

**U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Science Advisory Board
Scientific and Technological Achievement Awards Committee**

Minutes of the Closed Meeting on August 17-19, 2009

Committee: Scientific and Technological Achievement Awards Panel (STAA) of the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency's Science Advisory Board (SAB). (See Roster, Attachment 2)

Date and Time: August 17-19, 2009 (See Federal Register Notice, Attachment 3)

Location: Science Advisory Board, 3rd Floor Conference Room, 1025 F. Street, NW, Washington, DC.

Purpose: The purpose of the meeting was to allow the Committee to review papers nominated for the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) Scientific and Technological Achievement Awards and to discuss possible improvements to the process and program.

Materials Available: The agenda, roster, discs containing copies of the papers to be reviewed, the nominating forms and associated documents for those papers, and the awards criteria were circulated to the Committee in advance of the meeting. The Committee Members had access to reports of previous years and Agency responses via the SAB Web Site (www.epa.gov/sab), and hard copies were also available at the meeting for review. A table summarizing the preliminary individual ratings of the most of the papers was provided to Committee members at beginning of the face-to-face meeting. Tables summarizing the preliminary consensus scores and a summary table of awards by category were provided to Committee members at beginning of the third day of the face-to-face meeting.

Attendees: With the exception of Dr. Ernest F. Benfield and Dr. Reid Lifset, all Committee Members were present for the meeting. Drs. Benfield and Lifset participated via telephone during a portion of the meeting that discussed the nominations that they reviewed. The attached roster identifies the Members and their institutions of employment. Dr. Vanessa Vu and Mr. Edward Hanlon of EPA's SAB Staff Office also attended the meeting.

Meeting Summary

There were no significant departures in timing from the agenda (see Attachment 1), other than that the meeting adjourned at 12:15 pm on August 19 and not at 1:00 pm as noted on the agenda. The Committee's ultimate recommendations will be found in its final report.

In the weeks prior to the meeting, Committee Members read papers associated with each nomination and reported their initial recommendations to the DFO who entered this information into a master table.

At the start of the closed meeting, the Committee, under the guidance of the Chair, discussed each paper and the reviewers' initial rankings were verbalized and recorded. Each nomination was assigned to at least two Members for review. In any instance where there was a significant difference between recommendations for award, the nomination received additional review by the Members. The total discussion time for all of the papers took the first two days, as the Committee reviewed and evaluated 111 nominations. The twelve topical categories were: Control Systems & Technology (CS), Ecological Research (ER), Energy and the Environment (EE), Health Effects Research and Human Health Risk Assessment (HE), Homeland Security, Industry and the Environment (IE), Integrated Risk Assessment (IR), Monitoring & Measurement Methods (MM), Review Articles (RA), Risk Management and Ecosystem Restoration (RM), Transport and Fate (TF), and Other Environmental Research (OR).

After the Committee Members finished their preliminary consensus rankings of all papers, they compared their preliminary scores, category by category, and also reviewed the final scores of the previous several years of STAA awards. This discussion allowed the Committee a level of comfort that it had "calibrated" its preliminary recommendations correctly. The Committee considered papers which had been flagged for further discussion when the Committee first considered them and any others which the Committee Members wished to reconsider.

In the case where conflicts or potential conflicts of interest existed, Committee members recused themselves from the review and discussion process. The following Committee members recused themselves from the review and discussion of nominations: Dr. John P. Giesy recused himself from participating in the review of four nominations; and Drs. Dale Hattis, Desmond F. Lawler and Fred Miller each recused themselves from participating in the review of one nomination.

The Committee recommended a total of fifty-six nominations for monetary awards and another twenty-five for honorable mention. Of the works recommended for monetary awards, three were recommended for Level I, twenty-two for Level II, and thirty-one for Level III.

The Committee identified comments it wished to make to the Agency in the final report accompanying its recommendations.

After Drs. Vu and Eighmy thanked the members for their efforts, the meeting was adjourned at 12:15 pm.

Respectfully Submitted:

Certified as True:

_____/S/_____
Mr. Edward Hanlon
Designated Federal Officer
Scientific and Technological
Achievement Award Committee

_____/S/_____
Dr. Taylor Eighmy, Chair

Dated January 21, 2010

Attachments:

1. Agenda for the August 17-19, 2009 STAA Meeting
2. 2009 SAB STAA Committee Roster
3. Federal Register Notice Announcing the August 17-19, 2009 STAA Meeting
4. E-mail from the Chair approving the Minutes for the August 17-19, 2009 STAA Meeting

Attachment 1: Agenda for the August 17-19, 2009 STAA Meeting

**U.S. ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY
SCIENCE ADVISORY BOARD
Scientific and Technological Awards (STAA) Committee
2009 STAA Meeting (Closed to Public)
August 17, 18 and 19, 2009
SAB Conference Center
1025 F Street, N.W., Suite 3705, Washington, D.C. 20004**

FINAL AGENDA

August 17, 2009

- 8:30 - 8:35 a.m. **Convene the Meeting and Opening Remarks**
Mr. Edward Hanlon, Designated Federal Officer
- 8:35 - 8:40 a.m. **Welcoming Remarks**
Dr. Vanessa Vu, Director, Science Advisory Board
- 8:40 - 9:15 a.m. **Introduction of Advisory Members, Purpose of the Meeting,
Review of Agenda, and Discussion on Procedures for Review of
Nominations**
Dr. Taylor Eighmy, Chair
- 9:15 a.m.–12:00 p.m. **Review Nominations for the Following Topic Headings
(excluding Nominations assigned to either Dr. Benfield, Dr.
Lifset or Dr. Smith):**
- **Risk Management and Ecosystem Restoration**
 - **Control Systems and Technology**
 - **Transport and Fate**
- Dr. Taylor Eighmy, Chair, and Committee Members
- Assigned Reviewers summarize and discuss initial rankings per nomination
 - Group agreement on ranking each Nomination into Award Categories (I, II, III or Honorable Mention) or recommendation for no award
- 12:00 – 1:15 p.m. **LUNCH**

August 17, 2009 (continued)

- 1:15 – 4:50 p.m. **Review Nominations for the Following Topic Headings (excluding Nominations assigned to either Dr. Benfield, Dr. Lifset or Dr. Smith):**
- **Transport and Fate (continued)**
 - **Monitoring and Measurement Methods**
 - **Other Environmental Research**
 - **Ecological Research**
 - **Integrated Risk Assessment**
- 4:50 – 5:00 p.m. **Summary of the Discussion**
Dr. Taylor Eighmy, Chair, and Committee Members
- 5:00 p.m. **Adjourn**

August 18, 2009

- 8:30 – 11:45 a.m. **Review Nominations for the Following Topic Headings (excluding Nominations assigned to either Dr. Benfield or Dr. Lifset):**
- **Energy and the Environment**
 - **Health Effects Research and Human Health Risk Assessment**
 - **Homeland Security**
 - **Industry and the Environment**
 - **Review Articles**
- 11:45a.m-1:00 p.m. **LUNCH**
- 1:00 – 3:30 p.m. **Review All Nominations Assigned to Dr. Benfield**
- 3:30 – 4:30 p.m. **Review All Nominations Assigned to Dr. Lifset**
- 4:30 – 4:50 p.m. **Review Remaining Nominations for Dr. Smith**
- 4:50 – 5:00 p.m. **Summary of the Discussion**
Dr. Taylor Eighmy, Chair, and Committee Members
- 5:00 p.m. **Adjourn**

August 19, 2009

8:30 – 10:00 a.m.

Discussion on Awards

Dr. Taylor Eighmy, Chair, and Committee Members

- Run-through recommendations for awards
- Adjust recommendations for awards as appropriate

10:00a.m.–12:00 p.m.

Committee Agreement on Final Awards

Dr. Taylor Eighmy, Chair, and Committee Members

12:00p.m.–1:00 p.m.

Discussion on 2010 Award Process

Dr. Taylor Eighmy, Chair, and Committee Members

1:00 p.m.

Adjourn

Edward Hanlon, DFO

Attachment 2: 2009 SAB STAA Committee Roster

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Science Advisory Board Scientific and Technological Achievement Awards (STAA) Committee

CHAIR

Dr. T. Taylor Eighmy, Vice President for Research, Office of the Vice President for Research, Texas Tech University, Lubbock, TX

MEMBERS

***Dr. Ernest F. Benfield**, Professor of Ecology, Department of Biological Sciences, Virginia Tech, Blacksburg, VA

Dr. James Bus, Director of External Technology, Toxicology and Environmental Research and Consulting, The Dow Chemical Company, Midland, MI

Dr. John P. Giesy, Professor and Canada Research Chair, Veterinary Biomedical Sciences and Toxicology Centre, University of Saskatchewan, Saskatoon, Saskatchewan, Canada; and Emeritus Distinguished Professor of Zoology, Michigan State University, East Lansing, Michigan

Dr. Cynthia Harris, Director and Professor, Institute of Public Health, Florida A&M University, Tallahassee, FL

Dr. Dale Hattis, Research Professor, Center for Technology, Environment, and Development, George Perkins Marsh Institute, Clark University, Worcester, MA

Dr. Michael T. Kleinman, Professor, Department of Medicine, Division of Occupational and Environmental Medicine, University of California, Irvine, Irvine, CA

Dr. Desmond F. Lawler, Bob R. Dorsey Professor of Engineering, Department of Civil, Architectural and Environmental Engineering, University of Texas, Austin, TX

***Dr. Reid Lifset**, Director, Industrial Environmental Management Program, School of Forestry and Environmental Studies, Yale University, New Haven, CT

Dr. Randy Maddalena, Scientist, Environmental Energy Technologies Division, Indoor Environment Department, Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory, Berkeley, CA

Dr. Paulette Middleton, President, Panorama Pathways, Boulder, CO

Dr. Frederick J. Miller, Independent Consultant, Cary, NC

Dr. John R. Smith, Division Manager, Environmental Science and Sustainable Technology, Alcoa Technical Center, Alcoa Inc., Alcoa Center, PA

Dr. Robert Twiss, Professor Emeritus, University of California-Berkeley, Ross, CA

Dr. Yousheng Zeng, Air Quality Services Director, Providence Engineering & Environmental Group LLC, Baton Rouge, LA

Dr. Barbara Zielinska, Research Professor, Division of Atmospheric Sciences, Desert Research Institute, Reno, NV

SCIENCE ADVISORY BOARD STAFF

Mr. Edward Hanlon, Designated Federal Officer, 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW 1400F, Washington, DC, Phone: 202-343-9946, Fax: 202-233-0643, (ed.hanlon@epa.gov)

*Unable to attend the August 17-19, 2009 meeting in person, participated by phone

**Attachment 3: Federal Register Notice Announcing the
August 17-19, 2009 STAA Meeting**

[Federal Register: June 16, 2009 (Volume 74, Number 114)]
[Notices]
[Page 28492]
From the Federal Register Online via GPO Access [wais.access.gpo.gov]

ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY
[FRL-8919-4]

Science Advisory Board Staff Office; Notification of an Upcoming Closed Meeting of the Science Advisory Board's Scientific and Technological Achievement Awards Committee

AGENCY: Environmental Protection Agency (EPA).

ACTION: Notice.

SUMMARY: The U.S. Environmental Protection Agency's (EPA) Science Advisory Board (SAB) Staff Office announces a closed meeting of the SAB's Scientific and Technological Achievement Awards (STAA) Committee to recommend to the Administrator the recipients of the Agency's 2009 Scientific and Technological Achievement Awards.

DATES: The meeting dates are Monday and Tuesday, August 17 and 18, 2009 from 9 a.m. to 5 p.m. (Eastern Standard Time), and Wednesday, August 19, 2009, from 8:30 a.m. to 1 p.m. (Eastern Standard Time).

ADDRESSES: The closed meeting will be held at the U.S. EPA Science Advisory Board Staff Office Conference Room, Third Floor, Suite 3700, 1025 F Street NW., Suite 3700, Washington, DC 20004.

FOR FURTHER INFORMATION CONTACT: Members of the public who wish to obtain further information regarding this announcement may contact Mr. Edward Hanlon, Designated Federal Officer, by telephone: (202) 343-9946 or e-mail at hanlon.edward@epa.gov. The SAB mailing address is: U.S. EPA Science Advisory Board (1400F), U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, 1200 Pennsylvania Ave, NW., Washington, DC 20460. General information about the SAB as well as any updates concerning the meeting announced in this notice may be found in the SAB Web site at <http://www.epa.gov/sab>.

SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION:

Summary: Pursuant to Section 10(d) of the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA), 5 U.S.C. App.2, and section (c)(6) of the Government in the Sunshine Act, 5 U.S.C. 552b(c)(6), EPA has determined that the meeting will be closed to the public. The purpose of the meeting is for the SAB to recommend to the Administrator the recipients of the Agency's 2009 Scientific and Technological Achievement Awards. These awards are established to honor and recognize EPA employees who have made outstanding contributions in the advancement of science and technology through their research and development activities, as exhibited in publication of their results in peer reviewed journals. This meeting is closed to the public because it is concerned with selecting which employees are deserving of awards, a personnel matter with privacy concerns, which is exempt from public disclosure pursuant to section 10(d) of the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA), 5 U.S.C. App.2, and section (c)(6) of the Government in the Sunshine Act, 5 U.S.C. 552b(c)(6). In accordance with the provisions of the Federal Advisory Committee Act, minutes of the meeting will be kept for Agency and Congressional review.

Dated: June 9, 2009.
Lisa P. Jackson,
Administrator.

Attachment 4: E-mail from the Chair approving the Minutes for the August 17-19, 2009 STAA Meeting

----- Forwarded by Edward Hanlon/DC/USEPA/US on 01/21/2010 03:33 PM -----
From: "Eighmy, Taylor" <taylor.eighmy@ttu.edu>
To: Edward Hanlon/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 01/21/2010 03:32 PM
Subject: Re: further updated draft minutes for 2009 STAA meeting

Looks good

On 1/21/10 2:01 PM, "Hanlon.Edward@epamail.epa.gov"

<Hanlon.Edward@epamail.epa.gov> wrote:

hi Taylor,

I made one slight change to the draft minutes. The minutes from previous years did not specify which papers were recused. I revised the minutes to simply note the members who recused themselves and number of nominations they recused themselves from review. I've got a separate memo to the file that provides details on which nominations they recused themselves on.....

Here's the revised draft. Look ok to finalize? thx
(See attached file: STAA 2009 Minutes-1-21-10 draft.doc)

Ed Hanlon
Designated Federal Officer
EPA Science Advisory Board Staff Office
202-343-9946 (phone/voice mail)
202-233-0643/0645 (fax)
hanlon.edward@epa.gov

Regular mail: USEPA Science Advisory Board (1400F), 1200 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W., Washington, D.C. 20460

Office location/Courier Address: USEPA Science Advisory Board, 1025 F Street, N.W., Room 3602, Washington, D.C. 20004