

**Summary Minutes of the  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee (CASAC)  
Public Teleconference  
May 7, 2010  
10:00am – 2:00pm**

CASAC Members: Dr. Jonathan Samet, Chair  
Dr. Ted Russell  
Dr. Joe Brain  
Dr. Helen Suh

CASAC Particulate  
Review Panel Members: Mr. Ed Avol  
Dr. Morton Lippmann  
Dr. Wayne Cascio  
Dr. David Grantz  
Dr. Robert Phalen  
Dr. Sverre Vedal  
Dr. Frank Speizer  
Mr. Tom Moore  
Dr. Rogene Henderson  
Dr. William Malm  
Mr. Rich Poirot  
Dr. Helen Suh  
Dr. Lowell Ashbaugh

Purpose: To review the draft letter on the *Policy Assessment for the Review of the Particulate Matter NAAQS* (First Draft, March 2010).

Designated Federal Officer: Dr. Holly Stallworth, Designated Federal Officer

Other EPA Staff: Lydia Wegman, Karen Martin, Beth Hassett-Sipple, Pradeep Rajan, Scott Jenkins, Zach Pekar, Vicki Sandiford, Meredith Lassiter, Bryan Hubbell, Marc Pitchford (NOAA), Lillian Bradley, Alex MacPherson, Steve Silverman, Lindsay Stanek, Jen Richmond-Bryant, Mary Ross, Barbara Buckley, Erin Hines, Doug Johns, Tom Luben, Steve Dutton, Jason Sacks, Greg Miller

Public: Ted Steichen (American Petroleum Institute), John Jansen (Southern Company), Deborah Shprentz (American Lung Association), Sonja Sax\* (Gradient Corporation), George Deeley (Shell), Greg Schaefer (ArchCoal), Deborah Shprentz (American Lung Association), Timothy French (Engine Manufacturers Association), Tamara McCann Thies (National Cattlemen's Beef Association), Jill Davidson (Archer Daniels Midland Company), John J. Jansen (Southern Company), Linda Wilson (NY Attorney General's

Office), Tim Morphy (Teledyne), Rose Haroian (River Services), Pat Fritz (NY Department of Health), Andrew Childers (Inside EPA)

Requests for Call-in Numbers: Phillip Wakelyn (National Cotton Council), Scott DiBiase (Pinal County, AZ), Doug Austin (Institute of Clean Air Companies), Thomas J. Grahame (U.S. Department of Energy), Mike Meyer (Met One Instruments), Robin Bravender (Greenwire), Anthony Lacey (Inside EPA), Kathleen M. Nauss (affiliation not given), Kurt Blasé (Blasé Law Group), Heidi King (OMB). *(These individuals requested the teleconference number but did not announce themselves on the line.)*

Meeting Materials and Meeting Webpage:

The materials listed below may be found on the meeting webpage at:

<http://yosemite.epa.gov/sab/sabproduct.nsf/bf498bd32a1c7fd85257242006dd6cb/6b5b8155560e19e3852577040067fb02!OpenDocument&Date=2010-05-07>

- Agenda
- Federal Register Notice
- Draft 4/30/10 CASAC Letter on *Policy Assessment for the Review of the PM NAAQS - First External Review Draft (March 2010)*
- Public Comments (dated April 30, 2010) from the National Cattleman's Beef Association and National Mining Association

Meeting Summary

The discussion followed the plan presented in the meeting agenda.

**FRIDAY, MAY 7, 2010**

Dr. Stallworth convened the meeting and explained that CASAC operates under the Federal Advisory Committee Act. Dr. Karen Martin told the panel that the schedule for producing the second draft Policy Assessment had been extended so that EPA might consider and incorporate the panel's input and grapple with the complexities of PM issues. Following the late July 2010 meeting, EPA expects to propose a standard in February of 2011 and issue a final standard in October 2011.

Sonja Sax on behalf of the American Petroleum Institute presented public comments that criticized the recommendation by CASAC for giving consideration to the 10<sup>th</sup> percentile as the lower bound for the annual and 24-hour PM<sub>2.5</sub> standards. Dr. Sax also criticized CASAC's recommendation that EPA eliminate all spatial averaging, saying that CASAC should instead encourage EPA to explore alternatives [to the "highest monitor"] that are more representative of population exposure.

Dr. Samet turned the panel's attention to the draft letter. Minor edits were offered throughout the letter. In response to a question from Dr. Martin, panelists explained that there are time-series studies that have confidence bounds on the concentration-response functions themselves. The panel also discussed the regional differences in attainment

that would accrue from any tightening of the PM<sub>10</sub> standard. Panelists pondered the possibility of an exclusion indicator that would allow coarse particle levels to be higher in some parts of the country than others. In response to the panel's thoughts about using the ratio of PM<sub>2.5</sub> to PM<sub>10</sub>, one panelist pointed out that unless EPA's monitors were using the same inlets for PM<sub>10</sub> and PM<sub>2.5</sub>, the data would be suspect. Dr. Scott Jenkins of EPA talked about EPA's forthcoming NCore multipollutant monitoring network that integrates several advanced measurement systems for particles, pollutant gases and meteorology. Dr. Jenkins said about 80 NCore sites will have mass measurements of PM<sub>10-2.5</sub>. Dr. Jenkins also said a Federal Reference Method for coarse PM issued in 2006 will be implemented soon.

Given the imperfections of data currently available, Dr. Samet asked the panel to focus on what suggestions for additional analyses would be helpful for the second draft *Policy Assessment* to strengthen the body of evidence to be considered for this rulemaking.

Dr. Samet promised to add a sentence in the letter to the Administrator highlighting the panel's concerns about regional differences in attainment and the possibility of disparate regional impacts from a lower PM<sub>10</sub> standard.

Dr. Stallworth said she would send a revised file to Dr. Samet incorporating edits discussed on the call. Dr. Samet would add a sentence highlighting the panel's thoughts on PM<sub>10</sub>. Dr. Vedal promised to add language on the need for additional analyses about the effect of a coarse particle standard on different regions of the country. Following these revisions, the draft letter would be circulated to the panel before it is transmitted to the EPA Administrator.

The meeting adjourned at 11:20am.

On Behalf of the Committee,  
Respectfully Submitted,

Holly Stallworth, Ph.D. /s/  
Designated Federal Officer

Certified as True:

Jonathan Samet, M.D. /s/  
Chair, Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee  
Sulfur Oxides Primary NAAQS Review Panel

NOTE AND DISCLAIMER: The minutes of this public meeting reflect diverse ideas and suggestions offered by committee members during the course of deliberations within the meeting. Such ideas, suggestions, and deliberations do not necessarily reflect definitive consensus advice from the panel members. The reader is cautioned to not rely on the minutes represent final, approved, consensus advice and recommendations offered to the Agency. Such advice and recommendations may be found in the final advisories, commentaries, letters, or reports prepared and transmitted to the EPA Administrator following the public meetings