

**Summary Minutes of the
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA)
Science Advisory Board (SAB)
Expert Elicitation Advisory Panel Meeting Public Teleconference, April 22, 2009**

Committee Members: (See Roster – Appendix A)

Scheduled Date and Time: April 22, 2009, from 1:00 - 3:00 p.m. (See Federal Register Notice, Appendix B)

Location: By teleconference only.

Purpose: To discuss a draft report reviewing EPA's *Draft Expert Elicitation Task Force White Paper*.

Attendees:

| | |
|--------------------|--|
| Chair: | Dr. James Hammitt |
| Committee Members: | Dr. William Ascher |
| | Dr. Mark Borsuk, |
| | Dr. Wändi Bruine de Bruin |
| | Dr. Roger Cooke |
| | Dr. Scott Ferson |
| | Dr. Christopher H. Frey |
| | Dr. Max Henrion |
| | Dr. Mitchell J. Small |
| | Dr. Katherine Walker |
| | Dr. Thomas S. Wallsten |
| SAB Staff Office: | Dr. Angela Nugent, SAB Staff Office, Designated Federal Officer (DFO) |

Meeting Summary

The discussion addressed the topics included in the Proposed Agenda (See Meeting Agenda - Appendix C) and roughly followed the sequence summarized below.

Opening of Public Teleconference

Dr. Angela Nugent, Designated Federal Officer (DFO) for the SAB Expert Elicitation Advisory Panel, opened the public teleconference. There were no written comments received by the panel and no requests for oral public comment.

Agenda review

The chair of the panel, Dr. James Hammitt, welcomed members and thanked them for their pre-meeting comments. He explained that he had revised the report before the meeting to address many of their comments. He asked participants to focus discussion during the

teleconference on the remaining substantive issues and to send editorial comments by email to the DFO.

Discussion of draft report

Members agreed that the report should contain consensus comments and that additional comments could appear in panel members' individual comments, available on the SAB Web site. The chair asked panel members to carefully examine the draft report language to ensure that the report does not advise the Agency to add language or analyses already contained in the Agency's draft "Expert Elicitation White Paper." Panel members agreed that the introduction to the letter should call on EPA to discuss the strengths and weaknesses of expert elicitation more frankly, as compared with other methods for characterizing or addressing uncertainty.

In discussing the panel's response to the charge question regarding uncertainty, the panel discussed the value of recording experts' rationales for their judgment and how EPA might address the tradeoffs between the benefits of documenting interactions between the elicitor and respondent and the disadvantages (in terms of intrusion on the thought process of the respondents and the cost of documentation). Panel members' views on this issue differed. Panel members agreed however, that the amount of documentation needed varies case-by-case.

Panel members next discussed technical issues related to other topics in the report: the selection of experts, aggregation of responses, and problem structure. The chair asked Drs. Cooke and Borsuk to draft revised text related to conditionality and eliciting probabilistic dependence. Members discussed developing a simpler example to demonstrate this issue. Next, members agreed that they would note in the report that elicitation of public preferences is an appropriate subject for EE and is different from eliciting experts' values, a topic outside the scope of expert elicitation. Members discussed the need to clarify the type of influence diagram EPA should use to structure problems for expert elicitation.

The panel then turned to discussion of findings and recommendations. Members discussed language relating to transparency and use of consistency tests,

The final substantive topic addressed was the transmittal letter to the Administrator. The panel agreed that the transmittal letter should advise EPA to continue exploring expert elicitation and to include only a few other overarching points. The panel agreed that the list of other key recommendations should appear in the introduction to the report.

Next Steps

The Chair committed to revising the draft panel report for member comment within a week.

The teleconference adjourned at 3:00 pm.

Respectfully Submitted:

/Signed/

Angela Nugent
Designated Federal Officer

Certified as True:

/Signed/

James K. Hammitt
Chair

NOTE AND DISCLAIMER: The minutes of this public meeting reflect diverse ideas and suggestions offered by committee members during the course of deliberations within the meeting. Such ideas, suggestions, and deliberations do not necessarily reflect definitive consensus advice from the panel members. The reader is cautioned to not rely on the minutes to represent final, approved, consensus advice and recommendations offered to the Agency. Such advice and recommendations may be found in the final advisories, commentaries, letters, or reports prepared and transmitted to the EPA Administrator following the public meetings.

Appendices

| | |
|------------|-------------------------|
| Appendix A | Roster |
| Appendix B | Federal Register Notice |
| Appendix C | Meeting Agenda |

Appendix A: Roster

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Science Advisory Board Expert Elicitation Advisory Panel

CHAIR

Dr. James K. Hammitt, Professor, Center for Risk Analysis, Harvard University, Boston, MA

MEMBERS

Dr. William Louis Ascher, Donald C. McKenna Professor of Government and Economics, Claremont McKenna College, Claremont, CA

Dr John Bailar, Scholar in Residence, The National Academies, Washington, DC

Dr. Mark Borsuk, Assistant Professor, Engineering Sciences, Thayer School of Engineering, Dartmouth College, Hanover, NH

Dr. Wändi Bruine de Bruin, Research Faculty, Department of Social & Decision Sciences, Carnegie Mellon University, Pittsburgh, PA

Dr Roger Cooke, Professor of Mathematics at Delft University of Technology and Chauncey Starr Senior Fellow for Risk Analysis at Resources for the Future, Resources for the Future, Washington, DC

Dr. John Evans, Senior Lecturer on Environmental Science, Harvard University, Kuwait Public Health Project, 135 Market Street, Unit C, Portsmouth, NH, 03801, Phone: 603-433-3956, Fax: 603-433-4174, (jevans@hsph.harvard.edu)

Dr. Scott Ferson, Senior Scientist, Applied Biomathematics, Setauket , NY

Dr. Paul Fischbeck, Professor, Engineering and Public Policy and Social and Decision Sciences, Carnegie Mellon University, Pittsburgh, PA

Dr. H. Christopher Frey, Professor, Department of Civil, Construction and Environmental Engineering, College of Engineering, North Carolina State University, Raleigh, NC

Dr. Max Henrion, CEO and Associate Professor, Lumina Decision Systems, Inc., Los Gatos, CA

Dr. Alan J. Krupnick, Senior Fellow and Director, Quality of the Environment Division, Resources for the Future, Washington, DC

Dr. Mitchell J. Small, The H. John Heinz III Professor of Environmental Engineering, Department of Civil and Public Policy, Carnegie Mellon University, Pittsburgh, PA

Dr Katherine Walker, Senior Staff Scientist, Health Effects Institute, Boston, MA

Dr. Thomas S. Wallsten, Professor and Chair, Department of Psychology, University of Maryland, College Park, MD

SCIENCE ADVISORY BOARD STAFF

Dr. Angela Nugent, Designated Federal Officer, 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
1400F, Washington, DC, Phone: 202-343-9981, Fax: 202-233-0643, (nugent.angela@epa.gov)

Appendix B: Federal Register Notice

Science Advisory Board Staff Office; Notification of a Public Teleconference of the Science
Advisory Board Expert Elicitation Advisory Panel
PDF Version (1 pp, 65K, About PDF)

[Federal Register: April 1, 2009 (Volume 74, Number 61)]

[Notices]

[Page 14799]

From the Federal Register Online via GPO Access [wais.access.gpo.gov]

[DOCID:fr01ap09-44]

ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

[FRL-8788-6]

Science Advisory Board Staff Office; Notification of a Public
Teleconference of the Science Advisory Board Expert Elicitation
Advisory Panel

AGENCY: Environmental Protection Agency (EPA).

ACTION: Notice.

SUMMARY: The Environmental Protection Agency (EPA or Agency) Science
Advisory Board (SAB) Staff Office announces a public teleconference of
the SAB Expert Elicitation Advisory Panel to discuss a draft report
reviewing EPA's draft Expert Elicitation Task Force White Paper.

DATES: The public teleconference will be held on Wednesday, April 22,
2009, from 1 p.m. to 3 p.m. (Eastern Time).

ADDRESSES: The public teleconference will be conducted by telephone only.

FOR FURTHER INFORMATION CONTACT: Members of the public who wish to
obtain further information about this teleconference may contact Dr.
Angela Nugent, Designated Federal Officer (DFO). Dr. Nugent may be
contacted at the EPA Science Advisory Board (1400F), U.S. Environmental
Protection Agency, 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW., Washington, DC 20460;
or via telephone/voice mail; (202) 343-9981; fax (202) 233-0643; or e-
mail at nugent.angela@epa.gov. General information about the EPA SAB,
as well as any updates concerning the meeting announced in this notice,
may be found on the SAB Web site at <http://www.epa.gov/sab>.

SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION: Pursuant to the Federal Advisory Committee Act, Public Law 92-463, notice is hereby given that the SAB Expert Elicitation Advisory Panel will hold a public teleconference to discuss a draft report reviewing EPA's draft Expert Elicitation Task Force White Paper. The SAB was established by 42 U.S.C. 4365 to provide independent scientific and technical advice to the Administrator on the technical basis for Agency positions and regulations. The SAB is a Federal Advisory Committee chartered under the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA), as amended, 5 U.S.C., App. The SAB will comply with the provisions of FACA and all appropriate SAB Staff Office procedural policies.

Background Information: EPA's Office of the Science Advisor requested SAB review of a draft white paper designed to initiate a thorough discussion of expert elicitation and to investigate how to conduct and use expert elicitation to support EPA regulatory and non-regulatory analyses and decision-making. The SAB Expert Elicitation Advisory Panel met on February 25-26, 2009 (74 FR 5157-5158) to discuss EPA's draft white paper. The Panel will hold a public teleconference to discuss their draft report reviewing EPA's White Paper. Background information on this advisory activity can be found in the Federal Register at 72 FR 35463-35465 and on the SAB Web site at http://yosemite.epa.gov/sab/sabproduct.nsf/fedrgstr_activites/Expert%20Elicitation%20White%20Paper?OpenDocument.

Availability of Meeting Materials: The background materials for this review are available on the EPA Web site at the links provided above in this notice. The draft SAB report will be made available on the SAB Web site in advance of the meeting. See the SAB Web site at <http://www.epa.gov/sab>.

Procedures for Providing Public Input: Interested members of the public may submit relevant written or oral information for the SAB Committee to consider on the topics under review. **Oral Statements:** In general, individuals or groups requesting an oral presentation at a public conference call will be limited to three minutes per speaker, with no more than a total of one half hour for all speakers. Interested parties should contact Dr. Nugent, DFO, in writing (preferably via e-mail) at the contact information noted above, by April 15, 2009 to be placed on a list of public speakers for the meeting. **Written Statements:** Written statements should be received in the SAB Staff Office by April 15, 2009 so that the information may be made available to the SAB Panel members for their consideration. Written statements should be supplied to the DFO in the following formats: One hard copy with original signature, and one electronic copy via e-mail (acceptable file format: Adobe Acrobat PDF, WordPerfect, MS Word, MS PowerPoint, or Rich Text files in IBM-PC/Windows 98/2000/XP format).

Submitters are asked to provide versions of each document submitted with and without signatures, because the SAB Staff Office does not publish documents with signatures on its Web sites.

Accessibility: For information on access or services for

individuals with disabilities, please contact Dr. Nugent at the phone number or e-mail address noted above, preferably at least ten days prior to the teleconference to give EPA as much time as possible to process your request.

Dated: March 26, 2009.
Anthony F. Maciorowski,
Deputy Director, EPA Science Advisory Board Staff Office.
[FR Doc. E9-7298 Filed 3-31-09; 8:45 am]

Appendix C: Agenda
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency – Science Advisory Board (SAB) Staff Office
Science Advisory Board
Expert Elicitation Advisory Panel
Public Teleconference
April 22, 2009
1:00 p.m. - 3:00 p.m. (Eastern Time)
Teleconference Agenda

Purpose: to discuss a draft report reviewing EPA's *Draft Expert Elicitation Task Force White Paper*.

| | | |
|------------|---|---|
| 1:00 p.m.. | Welcome | Dr. Angela Nugent, EPA SAB Staff Office, Designated Federal Officer |
| 1:05 p.m. | Introductions and agenda review | Dr. James K. Hammitt, Chair |
| 1:10 a.m. | Discussion of major comments from panel members <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Report <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Transparency ○ Selecting experts ○ Multi-expert aggregation ○ Other issues relating to the report • Suggested changes to the transmittal letter | Panel members |
| 2::50 p.m. | Summary/Discussion of next steps | Dr. James K. Hammitt |
| 3:00 p.m. | Adjourn the call | |