

**Minutes of the Closed Meeting on August 9-10, 2011**

**U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA)  
Science Advisory Board (SAB)  
Scientific and Technological Achievement Awards Committee (STAA)**

Date and Time: Tuesday, August 9, 2011, 8:00 A.M. – 6:00 P.M. ET, and Wednesday, August 10, 2011, 8:00 A.M. – 4:30 P.M. ET

Location: Madison Hotel, 1177 15th St. NW, Washington, DC 20005, and via Teleconference.

Purpose: The purpose of the August 9-10, 2011 closed meeting was for the SAB Scientific and Technological Achievement Awards (STAA) Committee to review scientific publications nominated by EPA managers and make recommendations to the Administrator for STAA awards, and to discuss possible improvements to the process and program.

Participants:

STAA: SAB STAA Committee (See Roster, Attachment A):

Dr. Taylor Eighmy, Chair  
Dr. Fred Benfield  
Dr. James Bus  
Dr. Peter Chapman  
Dr. George Daston  
Dr. Joel Ducoste  
Dr. John P. Giesy  
Dr. Cynthia Harris  
Dr. Dale Hattis  
Dr. Arpad Horvath  
Dr. Michael T. Kleinman  
Dr. Wayne Landis  
Dr. Thomas W. La Point  
Dr. Desmond F. Lawler  
Dr. Reid Lifset  
Dr. Randy Maddalena  
Dr. Paulette Middleton  
Dr. Fred J. Miller  
Dr. John R. Smith  
Dr. Robert Twiss  
Dr. Yousheng Zeng  
Dr. Barbara Zielinska

EPA SAB Staff: Mr. Edward Hanlon, Designated Federal Officer  
Dr. Vanessa Vu, Director, EPA Science Advisory  
Board Staff Office

### **Meeting Summary**

The meeting was announced in the Federal Register<sup>1</sup>. A summary of the meeting follows.

EPA's Office of Research and Development (ORD) submitted a total of 134 nominations comprised of 185 publications in 13 out of 14 science and technology categories for review by the SAB STAA Committee for the 2011 STAA awards.

The fourteen topical categories and total number of nominations per category that were submitted to the Committee for review were:

- Control Systems and Technology - 3
- Ecological Research - 24
- Energy and the Environment - 1
- Environmental Policy and Decisionmaking Studies - 6
- Health Effects Research and Human Health Risk Assessment - 24
- Homeland Security - 2
- Industry and the Environment - 2
- Integrated Risk Assessment - 6
- Monitoring and Measurement Methods - 22
- Other Environmental Research - 3
- Review Articles - 20
- Risk Management and Ecosystem Restoration - 0
- Sustainability and Innovation - 3
- Transport and Fate - 18

In the weeks prior to the meeting, Committee Members reviewed the nominations and reported their initial recommendations to the Designated Federal Officer (DFO) who entered this information into a master table.

### **August 9, 2011**

#### **Opening Statements and Welcome**

Mr. Ed Hanlon, the DFO, opened the meeting, and made a brief opening statement noting that the STAA is a Federal Advisory Committee under the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA). He noted the meeting and teleconference was closed to the public because it was concerned with selecting which employees are deserving of awards, a personnel matter with privacy concerns, which is exempt from public disclosure pursuant to section 10(d) of FACA and section (c)(6) of the Government in the Sunshine Act. He noted that

the SAB Staff Office had assessed whether there were any conflict-of-interest or appearance of a lack of impartiality issues for any of the STAA committee members for this review. He noted that in the case where conflicts or potential conflicts of interest, or appearance of a lack of impartiality issues existed, Committee members would recuse themselves from the review and discussion process. Mr. Hanlon also noted that minutes were being taken to summarize discussions and action items in accordance with requirements under FACA. Dr. Vanessa Vu also welcomed everyone for their attendance and participation. Mr. Hanlon then turned the meeting over to the Chair, Dr. Taylor Eighmy.

Dr. Eighmy welcomed everyone and noted there were four new members to the Committee (Drs. Daston, Ducoste, Horvath, and La Point). He also noted this was an Advisory effort where a report seeking consensus would be prepared.

The Committee then discussed each nomination and the reviewers' initial rankings were verbalized and recorded. Each nomination was assigned to at least two Committee members for review. In any instance where there was a significant difference between recommendations for award, the nomination was slated for additional review by one or more Committee members, and reserved for later discussion by the Committee members.

### **August 10, 2011**

The Committee continued discussion on each nomination and the reviewers' initial rankings were verbalized and recorded, until all nominations received initial rankings by the Committee.

The Committee discussed widely divergent rankings and bundling of nominations, and combined eight nominations into four nominations due to topic similarities of publications within the nominations. The Committee compared their initial rankings, category by category, and reviewed the final award recommendations from the previous several years of STAA awards to provide a level of comfort that the Committee had "calibrated" its initial recommendations correctly. The Committee also considered nominations which had been flagged for further discussion and a few other nominations which the Committee Members wished to reconsider.

The Committee then led a discussion that reviewed all rankings for each nomination, and developed Committee consensus on the final recommendations for awards. Of the 130 nominations (including bundled nominations) that were considered for award, the STAA Committee recommended 51 nominations for monetary awards and another 44 as deserving of honorable mention. Of the nominations recommended for monetary awards, 3 were recommended for Level I, the highest award; 13 for Level II; and 35 for Level III.

Dr. Vu and Dr. Eighmy thanked the STAA Committee members for their efforts. With the meeting business concluded, the Designated Federal Officer Ed Hanlon adjourned the meeting at 4:30 pm ET.

Respectfully Submitted:

*/signed/*

---

Mr. Edward Hanlon  
Designated Federal Officer  
Scientific and Technological  
Achievement Award Committee

Certified as Accurate:

*/signed/*

---

Dr. Taylor Eighmy, Chair

NOTE AND DISCLAIMER: The minutes of this closed meeting reflect diverse ideas and suggestions offered by Committee members during the course of deliberations within the meeting. Such ideas, suggestions and deliberations do not necessarily reflect consensus advice from the Committee members. The reader is cautioned to not rely on the minutes to represent final, approved, consensus advice and recommendations offered to the Agency. Such advice and recommendations may be found in the final advisories, commentaries, letters or reports prepared and transmitted to the EPA Administrator following the meeting.

**Attachments:**

A. 2011 SAB STAA Committee Roster

**Materials Cited**

The following meeting materials are available on the SAB website:  
<http://www.epa.gov/sab>, at the August 9-10, 2011 meeting website:  
<http://yosemite.epa.gov/sab/sabproduct.nsf/a84bfee16cc358ad85256ccd006b0b4b/bcc20c48acc09d35852578da004e3b10!OpenDocument&Date=2011-08-09>:

<sup>1</sup> Federal Register Notice announcing the meeting.

## **ATTACHMENT A – ROSTER**

### **U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Science Advisory Board SAB 2010 Scientific and Technological Achievement Awards Committee (STAA)**

#### **CHAIR**

**Dr. T. Taylor Eighmy**, Vice President for Research, Office of the Vice President for Research, Texas Tech University, Lubbock, TX

#### **MEMBERS**

**Dr. Ernest F. Benfield**, Professor of Ecology and Associated Head, Department of Biological Sciences, Virginia Tech, Blacksburg, VA

**Dr. James Bus**, Director of External Technology, Toxicology and Environmental Research and Consulting, The Dow Chemical Company, Midland, MI

**Dr. Peter Chapman**, Principal and Senior Environmental Scientist, Golder Associates Ltd., Burnaby, BC, Canada

**Dr. George Daston**, Victor Mills Society Research Fellow, Product Safety and Regulatory Affairs, Procter & Gamble, Cincinnati, OH

**Dr. Joel Ducoste**, Professor, Department of Civil, Construction, and Environmental Engineering, North Carolina State University, Raleigh, NC

**Dr. John P. Giesy**, Professor and Canada Research Chair in Environmental Toxicology, Department of Veterinary Biomedical Sciences and Toxicology Centre, University of Saskatchewan, Saskatoon, Canada; and Emeritus Distinguished Professor of Zoology, Michigan State University, East Lansing, MI

**Dr. Cynthia M. Harris**, Director and Professor, Institute of Public Health, Florida A&M University, Tallahassee, FL

**Dr. Dale Hattis**, Research Professor with the George Perkins Marsh Institute, Clark University, Worcester, MA

**Dr. Arpad Horvath**, Professor, Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering, University of California – Berkeley, Berkeley, CA

**Dr. Michael T. Kleinman**, Professor and Co-Director of the Air Pollution Health Effects Laboratory, Department of Medicine, Division of Occupational and Environmental Medicine, University of California, Irvine, Irvine, CA

**Dr. Wayne Landis**, Professor and Director, Institute of Environmental Toxicology, Huxley College of the Environment, Western Washington University, Bellingham, WA

**Dr. Thomas W. La Point**, Professor, Department of Biological Sciences, University of North Texas, Denton, TX

**Dr. Desmond F. Lawler**, Distinguished Teaching Professor and Nasser I. Al-Rashid Chair in Civil Engineering, Department of Civil, Architectural and Environmental Engineering, University of Texas at Austin, Austin, TX

**Dr. Randy Maddalena**, Scientist, Environmental Energy Technologies Division, Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory, Berkeley, CA

**Dr. Paulette Middleton**, Creator and President, Panorama Pathways, Boulder, CO

**Dr. Fred J. Miller**, Independent Consultant, Fred J. Miller and Associates LLC, Cary, NC

**Dr. John R. Smith**, Division Manager, Environmental Science and Sustainable Technology, Alcoa Inc., Alcoa Center, PA

**Dr. Robert Twiss**, Professor of Environmental Planning Emeritus, University of California, Berkeley, Berkeley, CA

**Dr. Yousheng Zeng**, Air Quality Services Director, Providence Engineering and Environmental Group LLC, Baton Rouge, LA

**Dr. Barbara Zielinska**, Research Professor and Director, Organic Analytical Laboratory, Division of Atmospheric Sciences, Desert Research Institute (DRI), Reno, NV

#### **SCIENCE ADVISORY BOARD STAFF**

**Mr. Edward Hanlon**, Designated Federal Officer, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Washington, DC