

**U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee (CASAC)
CASAC Lead Review Panel**

**Summary Meeting Minutes of the CASAC Lead Review Panel
Public Advisory Teleconference**

Tuesday, July 8, 2008 – 1:00 to 4:00 p.m. Eastern Time

SAB Staff Office, Washington DC

Advisory Meeting to Review and Approve CASAC's Draft Letter to the EPA Administrator Concerning EPA's Proposed Rule for the Revision of the National Ambient Air Quality Standard (NAAQS) for Lead (May 2008)

Panel Members: See CASAC Lead Review Panel Roster – Appendix A

Agenda: See Meeting Agenda – Appendix B

Purpose: The purpose of this public teleconference meeting was for the CASAC Lead Review Panel to publicly review and approve the draft letter to the EPA Administrator concerning EPA's proposed rule for the revision of the National Ambient Air Quality Standard (NAAQS) for Lead (May 1, 2008).

Attendees:

Chair:	Dr. Rogene Henderson
CASAC Members:	Dr. Ellis Cowling Dr. James Crapo Dr. Douglas Crawford-Brown Dr. Donna Kenski Dr. Jonathan Samet
Panel Members:	Dr. Joshua Cohen Dr. Deborah Cory-Slechta Dr. Bruce Fowler Dr. Andrew Friedland Mr. Sean Hays Dr. Frederick J. Miller Dr. Paul Mushak Mr. Richard Poirot Dr. Michael Rabinowitz Dr. Ian von Lindern
EPA SAB Staff:	Mr. Fred Butterfield, CASAC Designated Federal Officer (DFO)

Other EPA Staff: Dr. Tim Benner, ORD, OSP
 Dr. Michael Firestone, OA, OCHPEE
 Mr. James Hemby, OAR, OAQPS
 Dr. Ellen Kirrane, ORD, NCEA-RTP
 Dr. Deirdre Murphy, OAR, OAQPS
 Mr. David Orlin, OGC, ARLO
 Dr. Zachary Pekar, OAR, OAQPS
 Mr. Aaron Yeow, OSWER, SPB

Meeting Summary

The discussion followed the issues and general timing as presented in the meeting agenda (Appendix B).

Convene Meeting, Call Attendance, Introduction and Administration

Mr. Fred Butterfield, Designated Federal Officer (DFO) for the Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee, opened the teleconference meeting, called attendance, and welcomed all attendees. He noted the CASAC is a Federal Advisory Committee chartered under the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA) to provide advice and recommendations to the EPA Administrator. Consistent with FACA regulations, the deliberations of CASAC are held as public meetings and teleconferences for which advance notice is given in the *Federal Register*. The DFO is present at all such meetings to assure compliance with FACA requirements. He mentioned that there were no individuals who had signed-up in advance to provide an oral public statement today, but that an additional offer would be made at the start of the scheduled public comment period. Mr. Butterfield said a transcript of this teleconference is not being taken; however, summary minutes were taken (by the DFO) for this teleconference meeting. These minutes will be certified by the CASAC (and Lead Review Panel) Chair and posted on the CASAC page of the SAB Web Site (<http://www.epa.gov/casac/>) within 90 days after the meeting. Mr. Butterfield noted that all panelists had earlier submitted documentation with respect to possible financial conflicts-of-interest or appearances of a lack of impartiality, which was reviewed by the SAB staff prior to the teleconference meeting and found to be satisfactory.

Purpose of Meeting and Welcome

Dr. Rogene Henderson, CASAC and Lead Review Panel Chair, welcomed Panel members and briefly stated the purpose of the meeting (see above). The chair noted that all 22 active members of the Lead Panel had already concurred on the approval-draft letter that had been posted on the CASAC's page of the SAB web site prior to this teleconference.

Public Comment Period

(There were no public commenters during this teleconference.)

Summary of the CASAC Lead Review Panel's Discussion Concerning its Review and Approval of the Draft Letter to the Administrator Concerning EPA's Proposed Rule for the Lead NAAQS

The Chair inquired as to whether any Lead Panel members had additional comments or needed any additional discussions concerning the approval-draft letter. There were no comments made, and no additional deliberation was deemed necessary, with the exception that several CASAC and Panel members made brief, affirmative statements to the Chair about the draft letter.

In addition, a staff attorney from EPA's Office of General Council noted that, pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 60(b)(6), the plaintiffs in the litigation against the Agency (Missouri Coalition for the Environment *et al.*) and EPA Administrator Johnson (the "defendant") had jointly moved the U.S. District Court, Eastern District of Missouri, Eastern Division, to amend its orders of September 14, 2005 and April 29, 2008 to extend the public comment period on the notice of proposed rulemaking concerning revisions to the Lead NAAQS until August 4, 2008, and to provide the Agency until October 15, 2008 to sign a notice of final rulemaking concerning any revisions to the NAAQS for lead and complete tasks necessary for implementation of a revised NAAQS. This motion was granted on July 1, 2008.

Following additional, brief comments, Dr. Henderson asked if there were any objections from members of the chartered CASAC to approving this draft letter to the Administrator developed pursuant to the Lead Panel's June 9, 2008 teleconference to provide comments on EPA's proposed rule for the revision of the Lead NAAQS. Committee members voiced no objections, and the CASAC approved the draft letter at 1:20 PM.

Summary and Next Steps

Dr. Henderson thanked the members of the Lead Panel for their participation in today's teleconference. The DFO will send a proposed final draft letter to all members as soon as practicable, requesting that Panel members send any additional, final edits that they need to see incorporated into this letter to both the Chair and the DFO no later than 12:00 noon Eastern time on Monday, July 14. The SAB Staff Office will work to transmit the letter to the Administrator that week.

The DFO adjourned the meeting at approximately 1:21 p.m. on July 8, 2008.

Respectfully Submitted:

Certified as True:

/s/

/s/

Fred A. Butterfield, III

Rogene F. Henderson, Ph.D.

Fred A. Butterfield, III
CASAC DFO

Rogene F. Henderson, Ph.D.
CASAC Chair

Date: July 15, 2008

Appendix A – Roster of the CASAC Lead Review Panel

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee (CASAC) CASAC Lead Review Panel

CASAC MEMBERS

Dr. Rogene Henderson (Chair), Scientist Emeritus, Lovelace Respiratory Research Institute, Albuquerque, NM

Dr. Ellis Cowling, University Distinguished Professor At-Large, Emeritus, Colleges of Natural Resources and Agriculture and Life Sciences, North Carolina State University, Raleigh, NC

Dr. James D. Crapo [M.D.], Professor, Department of Medicine, National Jewish Medical and Research Center, Denver, CO

Dr. Douglas Crawford-Brown, Director, Carolina Environmental Program; Professor, Environmental Sciences and Engineering; and Professor, Public Policy, Department of Environmental Sciences and Engineering, University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill, Chapel Hill, NC

Dr. Donna Kenski, Director of Data Analysis, Lake Michigan Air Directors Consortium (LADCO), Rosemont, IL

Dr. Armistead (Ted) Russell, Georgia Power Distinguished Professor of Environmental Engineering, Environmental Engineering Group, School of Civil and Environmental Engineering, Georgia Institute of Technology, Atlanta, GA

Dr. Jonathan Samet [M.D.], Professor and Chairman, Department of Epidemiology, Bloomberg School of Public Health, Johns Hopkins University, Baltimore, MD

PANEL MEMBERS

Dr. Joshua Cohen, Research Associate Professor of Medicine, Tufts University School of Medicine, Institute for Clinical Research and Health Policy Studies, Center for the Evaluation of Value and Risk, Tufts New England Medical Center, Boston, MA

Dr. Deborah Cory-Slechta, Professor, Department of Environmental Medicine, University of Rochester School of Medicine and Dentistry, Rochester, NY

Dr. Bruce Fowler, Assistant Director for Science, Division of Toxicology and Environmental Medicine, Office of the Director, Agency for Toxic Substances and Disease Registry, U.S. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (ATSDR/CDC), Chamblee, GA

Dr. Andrew Friedland, Professor and Chair, Environmental Studies Program, Dartmouth College, Hanover, NH

Mr. Sean Hays, President, Summit Toxicology, Allenspark, CO

Dr. Bruce Lanphear [M.D.], Sloan Professor of Children's Environmental Health, and the Director of the Cincinnati Children's Environmental Health Center at Cincinnati Children's Hospital Medical Center and the University of Cincinnati, Cincinnati, OH

Dr. Samuel Luoma,* Senior Research Hydrologist, Emeritus, U.S. Geological Survey (USGS), Menlo Park, CA

Dr. Frederick J. Miller, Consultant, Cary, NC

Dr. Paul Mushak, Principal, PB Associates, and Visiting Professor, Albert Einstein College of Medicine (New York, NY), Durham, NC

Dr. Michael Newman, Professor of Marine Science, School of Marine Sciences, Virginia Institute of Marine Science, College of William & Mary, Gloucester Point, VA

Mr. Richard L. Poirot, Environmental Analyst, Air Pollution Control Division, Department of Environmental Conservation, Vermont Agency of Natural Resources, Waterbury, VT

Dr. Michael Rabinowitz, Geochemist, Marine Biological Laboratory, Woods Hole, MA

Dr. Joel Schwartz, Professor, Environmental Health, Harvard University School of Public Health, Boston, MA

Dr. Frank Speizer [M.D.], Edward Kass Professor of Medicine, Channing Laboratory, Harvard Medical School, Boston, MA

Dr. Ian von Lindern, Senior Scientist, TerraGraphics Environmental Engineering, Inc., Moscow, ID

Dr. Barbara Zielinska, Research Professor, Division of Atmospheric Science, Desert Research Institute, Reno, NV

SCIENCE ADVISORY BOARD STAFF

Mr. Fred Butterfield, CASAC Designated Federal Officer, 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W., Washington, DC, 20460, Phone: 202-343-9994, Fax: 202-233-0643 (butterfield.fred@epa.gov)

*Dr. Luoma did not participate in this CASAC Lead Review Panel advisory activity.

Appendix B – Meeting Agenda

**U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee (CASAC)
CASAC Lead Review Panel**

Public Advisory Teleconference Meeting

Tuesday, July 8, 2008 – 1:00 to 4:00 p.m. Eastern Time

Advisory Meeting to Review and Approve CASAC’s Draft Letter to the EPA Administrator Concerning EPA’s Proposed Rule for the Revision of the National Ambient Air Quality Standard (NAAQS) for Lead (May 2008)

Meeting Agenda

1:00 p.m.	Convene teleconference; call attendance; introductions and administration	Mr. Fred Butterfield, CASAC DFO
1:10 p.m.	Purpose of meeting	Dr. Rogene Henderson, CASAC Chair
1:15 p.m.	Public comment period	Mr. Butterfield (Facilitator)
1:45 p.m.	Overview of CASAC’s Draft Letter to the EPA Administrator re: EPA’s Proposed Rule for the Revision of the Lead NAAQS	Dr. Henderson
2:00 p.m.	Lead Panel members’ discussion and deliberations	CASAC and Panel members
3:30 p.m.	CASAC approval of draft report	Dr. Henderson, CASAC members
3:45 p.m.	Additional discussions, summary and next steps	Dr. Henderson
4:00 p.m.	Adjourn meeting	Mr. Butterfield