From: Moomaw, William R
To: Carpenter, Thomas
Subject: Re: How to submit comments on Biogenic Carbon Dioxide Emissions from Stationary Sources - Assessment Framework
Date: Thursday, March 31, 2016 4:25:02 PM

Dear Dr Carpenter:

I don't know what happened, but the speakers at your end could no longer be understood (Low volume). Several of us on the phone were responding to comments and suddenly we were cut off. Another person came on line expecting to present but was cut off.

I wanted to clarify confusion on the part of the first panel member. Burning wood releases slightly more carbon dioxide than coal per unit of heat. The conversion of wood heat to electricity is less efficient than coal because it burns with lower temperature. The net result is that wood releases up to 50% more CO2 than coal per unit of electricity.

Burning a mature forest releases X tons of carbon. A replacement forest regrown to the same state will absorb X tons of carbon - not more than what was there originally. During the regrow the period, there is always more CO2 in the atmosphere than if the original forest had not been cut and burned. Furthermore, there is no assurance that replacement will occur.

There are claims of offsetting coal emissions by planting trees somewhere. The advantage here is that one would not need to plant as many trees as if the electricity were produced by wood burning.

Is there an opportunity to explain this to the panel?

Also I was not able to ask about the lack of analysis concerning the spatial and production scale in the original EPA request.
It is astounding how much forest it takes to keep a power plant operating. Solar panels are far more efficient with zero emissions.

William Moomaw

Sent from my iPhone
William Moomaw
Center for International Environment and Resource Policy
Tufts University
William.moomaw@tufts.edu
617-335-3994
fletcher.tufts.edu/CIERP

On Mar 31, 2016, at 2:04 PM, Carpenter, Thomas <Carpenter.Thomas@epa.gov> wrote:

> Are you on the phone?
>
> ---
>
> **From:** Moomaw, William R [mailto:William.Moomaw@tufts.edu]
> **Sent:** Wednesday, March 23, 2016 5:52 PM
> **To:** Carpenter, Thomas <Carpenter.Thomas@epa.gov>
> **Subject:** RE: How to submit comments on Biogenic Carbon Dioxide Emissions from Stationary Sources - Assessment Framework
>
> Thank you very much for your prompt reply.

The agenda is helpful, and I will look forward to the opportunity to make a short oral presentation.

Regards,
Bill Moomaw

From: Carpenter, Thomas [Carpenter.Thomas@epa.gov]
Sent: Wednesday, March 23, 2016 4:52 PM
To: Moomaw, William R
Subject: RE: How to submit comments on Biogenic Carbon Dioxide Emissions from Stationary Sources - Assessment Framework

Thank you Dr. Moomaw.

I will post the comments, provide them to the SAB members and add you to the list of registered speakers. We will have a phone line available for you to present your oral statement to the Board.

An agenda is available on the SAB webpage at:
https://yosemite.epa.gov/sab/sabproduct.nsf//MeetingCalBOARD/1A5A2FD1C8FCE7C585257F390054FD5C?OpenDocument

I will confirm the teleconference after deadline for registering to address the Board.

Regards,

Thomas Carpenter
Designated Federal Officer / Sr. Biologist
US EPA Science Advisory Board, MC 1400R
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Washington DC 20460
ph 202 564 4885 Fax 202 565 2098

From: Moomaw, William R [mailto:William.Moomaw@tufts.edu]
Sent: Wednesday, March 23, 2016 4:35 PM
To: Carpenter, Thomas <Carpenter.Thomas@epa.gov>
Cc: Stallworth, Holly <Stallworth.Holly@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: How to submit comments on Biogenic Carbon Dioxide Emissions from Stationary Sources - Assessment Framework

Dear Dr. Carpenter,

Please find attached comments on the panel draft report on Biogenic Carbon Dioxide Emissions from Stationary Sources - Assessment Framework from 44 scientists with expertise in forests, bioenergy, carbon, water and climate change.We hope that the panel will be able to address our concerns and benefit from our suggestions.

I would also appreciate the opportunity to register fro oral comments as well if that can me done by phone or Skype.

We appreciate this opportunity for us to contribute to the EPA process.

Sincerely,
Prof. Emeritus William R. Moomaw, Ph.D., Co-Director Global Development and Environment Institute, Tufts University william.moomaw@tufts.edu 617-335-3994

From: Carpenter, Thomas [Carpenter.Thomas@epa.gov]
Sent: Tuesday, March 22, 2016 12:56 PM
To: Moomaw, William R
Cc: Stallworth, Holly
Subject: RE: How to submit comments on Biogenic Carbon Dioxide Emissions from Stationary Sources - Assessment Framework

Dr. Moomaw,

Please send your comments to me at this email. I will be happy to post them and provide them to them to the SAB members. I assume you are not requesting to register to provide oral comments. If am incorrect please let me know by March 23 as directed in the Federal Register notice announcing the meeting.

Best Regards,

Thomas Carpenter
Designated Federal Officer / Sr. Biologist
US EPA Science Advisory Board, MC 1400R
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Washington DC 20460
ph 202 564 4885 Fax 202 565 2098

From: Stallworth, Holly
Sent: Tuesday, March 22, 2016 7:59 AM
To: Moomaw, William R <William.Moomaw@tufts.edu>
Cc: Carpenter, Thomas <Carpenter.Thomas@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: How to submit comments on Biogenic Carbon Dioxide Emissions from Stationary Sources - Assessment Framework

At this point, they actually go to Tom Carpenter, Designated Federal Officer for the chartered SAB, copied above. I look forward to reading them.

Holly Stallworth, Ph.D.
Economist and Designated Federal Officer
Science Advisory Board Staff Office
Environmental Protection Agency
1300 Pennsylvania Ave., NW
Mail Code 1400R
Washington, DC 20004
202-564-2073

From: Moomaw, William R [mailto:William.Moomaw@tufts.edu]
Sent: Monday, March 21, 2016 8:54 PM
To: Stallworth, Holly <Stallworth.Holly@epa.gov>
Subject: How to submit comments on Biogenic Carbon Dioxide Emissions from Stationary Sources -

Assessment Framework

Importance: High

Dear Dr. Stallworth:

Several people have prepared comments on the draft report, "Biogenic Carbon Dioxide Emissions from Stationary Sources - Assessment Framework."

Do we send the comments to you at this email address?

Thank you very much.

Regards,
William Moomaw
Emeritus Professor
Tufts University