO) review, Dr. Brain described the CO review as particularly challenging in view of the fact that current ambient levels are well below the standard, a phenomena that makes the epidemiology particularly challenging. In fact, according to Dr. Brain, as ambient levels drop, the contribution of CO exposure to COHb is only a small increment to endogenous COHb. Dr. Brain expressed the panel's view that EPA rely on the more contemporary epidemiologic studies, particularly those directed at coronary artery disease and cardiovascular disease more generally. Also with respect to the REA letter, Dr. Brain spoke about the need for more sensitive and precise monitors to validate CO exposure models.

On charge question 1, one panelist requested that a sentence be deleted that singled out emissions uncertainty as the limiting factor for predicting CO exposure. On charge question 3, the Committee agreed to acknowledge that it might not be feasible to include SES and race among the demographic variables. The Committee also agreed to add a clause indicating that outdoor exposures near roadways might be underestimated.

With respect to the draft letter on the *Policy Assessment for the Review of the Carbon Monoxide National Ambient Air Quality Standards* (PA, Mar 2010), panelists discussed the overall length of the PA document and concluded that the CASAC should express a preference for shorter documents in general. On charge question 3, Dr. Brain agreed to rewrite the three sentences beginning with the statement that "the discussion of the epidemiological data only casts doubt on the role of COHb in the epidemiology studies" to clarify the issue of other non-hypoxia mechanisms.

On charge question 11, CASAC members agreed to delete the sentences referencing uncertainty in U.S. and global emissions inventories and the statement saying a concentration-based standard would be inappropriate. Dr. Frey pointed out there are already CO emissions standards in place. CASAC members agreed to delete the sentences in charge question 11 that refer to climate forcing and environmental benefits of reducing CO.

For both draft letters, CASAC members were in agreement with its substantive content. Committee members agreed that with the minor edits discussed in the teleconference (and

any other minor editing deemed necessary to improve clarity), these letters could be transmitted to the Administrator.

On Behalf of the Committee,
Respectfully Submitted,

Holly Stallworth, Ph.D. /s/
Designated Federal Officer

Certified as True:

Jonathan Samet, M.D. /s/
Chair, Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee
Sulfur Oxides Primary NAAQS Review Panel

NOTE AND DISCLAIMER: The minutes of this public meeting reflect diverse ideas and suggestions offered by committee members during the course of deliberations within the meeting. Such ideas, suggestions, and deliberations do not necessarily reflect definitive consensus advice from the panel members. The reader is cautioned to not rely on the minutes represent final, approved, consensus advice and recommendations offered to the Agency. Such advice and recommendations may be found in the final advisories, commentaries, letters, or reports prepared and transmitted to the EPA Administrator following the public meetings.