

Summary Minutes of the  
Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee  
Particulate Matter Review Panel  
Public Teleconference  
November 12, 2009

Committee Members:

Dr. Jonathan Samet, Chair  
Dr. Lowell Ashbaugh  
Professor Ed Avol  
Dr. Joseph Brain  
Dr. Ellis Cowling  
Dr. Helen Suh  
Dr. William Malm  
Dr. David Grantz  
Mr. Tom Moore  
Dr. Robert Phalen  
Dr. Kent Pinkerton  
Mr. Richard Poirot  
Dr. Ted Russell  
Dr. Frank Speizer  
Dr. Sverre Vedal

Date and Time:

November 12, 2009: 10:00 am – 12:00 pm

Purpose:

The Clean Air Scientific Committee Review Panel (CASAC) reviewed draft letters on three documents: *Integrated Science Assessment for Particulate Matter (ISA, Second External Review Draft, July 2009)* and *Particulate Matter Urban Focused Visibility Assessment (September 2009)* and *Risk Assessment to Support the Review of the PM Primary National Ambient Air Quality Standards (September 2009)*.

SAB Staff:

Dr. Holly Stallworth, Designated Federal Officer

Other EPA Staff:

Lydia Wegman, Karen Martin, Bryan Hubbell, Harvey Richmond, Phil Lorang, Zach Pekar, Pradeep Rajan, Meredith Lassiter, Vicki Sandiford, Marc Pitchford, Tim Hanley, Neal Fann, Neil Frank, Beth Hassett-Sipple, Mary Ross, John Vandenberg, Lindsay Stanek, James Brown

Others:

Ted Steichen, American Petroleum Institute  
Justine Walters, Southern Company  
Molly Davis, Inside EPA

Rachel Broadwin, OEHA - California  
Julie Goodman, Gradient Corporation  
Deborah Shprentz, American Lung Association  
Heidi King, Office of Management and Budget\*  
Wig Zamore, Mystic View Task Force\*  
Kurt Blasé, Blasé Group\*  
John Jansen, Southern Company\*  
Bart Ostro, Cal-EPA\*  
Stuart Parker, Inside Washington Publishers\*

*\* These individuals requested the phone number but did not participate or did not announce their participation in the teleconference.*

### Meeting Summary

The discussion followed the issues and general timing as presented in the meeting agenda. The meeting agenda and a revised schedule for the PM NAAQS review may be found posted at the meeting website:

<http://yosemite.epa.gov/sab/sabproduct.nsf/bf498bd32a1c7fd85257242006dd6cb/24cdd0f35db3ec9f8525762400482b2f!OpenDocument&Date=2009-11-12>

## **THURSDAY, NOVEMBER 12, 2009**

### Opening of Public Meeting

Dr. Holly Stallworth, Designated Federal Officer (DFO), opened the meeting with a statement that the CASAC Particulate Matter Review Panel is a federal advisory committee whose meetings and deliberations meet the requirements of the Federal Advisory Committee Act. Dr. Samet reviewed the agenda and purpose of the meeting

Presenting EPA's comments on the draft letter on the ISA, Dr. John Vandenberg of National Center for Environmental Assessment asked the panel to distinguish between short-term and long-term exposures and between cardiovascular and respiratory mortality. Accordingly, the CASAC Chair and Panel agreed to correct a sentence in the draft letter as well as in response to charge question 1(b). Panelists also discussed the need to use the word "effects" in a consistent way, particularly in reference to climate effects that can be either positive or negative. Panelists discussed whether to keep total mortality as an assessment endpoint (as opposed to just using cardiovascular mortality and respiratory mortality) and it was generally agreed that it should be included. In response to a question from NCEA, panelists agreed that it was appropriate to use "effects" as a large umbrella under which all mortality and morbidity effects would be included. It was further agreed that cause-specific mortality should be kept within the outcomes considered in assessing cardiovascular and respiratory effects. The Chair suggested that the issue of how to classify PM mass was a large and complex issue that would not be appropriately addressed in a few sentences appended to charge question. Other minor edits were offered on the remainder of the draft ISA letter.

Ms. Lydia Wegman of EPA Office of Air Quality Planning and Standards then presented the schedule for the PM review as shown in the revised schedule dated 11-10-09 and posted at the above URL. Ms. Wegman explained that the timeline for the review had been extended so as to afford CASAC an opportunity to see second drafts of the health Risk Assessment and the UFVA as well as a second draft of the Policy Assessment.

The Panel offered very minor edits on the draft letter on the PM Risk Assessment. One change was requested so that the draft letter recognized that EPA limited its Risk Assessment to only those outcomes judged to be “causal” or “likely causal” with the highest level of certainty and sufficient data.

With respect to the UFVA, Dr. Mark Pitchford of OAQPS informed panelists about a correction being made to the relative humidity data. Panelists discussed why the “cutpoint” for classifying PM mass ended up at a diameter of 2.5 micrometers rather than a diameter of 1.0 micrometers. Other minor edits were suggested.

Dr. Stallworth promised to make all of the edits discussed in the teleconference. Upon approval by the Chair, the revised letters would be transmitted to the Administrator.

Respectfully Submitted:

Holly Stallworth, Ph.D. /s/  
Designated Federal Officer

Certified as True:

Jonathan Samet, M.D., M.S. /s/  
Chair

NOTE AND DISCLAIMER: The minutes of this public meeting reflect diverse ideas and suggestions offered by Committee member during the course of deliberations within the meeting. Such ideas, suggestions and deliberations do not necessarily reflect consensus advice from the panel members. The reader is cautioned to not rely on the minutes to represent final, approved, consensus advice and recommendations offered to the Agency. Such advice and recommendations may be found in the final advisories, commentaries, letters or reports prepared and transmitted to the EPA Administrator following the public meetings.