

**Summary Minutes of the
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee (CASAC)
Public Teleconference
December 19, 2008
12:00 pm – 3:00 pm, Eastern Time**

CASAC Members: Dr. Jon Samet, Chair
Dr. James Crapo
Dr. Donna Kenski
Dr. Ellis Cowling
Dr. Ted Russell
Dr. Christopher Frey
Dr. Joe Brain
Dr. Praveen Amar (CASAC NO_x & SO_x Secondary
National Ambient Air Quality Standards (NAAQS)
Review Panel or Panel)
Dr. Andrzej Bytnerowicz (Panel)

Purpose: CASAC approved the draft report regarding its peer review of EPA's *Risk and Exposure Assessment (REA) for Review of the Secondary National Ambient Air Quality Standards for Oxides of Nitrogen and Oxides of Sulfur: First Draft (August 2008)*. The CASAC also discussed the Agency's schedule and process for National Ambient Air Quality Standards (NAAQS) review of criteria pollutants with EPA's Office of Air and Radiation and Office (OAR) and Office of Research and Development (ORD).

Designated
Federal Officer: Dr. Holly Stallworth, Designated Federal Officer

Other EPA Staff: Lydia Wegman, John Hannon, Karen Martin, Dave Guineppe, John Vandenberg, John Hannon, Ellen Rubin, Mary Ross, Vanessa Vu, Tony Maciorowski, Barbara Buckley

Public: John Jansen, Southern Co.
Robert Ukeiley, self-employed
Cindy Langworth, Hunton and Williams
Janice Knowland, American Lung Association
Deborah Shprentz, American Lung Association
Vickie Patton, Environmental Defense Fund

Presentations:

All presentations and public comments may be found posted at the URL below.

- Projected NAAQS Review Schedule
- Role of CASAC in NAAQS Review Process
- Comments on EPA's Statutory Obligations Under the Clean Air Act from Deborah Shprentz, American Lung Association

Webpage:

The meeting agenda, presentations, public comments, the draft CASAC letter on the REA, and the CASAC letter on the NAAQS process may all be found posted at <http://yosemite.epa.gov/sab/sabproduct.nsf/bf498bd32a1c7fdf85257242006dd6cb/fc5aa197bc556875852575070058f40c!OpenDocument&Date=2008-12-19>

Meeting Summary

The discussion followed the issues and general timing as presented in the meeting agenda.

FRIDAY, DECEMBER 19, 2008

Opening of Public Meeting

Dr. Stallworth convened the meeting and explained that CASAC operates under the Federal Advisory Committee Act. Dr. Samet reviewed the agenda and then turned the floor over to the Vickie Patton of the Environmental Defense Fund who gave a public comment stressing the importance of the Clean Air Act's "adequate margin of safety" clause. Janice Knowland of the American Lung Association followed with another public comment, stressing the need to avoid political interference in the NAAQS review process.

Following these public comments, CASAC members turned their attention to the draft letter (posted at the URL above) regarding EPA's *Risk and Exposure Assessment for Review of the Secondary National Ambient Air Quality Standards for Oxides of Nitrogen and Oxides of Sulfur*. Members discussed whether the sequencing of the primary standard review documents with the secondary standard documents was optimal. EPA staff explained that the schedule was generated with a desire to maximize time for the secondary standard review to address the complexity of the issue. The suggestion was made to add some language in the letter referring to the need to establish separate standards to protect ecosystems. One member clarified that a deposition standard would be optimal but that EPA's authority allowed only a concentration-based standard. Members also mused on whether the letter could be reorganized to emphasize major

points, but it was generally agreed that the letter comprised a series of technical points from which a “headline” could not be extracted. The draft REA letter was approved by all members of CASAC with provisional minor edits discussed in the teleconference.

As summarized in the posted presentation “Role of CASAC in NAAQS Review Process,” John Hannon of EPA’s Office of General Counsel then briefed members on the provisions of the Clean Air Act that relate to CASAC’s responsibilities. Following Mr. Hannon, Lydia Wegman of EPA’s Office of Air Quality Planning and Standard made very brief remarks on the draft NAAQS schedule (posted at the URL above).

All participants then turned their attention to the CASAC letter (dated December 16, 2008 and posted at the URL above) to the Administrator on the NAAQS process. In response, EPA staff agreed to try to avoid future delays in the schedule, to provide a “track changes” version of second and third drafts, to provide a more careful documentation of the NAAQS process and to provide charge questions in time for review by the CASAC Chair.

On Behalf of the Committee,
Respectfully Submitted,

Holly Stallworth, Ph.D. /s/
Designated Federal Officer

Certified as True:

Jonathan Samet, M.D. /s/
Chair, Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee
Sulfur Oxides Primary NAAQS Review Panel

NOTE AND DISCLAIMER: The minutes of this public meeting reflect diverse ideas and suggestions offered by committee members during the course of deliberations within the meeting. Such ideas, suggestions, and deliberations do not necessarily reflect definitive consensus advice from the panel members. The reader is cautioned to not rely on the minutes represent final, approved, consensus advice and recommendations offered to the Agency. Such advice and recommendations may be found in the final advisories, commentaries, letters, or reports prepared and transmitted to the EPA Administrator following the public meetings.