

**U.S. Environmental Protection Agency**  
**Committee: Advisory Council on Clean Air Compliance Analysis (Council)**  
**Health Effects Subcommittee (HES)**  
**Public Teleconference**

**Summary Minutes of Public Teleconference**  
**Date: October 30, 2003**

**Subcommittee Members:** (See Roster - Attachment A.)

**Date and Time:** 12:00-2:00 pm, October 30, 2003 (See Federal Register Notice - Attachment B).

**Location:** By teleconference only

**Purpose:** The purpose of the call was to discuss a draft report entitled "Advisory on Plans for Health Effects Analysis in the Analytical Plan for EPA's Second Prospective Analysis - Benefits and Costs of the Clean Air Act, 1990-2020; An Advisory by the Advisory Council for Clean Air Compliance Analysis," developed during the HES public meeting on August 27-29, 2003.

**Attendees:** Chair: Dr. Bart Ostro, HES Members: Dr. Rebecca Parkin, Dr. Morton Lippmann; Dr. Patrick Kinney, Dr. Michael Kleinman, Dr. Nino Kuenzli; Council Member, Ms. Lauraine Chestnut; Members of the Special Council Panel for the Review of the Third 812 Analysis, Drs. Warner North and Thomas Wallsten.

SAB Staff: Dr. Angela Nugent, Designated Federal Official.

Other Persons Attending: From EPA: James DeMocker, Harvey Richmond, Bryan Hubbell, Ron Evans, Zachary Pekar, Sharon Phillips, Monica Alvarez,; EPA Contractors: Jim Neumann, Katie Walker, Henry Roman, IEC; Others: Margo Schwab, Office of Management and Budget, Barbara Warren, consultant to the Clean Air Task Force, Neil Shah, Inside Washington.

**Meeting Summary:**

The discussion generally followed the issues and timing as presented in the meeting Agenda (see Meeting Agenda - Attachment C). The teleconference lasted until 2:00 pm. There were no written comments submitted to the Subcommittee, and there was no written request to present public comments during the discussion.

**Opening of Meeting and Roll Call and Administrative Update** - Dr. Angela Nugent, Designated Federal Official (DFO) opened the session at 2:00 pm and took roll. She informed the Subcommittee that Dr. Ostro had decided to recuse himself from discussions of Charge Question 29 concerning EPA's plans for a pilot project on expert elicitation on the topic of premature mortality that may be related to exposures to particulate matter. Dr. Nino Kuenzli had agreed to chair the Subcommittee discussions of that topic.

## Agency Comment

Mr. James DeMocker opened the teleconference with a brief discussion of legal issues that had arisen that may affect the Congressionally mandated requirement for periodic reports to Congress. He is assuming, despite this change, that there will be no change in EPA's commitment to produce 812 Analyses and no change in schedule. The legal issue, in his view, presented opportunities and challenges and potential new policy applications that will be discussed with the Council.

Dr. Bryan Hubbell commented on the HES draft report. He made comments related to: (1) the specifications of grid size in the response to Charge Question 11; (2) the pooling of information from different studies related to asthma; (3) the concentration-response function that the HES recommended using from the Pope study; and (4) factors that can affect incident rates for narrowly defined age groups

## Discussion of the October 21, 2003 Draft

Dr. Ostro discussed the draft letter to the new Administrator. HES members supported including a mention of the major categories of effects that will be left unquantified, such as cardiovascular morbidity from long-term exposure. HES members provided no comment on the draft response to Charge Question 11a. Concerning Question 11b, Source-Specific Concentration-Response (C-R) Functions, HES members discussed the potential significance of motor vehicle exhaust for toxicological assessment. Concerning Question 11c, extrapolation to other age groups, the group agreed that some extrapolation was appropriate. Concerning Question 11f, the Subcommittee agreed on some pooling of asthma rates. Dr. Kuenzli agreed to redraft some of the section on asthma.

The Subcommittee discussed clarifying language relating to prospective cohort studies, alternative analysis, and cessation lag. An issue was raised for consideration related to consistency between the approach to cessation lag and the calculation of life year lost. The Subcommittee also discussed further developing the text on alternatives to the base estimate.

Dr. Ostro left the call after these discussions.

## Subcommittee Discussion of Charge Question 29 in October 21 2003 Draft

Dr. Kuenzli began the discussion with two major points: (1) how to characterize the choice of experts and whether to comment on whether experts involved in the National Academy of Sciences Report should be involved and (2) whether additional or different experts were needed. The Subcommittee discussed the need for more experts to reflect a diversity of views.

The Subcommittee noted the receipt of the EPA protocol for the expert elicitation, received immediately before the teleconference. Members expressed preference for not commenting on this document. Dr. Thomas Wallsten noted a number of comments. He noted

that in Part 3, experts are primarily asked what evidence supports their opinions. He advised that experts also be asked about what evidence contradicts their opinions and why others might disagree. Several Subcommittee members agreed.

Dr. Wallsten also noted that in Part 4 of the protocol, the-scenario is very precisely specified and refers to the “percent reduction in” sources of uncertainty. He advised that the Agency use a simpler question that “takes less mental arithmetic” and involves direct answers “SRA Style.” Dr. Wallsten noted that he provided these comments in writing to the DFO before the teleconference.

Action items:

1. Subcommittee members to provide suggested language changes to questions 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 17, and 29 to the DFO by November 14<sup>th</sup>.

The teleconference was adjourned at 2:00 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted:

/s/ Angela Nugent  
Angela Nugent  
Designated Federal Official

Certified as True:

/s/ Bart Ostro  
Bart Ostro  
Chair

/s/ Nino Kuenzli  
Nino Kuenzli  
HES Member

NOTE AND DISCLAIMER: The minutes of this public meeting reflect diverse ideas and suggestions offered by the Council Subcommittee to the Agency during the course of deliberations within the meeting. Such ideas, suggestions and deliberations do not necessarily reflect definitive consensus advice from the Council. The reader is cautioned to not rely on the minutes to represent final, approved, consensus advice and recommendations offered to the Agency. Such advice and recommendations may be found in the final advisories, commentaries, letters, or reports prepared and transmitted to the EPA Administrator following the public meetings.

Attachment A  
**U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
Science Advisory Board  
Advisory Council on Clean Air Compliance Analysis  
Health Effects Subcommittee**

**CHAIR**

**Dr. Bart Ostro**, Chief, Air Pollution Epidemiology Unit, California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (OEHHA), Oakland, CA

**OTHER SAB MEMBERS**

**Dr. Rebecca Parkin**, Associate Research Professor, Environmental and Occupational Health, Public Health and Health Services, The George Washington University, Washington, DC  
Member: Integrated Human Exposure Committee  
Executive Committee

**CONSULTANTS**

**Mr. John Fintan Hurley**, Research Director, Institute of Occupational Medicine (IOM), Edinburgh, , UK

**Dr. Patrick Kinney**, Associate Professor, Department of Environmental Health Sciences, Mailman School of Public Health , Columbia University, New York, NY

**Dr. Michael Kleinman**, Professor, Department of Community and Environmental Medicine, College of Medicine, University of California, Irvine, CA

**Dr. Nino Kuenzli**, Professor, Department of Preventive Medicine, Keck School of Medicine, University of Southern California, Los Angeles, CA

**Dr. Morton Lippmann**, Professor, Nelson Institute of Environmental Medicine, New York University School of Medicine, Tuxedo, NY

**SCIENCE ADVISORY BOARD STAFF**

**Dr. Angela Nugent**, Designated Federal Officer, 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW, Washington, DC, Phone: 202-564-4562, Fax: 202-501-0323, (nugent.angela@epa.gov)

Attachment B  
Federal Register Notice

Science Advisory Board Staff Office; Change to an Earlier Meeting Notice: Advisory Council on Clean Air Compliance Analysis; Notification of Postponement of a Public Meeting and Public Teleconference for the Air Quality Modeling Subcommittee and Change in Date and Time for the Health Effects Subcommittee

[Federal Register: October 21, 2003 (Volume 68, Number 203)]

[Notices]

[Page 60100-60101]

From the Federal Register Online via GPO Access [[wais.access.gpo.gov](http://wais.access.gpo.gov)]

[DOCID:fr21oc03-62]

-----  
ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY  
[FRL-7576-9]

Science Advisory Board Staff Office; Change to an Earlier Meeting Notice: Advisory Council on Clean Air Compliance Analysis; Notification of Postponement of a Public Meeting and Public Teleconference for the Air Quality Modeling Subcommittee and Change in Date and Time for the Health Effects Subcommittee

AGENCY: Environmental Protection Agency (EPA).

ACTION: Notice; correction.

-----  
SUMMARY: The Environmental Protection Agency, Science Advisory Board (SAB) Staff Office, published a document in the Federal Register (October 7, 2003, 68 FR 57890-57891) announcing a public meeting for the Council's Air Quality Modeling Subcommittee (AQMS) and several public teleconferences, including public teleconferences for the Council's Health Effects Subcommittee (HES) and the AQMS. The Staff Office is now announcing that the AQMS meeting and teleconference are postponed to a date and time to be identified and is also announcing a change in the date and time of the HES teleconference.

DATES: October 30, 2003. A public teleconference for the Health Effects Subcommittee (HES) will be held from 12 p.m. to 2 p.m. (Eastern Time).

FOR FURTHER INFORMATION CONTACT: Members of the public who wish to obtain the call-in number and access code to participate in the teleconference meeting may contact Ms. Sandra Friedman, EPA Science Advisory Board Staff Office, at telephone/voice mail: (202) 564-2526; or via e-mail at: [friedman.sandra@epa.gov](mailto:friedman.sandra@epa.gov), or Ms. Delores Darden, EPA Science Advisory Board Staff Office at telephone/voice

[[Page 60101]]

mail: (202) 564-2282; or via e-mail at [darden.delores@epa.gov](mailto:darden.delores@epa.gov). Any member of the public wishing further information regarding the HES may contact Dr. Angela Nugent, Designated Federal Officer (DFO), U.S. EPA Science Advisory Board (1400A), 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW., Washington, DC 20460; by telephone/voice mail at (202) 564-4562; or by e-mail at [nugent.angela@epa.gov](mailto:nugent.angela@epa.gov).

Dated: October 15, 2003.  
Vanessa T. Vu,  
Director, Science Advisory Board Staff Office.  
[FR Doc. 03-26538 Filed 10-20-03; 8:45 am]  
BILLING CODE 6560-50-P

Attachment C  
Meeting Agenda

**U.S. EPA Advisory Council on Clean Air Compliance Analysis  
Health Effects Subcommittee (HES)  
Advisory Teleconference  
October 30, 12:00-2:00 Eastern time**

**Purpose of Meeting:** to discuss a draft report entitled "Advisory on Plans for Health Effects Analysis in the Analytical Plan for EPA's Second Prospective Analysis Benefits and Costs of the Clean Air Act, 1990-2020; An Advisory by the Advisory Council for Clean Air Compliance Analysis," developed during the HES public meeting on August 27-29, 2003, which was announced in the FEDERAL REGISTER on July 30, 2003 (68 FR 44766-44767).

Draft Agenda

12:00-12:10	Opening of Meeting and Roll Call and Administrative Update	Dr. Angela Nugent, Designated Federal Officer, SAB Staff Office
12:10-12:15	Welcome, Agenda Review	Dr. Bart Ostro, Chair
12:15-12:25	Agency Comment	Mr. James DeMocker, EPA
12:25-1:10	Discussion of the October 21, 2003 Draft by Charge Question	Subcommittee Discussion led by Dr. Bart Ostro
1:15-1:20	Next Steps	Dr. Bart Ostro
1:20-1:55	Subcommittee Discussion of Charge Question 29 in October 21 2003 Draft	Subcommittee Discussion led by Dr. Nino Kuenzli
1:55-2:00	Next steps	Dr. Nino Kuenzli
2:00	Adjournment of Meeting	Dr. Angela Nugent