

**Summary Minutes of the
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA)
Science Advisory Board (SAB) Staff Office
Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee (CASAC)
Oxides of Nitrogen Primary NAAQS Review Panel
Public Teleconference
October 30, 2008**

Committee Members: (See Roster – Attachment A)

Scheduled Date and Time: From 1:00 p.m. to 3:00 p.m. (Eastern Time) on October 30, 2008.
(See Federal Register Notice, Attachment B)

Location: By Teleconference

Purpose: to review and approve CASAC's draft letter on EPA's *Integrated Science Assessment for Oxides of Nitrogen and Sulfur - Environmental Criteria* (Second External Review Draft)

Participants: Members of the chartered CASAC:
Dr. James Crapo (Chair for the call)
Dr. Joseph Brain
Dr. Ellis Cowling
Dr. Christopher Frey
Dr. Donna Kenski
Dr. Armistead (Ted) Russell
Members of the CASAC NO_x and SO_x Secondary National Ambient Air Quality Standards (NAAQS) Review Panel:
Dr. Charles Driscoll
Dr. Dale Johnson
Dr. Myron Mitchell
SAB Staff Office:
Nugent, EPA SAB Staff Office, Designated Federal Officer (DFO) for this teleconference)
Dr. Holly Stallworth, EPA SAB Staff Office, DFO for the chartered CASAC
Ms. Kyndall Barry, DFO for the CASAC NO_x and SO_x Secondary National Ambient Air Quality Standards (NAAQS) Review Panel

Teleconference Summary – October 30, 2008

The discussion addressed the topics included in the Proposed Meeting Agenda (See Meeting Agenda - Attachment C) and followed the sequence summarized below.

Opening of Public Teleconference

Dr. Angela Nugent opened the call and stated that she had been asked by Dr. Holly Stallworth, DFO for the chartered CASAC, to act as DFO for the teleconference. She also announced that the CASAC chair, Dr. Jonathan Samet had asked Dr. James Crapo to serve as chair for the teleconference. Dr. Nugent stated that the call was an advisory teleconference, previously noticed in the *Federal Register* and that no written comments or requests for oral comments had been received from the public related to the teleconference.

Dr. Crapo welcomed members and stated the purpose of the teleconference: to review and approve a draft CASAC's letter on EPA's *Integrated Science Assessment for Oxides of Nitrogen and Sulfur - Environmental Criteria* (Second External Review Draft). He asked the chair of the authoring panel to provide a brief introduction to the draft report.

Introduction to draft report

Dr. Armistead Russell briefly described the work of the CASAC NO_x and SO_x Secondary National Ambient Air Quality Standards (NAAQS) Review Panel, which had reviewed the second draft of EPA's Integrated Science Assessment (ISA) for secondary effects of NO_x and SO_x. He noted that EPA had responded to the CASAC Panel's comments on the first draft ISA and emphasized several general issues of importance:

1. EPA should rename the document to reflect its focus on ecological criteria, the topic of the ISA, or, if EPA wishes to retain "Environmental Criteria" in the title, EPA should discuss and reference other sources related to environmental effects.
2. EPA should incorporate the summary of key findings in the Executive Summary and advised that ISAs for criteria pollutants include executive summaries and summaries of key findings in the future. He further suggested that the Agency use these key findings from the ISAs in the future as a structure for *Risk and Exposure Assessments* (REAs), which should interpret the ISA's key findings from a policy perspective.
3. EPA should more carefully distinguish between the effects of oxides of nitrogen and reactive nitrogen throughout the document.

Dr. Ellis Cowling, a member of the CASAC NO_x and SO_x Secondary National Ambient Air Quality Standards (NAAQS) Review Panel, added that the letter should more clearly explain the nature and significance of organic nitrogen on page one and the final page of the letter. Dr. Russell agreed to make this change.

Discussion

Dr. Crapo asked for comments from other members of the CASAC panel present on the call. One panel member suggested eliminating the use of chemical symbols in the document. Dr. Russell responded that, as a practical matter, the readers of the document were technical specialists who could understand the chemical symbols. Panel members emphasized the importance of including a sentence noting the significant need for detailed editing in the REA to improve the formatting, word usage, and references to improve the clarity and accuracy of the document. Dr. Russell agreed to include this recommendation in the final paragraph.

Chartered CASAC members then provided comment. One member noted that both responses to charge question two and five mention a chain of causality linkages. He suggested that the letter briefly discuss the context for the use of such linkages and suggest that it can be useful both for prospective NAAQS analysis and retrospective analysis for accountability. Similar metrics would be used for both analyses and consistency may be desirable. Dr. Russell agreed to add a sentence relating to this issue to the last paragraph responding to charge question 5.

Participants on the phone call then discussed a number of minor editorial changes to the document

CASAC Review

Dr. Crapo then asked whether the chartered CASAC members wished to approve the report, subject to the editorial changes discussed, and language added regarding causality and accountability and the need for EPA to provide significant editing to improve the clarity and accuracy of the report. There was consensus to accept the report.

At the chair's request, the Designated Federal Officer adjourned the meeting at 12:40 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted:

/s/

Angela Nugent
Designated Federal Officer

Certified as True:

/s/

James Crapo
CASAC Member, Chair

NOTE AND DISCLAIMER: The minutes of this public meeting reflect diverse ideas and suggestions offered by committee members during the course of deliberations within the meeting. Such ideas, suggestions, and deliberations do not necessarily reflect definitive consensus advice from the panel members. The reader is cautioned to not rely on the minutes to represent final, approved, consensus advice and recommendations offered to the Agency. Such advice and recommendations may be found in the final advisories, letters, or reports prepared and transmitted to the EPA Administrator following the public meetings.

Attachments

Attachment A	Roster
Attachment B	Federal Register Notice
Attachment C	Meeting Agenda

Attachment A: Roster

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee (CASAC)

CHAIR

Dr. Jonathan M. Samet, Professor and Chair of the Department of Epidemiology, Bloomberg School of Public Health, Johns Hopkins University, Baltimore, MD

CASAC MEMBERS

Dr. Joseph Brain, Philip Drinker Professor of Environmental Physiology, Department of Environmental Health, Harvard School of Public Health, Harvard University, Boston, MA

Dr. Ellis B. Cowling, University Distinguished Professor At-Large, Emeritus, Colleges of Natural Resources and Agriculture and Life Sciences, North Carolina State University, Raleigh, NC

Dr. James Crapo, Professor of Medicine, Department of Medicine, National Jewish Medical and Research Center, Denver, CO

Dr. H. Christopher Frey, Professor, Department of Civil, Construction and Environmental Engineering, College of Engineering, North Carolina State University, Raleigh, NC, USA

Dr. Donna Kenski, Data Analyst, Lake Michigan Air Directors Consortium, Des Plaines, IL

Dr. Armistead (Ted) Russell, Professor, Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering, Georgia Institute of Technology, Atlanta, GA

Attachment B: Federal Register Notice

Science Advisory Board Staff Office; Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee (CASAC); NOX
& SOX Secondary NAAQS Review Panel Meeting and Teleconference
PDF Version (2 pp, 75K, About PDF)

[Federal Register: September 15, 2008 (Volume 73, Number 179)]

[Notices]

[Page 53242-53243]

From the Federal Register Online via GPO Access [wais.access.gpo.gov]

[DOCID:fr15se08-65]

ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

[FRL-8715-9]

Science Advisory Board Staff Office; Clean Air Scientific
Advisory Committee (CASAC); NOX & SOX Secondary NAAQS Review Panel
Meeting and Teleconference

AGENCY: Environmental Protection Agency (EPA).

ACTION: Notice.

SUMMARY: The Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) Science Advisory Board (SAB) Staff Office announces a public meeting of the Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee Oxides of Nitrogen (NOX) and Sulfur Oxides (SOX) Secondary National Ambient Air Quality Standards (NAAQS) Review Panel (CASAC Panel) to peer review EPA's Integrated Science Assessment for Oxides of Nitrogen and Sulfur-- Environmental Criteria (Second External Review Draft) (EPA/600/R-08/082) and EPA's Risk and Exposure Assessment for Review of the Secondary National Ambient Air Quality Standards for Oxides of Nitrogen and Oxides of Sulfur: First Draft (EPA-452/P-08-005a). The chartered CASAC will review and approve the Panel's reports by public teleconference.

DATES: The CASAC Panel will meet from 8:30 a.m. Wednesday, October 1, 2008 through 3 p.m. Thursday, October 2, 2008 (Eastern Time). The chartered CASAC will meet by public teleconference from 1 p.m. to 3 p.m. on October 30, 2008 (Eastern Time).

ADDRESSES: The October 1-2, 2008 public meeting will take place at the Marriott at Research Triangle Park, 4700 Guardian Drive, Durham, NC 27703, telephone (919) 941-6200. The October 30, 2008 public

teleconference will be conducted by phone only.

FOR FURTHER INFORMATION CONTACT: Any member of the public who wants further information concerning the October 1-2, 2008 meeting may contact Ms. Kyndall Barry, Designated Federal Officer (DFO), EPA Science Advisory Board (1400F), U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW., Washington, DC 20460; via telephone/voice mail (202) 343-9868; fax (202) 233-0643; or e-mail at barry.kyndall@epa.gov. For information

[[Page 53243]]

on the CASAC teleconference on October 30, 2008, please contact Mr. Fred Butterfield, Designated Federal Officer (DFO), at the above listed address; via telephone/voice mail (202) 343-9994 or e-mail at butterfield.fred@epa.gov. General information concerning the CASAC can be found on the EPA Web site at <http://www.epa.gov/casac>.

SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION:

Background: The Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee (CASAC) was established under section 109(d)(2) of the Clean Air Act (CAA or Act) (42 U.S.C. 7409) as an independent scientific advisory committee. CASAC provides advice, information and recommendations on the scientific and technical aspects of air quality criteria and national ambient air quality standards (NAAQS) under sections 108 and 109 of the Act. The CASAC is a Federal advisory committee chartered under the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA), as amended, 5 U.S.C. App. The Panel will comply with the provisions of FACA and all appropriate SAB Staff Office procedural policies.

Section 109(d)(1) of the CAA requires that the Agency periodically review and revise, as appropriate, the air quality criteria and the NAAQS for the six "criteria" air pollutants, including NOX and SOX. EPA is in the process of reviewing the secondary NAAQS for NOX and SOX. Welfare effects as defined in the CAA includes, but is not limited to, effects on soils, water, wildlife, vegetation, visibility, weather, and climate, as well as effects on materials, economic values, and personal comfort and well-being. As part of that process, EPA's Office of Research and Development (ORD) issued the Draft Integrated Science Assessment for Oxides of Nitrogen and Sulfur--Environmental Criteria (ISA) in December 2007 and recently issued the second draft ISA in August 2008. EPA's Office of Air and Radiation (OAR) released its Scope and Methods Plan for Risk/Exposure Assessment (REA) in March 2008. OAR completed the first draft REA in August 2008. The CASAC reviewed the first draft ISA and provided consultative advice on the Scope and Methods plan on April 1-2, 2008. The CASAC's reports to the Administrator can be found on the SAB Web site at <http://www.epa.gov/casac> (see EPA-CASAC-08-011 and EPA-

CASAC-08-012 both dated May 19, 2008).

The purpose of the October 1-2, 2008 meeting is for the CASAC Panel to conduct a peer review of the second draft ISA and the first draft REA. The chartered CASAC will review and approve the Panel's draft reports on the ISA and REA by public conference call on October 30, 2008.

Technical Contacts: Any questions concerning EPA's Integrated Science Assessment for Oxides of Nitrogen and Sulfur--Environmental Criteria (Second External Review Draft) should be directed to Dr. Tara Greaver, ORD, at (919) 541-2435 or greaver.tara@epa.gov. Any questions concerning EPA's Risk and Exposure Assessment for Review of the Secondary National Ambient Air Quality Standards for Oxides of Nitrogen and Oxides of Sulfur: First Draft should be directed to Dr. Anne Rea, OAR, at (919) 541-0053 or rea.anne@epa.gov.

Availability of Meeting Materials: EPA-ORD's Integrated Science Assessment for Oxides of Nitrogen and Sulfur--Environmental Criteria (Second External Review Draft) can be accessed at <http://cfpub.epa.gov/ncea/cfm/recordisplay.cfm?deid=198220>. EPA-OAR's Scope and Methods Plan for Risk/Exposure Assessment: Secondary NAAQS Review for Oxides of Nitrogen and Oxides of Sulfur can be accessed at http://www.epa.gov/ttn/naaqs/standards/no2so2sec/cr_pd.html. The agenda and other materials for the CASAC meetings will be posted on the SAB Web site at <http://www.epa.gov/casac>.

Procedures for Providing Public Input: Interested members of the public may submit relevant written or oral information for consideration on the topics included in this advisory activity. Oral Statements: To be placed on the public speaker list for the October 1-2, 2008 meeting, interested parties should notify Ms. Kyndall Barry, DFO, by e-mail no later than September 24, 2008. To be placed on the public speaker list for the October 30, 2008 teleconference, interested parties should notify Mr. Fred Butterfield, DFO, by e-mail no later than October 23, 2008. Oral presentations will be limited to one-half hour for all speakers. Written Statements: Written statements for the October 1-2, 2008 meeting should be received in the SAB Staff Office by September 24, 2008, so that the information may be made available to the CASAC Panel for its consideration prior to this meeting. For the teleconference meeting of the chartered CASAC on October 30, 2008, statements should be received in the SAB Staff Office by October 23, 2008. Written statements should be supplied to the appropriate DFO in the following formats: one hard copy with original signature and one electronic copy via e-mail (acceptable file format: Adobe Acrobat PDF, MS Word, WordPerfect, MS PowerPoint, or Rich Text files in IBM-PC/Windows 98/2000/XP format).

Accessibility: For information on access or services for individuals with disabilities, please contact Ms. Barry at the phone number or e-mail address noted above, preferably at least ten days prior to the face-to-face meeting, to give EPA as much time as possible to process your request.

Dated: September 8, 2008.
Anthony F. Maciorowski,
Deputy Director, EPA Science Advisory Board Staff Office.

Attachment C: Teleconference Agenda

AGENDA
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Science Advisory Board (SAB) Staff Office
Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee (CASAC)
Public Teleconference
October 30, 2008
1:00 pm – 3:00 pm, Eastern Time

Purpose: To discuss CASAC's draft letter on EPA's *Integrated Science Assessment for Oxides of Nitrogen and Sulfur – Environmental Criteria (Second External Review Draft)*.

Thursday, October 30, 2008

1:00pm	Convene Meeting and Welcome	Dr. Angela Nugent, SAB Staff Office
1:05 pm	Review of Agenda	Dr. Jonathon Samet, CASAC Chair
1:10pm	Public Comments or Agency Comments	
1:20pm	Discussion of Draft ISA Letter	Dr. Samet and CASAC Members
3:00pm	Adjourn	