

Further Comments

Joe Rudek

to:

James N. Galloway

12/10/2008 11:35 AM

Cc:

"Tom Theis", Kathleen White, "Viney Aneja", "Ken Cassman"

Show Details

Jim,

Thank you for addressing my comments in the call yesterday. I'd like to offer the following response on how the group decided to address my general comment regarding the rationale for the numeric goals set in the paper. My understanding of the approach to be taken is that a paragraph describing what each work group did to come up with the goal would be added to the document. I think it would be far better and much more useful if the INC provided a more detailed presentation of how the goals were derived. This could be done in an appendix to facilitate incorporating it into the document.

I make this suggestion because the work has already been done by the various work groups within INC and the readers of this document would benefit from a more detailed write up of the calculations used as well as the logic behind the use of existing data sources. I also repeat the statement made in my original comments: In the inevitable debate which would accompany efforts to achieve the stated INC decreased Nr goals, a clear presentation of the process which led to selecting those goals would help avoid numerous debates about that process.

With regards,

Joe

Joe Rudek, Ph.D.
Senior Scientist
Environmental Defense Fund
4000 Westchase Blvd.
Suite 510
Raleigh, NC 27607
direct: 919-881-2913
office: 919-881-2601
jrudek@edf.org

-----Original Message-----

From: James N. Galloway [mailto:jng@virginia.edu]

Sent: Monday, December 08, 2008 1:18 PM

To: Joe Rudek

Cc: Tom Theis; Kathleen White; Viney Aneja; Ken Cassman

Subject: Fwd: RE: Dial-in Numbers for Integrated Nitrogen Committee teleconferences December 8, 9, and 10

Hi Joe,

thanks for these thoughtful comments. All but the first tow (which Kathleen or I will address) pertain to Section 3.2, which within the committee is the responsibility of Viney Aneja and Ken Cassman. I have copied both on this email and indicated in your document which ones they should address.

best wishes,

Jim

Best wishes

>X-IronPort-Anti-Spam-Filtered: true
>X-IronPort-Anti-Spam-Result:
>Al8CAIvxPENAb9sCgWdsb2JhbACSA4FRAQEWIrE5CYlCAYIAgQQ
>Subject: RE: Dial-in Numbers for Integrated Nitrogen Committee
>teleconferences December 8, 9, and 10
>Date: Mon, 8 Dec 2008 13:10:42 -0500
>Thread-Topic: Dial-in Numbers for Integrated Nitrogen Committee
>teleconferences December 8, 9, and 10
>Thread-Index: AclUk5YJTn8mq8MPT0Ga0YWn/tBnkAEzFM+g
>From: "Joe Rudek" <jrudek@edf.org>
>To: <White.Kathleen@epamail.epa.gov>
>Cc: "VINEY P ANEJA" <vpaneja@ncsu.edu>,
> "James N. Galloway" <jng@virginia.edu>
>X-UVA-Virus-Scanned: by amavisd-new at fork7.mail.virginia.edu
>
>Kathleen,
> I can't figure out how to submit public comments on the web page
>so I'm sending to you. These comments are on the chapters on today's
>agenda.
>
> Am I too late to request an opportunity to make a brief public
>comment?
>
>Thank you,
>
>Joe
>
>-----Original Message-----
>From: White.Kathleen@epamail.epa.gov
>[mailto:White.Kathleen@epamail.epa.gov]
>Sent: Tuesday, December 02, 2008 10:35 AM
>To: Joe Rudek
>Subject: Dial-in Numbers for Integrated Nitrogen Committee
>teleconferences December 8, 9, and 10
>
>Dear Joe,
>
>Delighted you will be on the call(s). As you surmised, they are a
>sequence of meetings with different material discussed each day. There
>is time set aside for public comment each day, although no one has yet
>requested any time for oral comments. The agendas for each day are
>being posted at our website (www.epa.gov/sab), but I find it more
>convenient to have them in a single document, so I attached it.
>
> (See attached file: Agenda for December Telcons Updated.doc)
>

cc

>

>

Subject

>

RE: The First External Draft of

>

the SAB Integrated Nitrogen

>

Committee is now posted on the

>

web

>

>

>

>

>

>

>

>

>

>

>

>Kathleen,

>

I would like to be on the call. Are the 3 calls a

sequence

>of

>meetings or are they essentially repeat opportunities to hear from

>interested individuals?

>

>Thank you,

>

>Joe Rudek, Ph.D.

>Senior Scientist

>Environmental Defense Fund

>4000 Westchase Blvd.

>Suite 510

>Raleigh, NC 27607

>direct: 919-881-2913

>office: 919-881-2601

>jrudek@edf.org

>

>-----Original Message-----

>From: White.Kathleen@epamail.epa.gov

>[mailto:White.Kathleen@epamail.epa.gov]

>Sent: Thursday, November 20, 2008 11:21 AM

>To: mdmunn@usgs.gov; nmdubrov@usgs.gov; sep@clarkson.edu;

>John.Aber@unh.edu; swhager@usgs.gov; dhpete@usgs.gov;

>ROGOLDST@epri.com;

>vbierman@limno.com; CSL@gknet.com; mvk5@cornell.edu; erisman@ecn.nl;

>jill@nrel.colostate.edu; abytnerowicz@fs.fed.us; tthies@beef.org;
>gayle@ncat.edu; Braden.Allenby@asu.edu; ebaum@catf.us;
>fpweatherford@tva.gov; KorcakR@ba.ars.usda.gov; swhager@usgs.gov;
>ivanjf@maine.edu; Jorge.Delgado@ars.usda.gov; RCarlton@epri.com;
>randy.seeker@ps.ge.com; tbridgeford@nma.org; Joe Rudek;
>eknippin@epri.com; steven.shimberg@dlapiper.com; CLAASSEN@ers.usda.gov;
>DABERKOW@ers.usda.gov; craig.cox@swcs.org; pfixen@ipni.net;
>jmirski@iastate.edu; David McNaught; jsheehan303@me.com;
>LAntosch@ofbf.org; csnyder@ipni.net; anne.coan@ncfb.org;
>kwinston@iwpnews.com; bradleypauley@johndeere.com;
mhegstad@iwpnews.com;
>ccory@cfbf.com; GraySue@JohnDeere.com; jspencer@arb.ca.gov;
>rboyd@mcclatchydc.com; Thomas.Belton@dep.state.nj.us;
>Charles.Kovach@dep.state.fl.us; jim@composter.com; Suzy Friedman;
>Tom.Hebert@ogilvygr.com; Suzanne.Bricker@noaa.gov;
>David.Kidwell@noaa.gov; Liddella@nppc.org; bnewell@crpe-ej.org;
>omalley@heinzcenter.org; lmurphy@agronomy.org; jenphelan@rti.org;
>Dave.Whitall@noaa.gov; Richard.Artz@noaa.gov;
>mnoble@sustainableagriculturecoalition.org; WReid@packard.org;
>John.Quinn@constellation.com; rich.poirot@state.vt.us;
>j.wurtz@nationalrailway.com; johnhardinjr@gmail.com;
>hardin@mintra02.rtp.epa.gov; Rknighton@CSREES.USDA.GOV;
>mark.walbridge@ars.usda.gov; kmoore@ethanolrfa.org;
>richard.swenson@usda.gov; bsummers@mde.state.md.us; Albert Ettinger;
>Catherine.O'Connor@mwrdr.org; mselman@wri.org; tsimpson@umd.edu;
>marcia.willhite@illinois.gov; Dan.Jaynes@ars.usda.gov;
>millers@clemson.edu; spreston@usgs.gov; Pat.Rice@nebraska.gov;
>csnyder@ipni.net; ar70@ce.gatech.edu
>Subject: The First External Draft of the SAB Integrated Nitrogen
>Committee is now posted on the web
>
>
>
>The INC has public teleconferences scheduled December 8, 9, and 10 from
>2-5 Eastern to discuss the report.
>If you want to be on the call, please let me know by Thursday December
4
>(I'm out of the office on the 5th) so I can send you the call-in
>information. The morning of the 8th is likely to be hectic and I
>wouldn't want to lose you in the general craziness.
>
>
>This link should take you directly to the report.
>
>
>[http://yosemite.epa.gov/sab/sabproduct.nsf/ea5d9a9b55cc319285256cbd005a
4
72e/1c4130ffc9885de385257501006b70e8!OpenDocument](http://yosemite.epa.gov/sab/sabproduct.nsf/ea5d9a9b55cc319285256cbd005a472e/1c4130ffc9885de385257501006b70e8!OpenDocument)
>
>
>best wishes for Thanksgiving!
>
>Kathleen
>
>Kathleen E. White
>Designated Federal Officer for the
>Environmental Engineering Committee

>Science Advisory Board
>U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

>

>

>New Contact Information:

>

>TEL 202 343 9878

>Fax 202 233 0643 or 0645

>

>Regular Mail Address:

>Science Advisory Board (1400F)

>USEPA

>1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

>Washington, DC 20460

>

>Overnight Mail and Delivery Address:

>1025 F Street, NW

> Cubicle: 3610E

> Mail Code: 1400F

>Washington, DC 20004

>

>Main SAB Phone: (202) 343-9999

>Fax: (202) 233-0643 or 233-0645

>

>

>

>This e-mail and any attachments may contain confidential and
>privileged information. If you are not the intended recipient,
>please notify the sender immediately by return e-mail, delete this
>e-mail and destroy any copies. Any dissemination or use of this
>information by a person other than the intended recipient is
>unauthorized and may be illegal.

>

>Content-Type: application/msword;

> name="Comments on INC Draft Report Dec 8-2008.doc"

>Content-Description: Comments on INC Draft Report Dec 8-2008.doc

>Content-Disposition: attachment;

> filename="Comments on INC Draft Report Dec 8-2008.doc"

>

>