

**Summary Minutes of the
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA)
Science Advisory Board (SAB)
Committee on Valuing the Protection of Ecological Systems and Services
Public Teleconference**

Committee Members: (See Roster – Attachment A)

Scheduled Date and Time: 12:30 p.m. to 2:30 p.m., January 20, 2004 (See *Federal Register* Notice - Attachment B)

Location: By Teleconference

Purpose: The purpose of this meeting was to 1) to plan its future work, including workshops and advisory meetings and 2) to hear and discuss reports from Committee Theme Groups.

Attendees: Chair: Dr. Domenico Grasso

Committee Members: Dr. William Ascher
Dr. Gregory Biddinger
Dr. Ann Bostrom
Dr. James Boyd
Dr. Terry Daniel
Dr. Robert Huggett
Dr. Louis Pitelka
Dr. Stephen Polasky
Dr. Holmes Rolston
Dr. Mark Sagoff
Dr. Kathleen Segerson
Dr. Robert Stavins
Dr. Valerie Thomas

Consultant to the Committee: Dr. Joseph Arvai

SAB Staff: Dr. Angela Nugent, Designated Federal Officer

Also on the call:

Dr. Sabrina Lovell, EPA; Dr. Clifford Duke, Ecological Society of America

Meeting Summary

The discussion departed from the Meeting Agenda (See Meeting Agenda - Attachment C) as described below. The teleconference lasted until 12:55 p.m.

Opening of Public Teleconference

Dr. Angela Nugent, Designated Federal Officer (DFO) for the SAB Committee on Valuing the Protection of Ecological Systems and Services, opened the meeting at 12:30 p.m. and took the roll.

Discussion of Chair's Decision to Defer the Teleconference Call and Calls Planned for January 21, 2004 and January 22, 2004

Dr. Grasso opened the meeting by stating a decision to defer the agenda for the teleconference call and also the public teleconferences planned for later in the week until a later time. The hoped-for progress in advancing the work of the Committee had not been made because of the difficulty in addressing themes without face-to-face meetings.

He asked theme group leaders to prepare write-ups describing the work of their team by January 31st. A good model for such a write-up would be the description prepared by the "Values in a Democratic Society" theme group. The write-ups from theme groups and their suggestions for next steps to be taken by the Committee would be considered by the Steering Group to be formed for the Committee. Dr. Grasso expressed the intention for the Steering Group to meet face-to-face by mid February. The Steering Group might then suggest reorganizing the work of the Committee. The theme groups had not been intended as permanent structures for conducting the Committee's work, only as initial planning mechanisms. If the Theme Groups had an agenda that made a compelling case for the need for a face-to-face planning meeting, the Theme Group leader could work with the DFO to explore SAB staff Office support for that face-to-face meeting.

Committee members spoke of their support for this plan for proceeding.

Several members suggested issues for the Steering Group to consider. This issues included: 1) identifying the best process for advancing the Committee's work and advocating for that process if resource support for it might be in question; and 2) focusing and refining the broad charge given to the Committee.

Dr. Grasso thanked Committee members. The teleconference was adjourned at 12:55 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted:
/Signed/

Angela Nugent

Designated Federal Officer

Certified as True:
/Signed/

Domenico Grasso
Chair

NOTE AND DISCLAIMER: The minutes of this public meeting reflect diverse ideas and suggestions offered by the Panel members during the course of deliberations within the meeting. Such ideas, suggestions, and deliberations do not necessarily reflect definitive consensus advice from the panel members. The reader is cautioned to not rely on the minutes to represent final, approved, consensus advice and recommendations offered to the Agency. Such advice and recommendations may be found in the final advisories, commentaries, letters, or reports prepared and transmitted to the EPA Administrator following the public meetings.

Attachments

Attachment A	Roster
Attachment B	Federal Register Notice
Attachment C	Meeting Agenda

Attachment A: Roster

**U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Science Advisory Board
Committee on Valuing the Protection of Ecological Systems and Services**

CHAIR

Dr. Domenico Grasso, Rosemary Bradford Hewlett Professor and Chair, Picker Engineering Program, Smith College, Northampton, MA

Also Member: Executive Committee
Environmental Engineering Committee

SAB MEMBERS

Dr. William Louis Ascher, Dean of the Faculty, Bauer Center, Claremont McKenna College, Claremont, CA

Dr. Gregory Biddinger, Environmental Sciences Advisor, Exxon Mobil Refining and Supply Company, Fairfax, VA

Also Member: Ecological Processes and Effects Committee

Dr. Ann Bostrom, Associate Professor, School of Public Policy, Georgia Institute of Technology, Atlanta, GA

Dr. James Boyd, Senior Fellow, Director, Energy & Natural Resources Division, Resources for the Future, Washington, DC

Dr. Robert Costanza, Professor/Director, Gund Institute for Ecological Economics, School of Natural Resources, University of Vermont, Burlington, VT

Dr. Terry Daniel, Professor of Psychology and Natural Resources, Department of Psychology, Environmental Perception Laboratory, University of Arizona, Tucson, AZ

Dr. A. Myrick Freeman, Research Professor of Economics, Department of Economics, Bowdoin College, Brunswick, ME

Dr. Dennis Grossman, Vice President for Science, Science Division, NatureServe, Arlington, VA

Dr. Geoffrey Heal, Paul Garrett Professor of Public Policy and Business Responsibility, Columbia Business School, Columbia University, New York, NY

Dr. Robert Huggett, Vice President for Research and Graduate Studies, Office of Vice President for Research and Graduate Studies, Michigan State University, East Lansing, MI

Dr. Klaus Lackner, Ewing Worzel Professor of Geophysics, Earth and Environmental Engineering, Columbia University, New York, NY

Dr. Douglas E. MacLean, Professor, Department of Philosophy, University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill, NC

Dr. Harold Mooney, Paul S. Achilles Professor of Environmental Biology, Department of Biological Sciences, Stanford University, Stanford, CA

Dr. Richard Norgaard, Professor of Energy and Resources, Energy and Resources Program, Agricultural and Resource Economics, University of California at Berkeley, Berkeley, CA
Also Member: Environmental Economics Advisory Committee

Dr. Louis F. Pitelka, Director and Professor, Appalachian Laboratory, University of Maryland Center for Environmental Science, Frostburg, MD

Dr. Stephen Polasky, Fesler-Lampert Professor of Ecological/Environmental Economics, Department of Applied Economics, University of Minnesota, St. Paul, MN
Also Member: Environmental Economics Advisory Committee

Dr. Paul G. Risser, Chancellor, Oklahoma State Regents for Higher Education, Oklahoma City, OK

Dr. Holmes Rolston, University Distinguished Professor, Department of Philosophy, Colorado State University, Fort Collins, CO

Dr. Joan Roughgarden, Professor, Biological Sciences and Evolutionary Biology, Stanford University, Stanford, CA

Dr. Mark Sagoff, Senior Research Scholar, Institute for Philosophy and Public Policy, School of Public Affairs, University of Maryland, College Park, MD

Dr. Kathleen Segerson, Professor, Department of Economics, University of Connecticut, Storrs, CT

Also Member: Environmental Economics Advisory Committee

Dr. Paul Slovic, Professor, Department of Psychology, Decision Research, Eugene, OR

Dr. V. Kerry Smith, University Distinguished Professor, Department of Agricultural and Resource Economics, College of Agriculture and Life Sciences, North Carolina State University, Raleigh, NC

Also Member: Advisory Council on Clean Air Compliance Analysis

Dr. Robert Stavins, Albert Pratt Professor of Business and Government, Environment and Natural Resources Program, John F. Kennedy School of Government, Harvard University, Cambridge, MA

Also Member: Environmental Economics Advisory Committee

Dr. Valerie Thomas, Research Scientist, Princeton Environmental Institute, Princeton University, Princeton, NJ

Also Member: Environmental Engineering Committee

Dr. Barton H. (Buzz) Thompson, Jr., Robert E. Paradise Professor of Natural Resources Law and Vice Dean, Stanford Law School, Stanford University, Stanford, CA

SCIENCE ADVISORY BOARD STAFF

Dr. Angela Nugent, Designated Federal Officer, 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW, Washington, DC, Phone: 202-564-4562, Fax: 202-501-0323, (nugent.angela@epa.gov)

Attachment B: Federal Register Notice

Science Advisory Board (SAB) Staff Office Notification of Multiple Upcoming Meetings

[Federal Register: January 6, 2004 (Volume 69, Number 3)]

[Notices]

[Page 657-658]

From the Federal Register Online via GPO Access [wais.access.gpo.gov]

[DOCID:fr06ja04-81]

ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

[FRL-7607-4]

Science Advisory Board (SAB) Staff Office Notification of Multiple Upcoming Meetings

AGENCY: Environmental Protection Agency (EPA).

ACTION: Notice.

SUMMARY: The Environmental Protection Agency Science Advisory Board (SAB) Staff Office announces upcoming multiple teleconferences of:

(1) **SAB Committee on Valuing the Protection of Ecological Systems and Services: Public teleconferences to plan its future work, including a workshop and advisory meeting.**

(2) **SAB Multimedia, Multipathway, and Multireceptor Risk Assessment (SAB 3MRA) Modeling System Panel: Public teleconferences to review drafts and finalize its report.**

(3) **Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee's (CASAC) Particulate Matter (PM) Review Panel: Public teleconference to discuss follow-on matters related to its review of the EPA Air Quality Criteria Document for Particulate Matter (Fourth External Review Draft).**

DATES: The SAB Committee on Valuing the Protection of Ecological Systems and Services will hold public teleconferences on January 20, 21, and 22, 2004 from 12:30 p.m. to 2:30 p.m. (Eastern Time).

The SAB 3MRA Panel will hold public teleconferences on January 16, February 6, and February 27, 2004, from 1 p.m. to 5 p.m. (Eastern Time).

The CASAC PM Review Panel public teleconference will take place on

February 3, 2004 from 11 a.m. to 2 p.m. (Eastern Time).

ADDRESSES: Participation in the meetings indicated above will be by teleconference only. Supplemental materials and an agenda for each meeting will be announced on the SAB Web site, <http://www.epa.gov/sab> prior to the teleconference.

FOR FURTHER INFORMATION CONTACT: Members of the public who wish to obtain the call in number and access code to participate in any of the teleconferences, or who wish to submit written or brief oral comments (three minutes or less) must contact the appropriate Designated Federal Officer (DFO) listed below:

(1) For information regarding the SAB Committee on Valuing the Protection of Ecological Systems and Services please contact Dr. Angela Nugent. Dr. Nugent can be contacted via telephone/voice mail: (202) 564-4562, fax: (202) 501-0582, or e-mail: nugent.angela@epa.gov.

(2) For information regarding the SAB 3MRA Panel contact Ms. Kathleen White. Ms. White can be contacted via telephone/voice mail: (202) 564-4559, fax: (202) 501-0582, or e-mail: white.kathleen@epa.gov.

(3) For information regarding the CASAC PM Review Panel contact Mr. Fred Butterfield. Mr. Butterfield can be contacted via telephone/voice mail: (202) 564-4562, fax: (202) 501-0582, or e-mail: butterfield.fred@epa.gov.

To reach a central number at the SAB Staff Office, please call via telephone (202) 564-4533, U.S. EPA Science Advisory Board (1400A), 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW, Washington, DC 20460. General information about the SAB and CASAC can be found on the SAB Web site at <http://www.epa.gov/sab>.

SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION:

Background and Summary

The SAB Committee on Valuing the Protection of Ecological Systems and Services is holding three public teleconferences to plan its future work, including a workshop and public advisory meeting tentatively planned for April 13-15, 2004. Background on the Committee and its charge was provided in a Federal Register notice published on March 7, 2003 (68 FR 11082). The overall charge to the Committee is to assess Agency needs and the state of the art and science of valuing protection of ecological systems and services, and then to identify key areas for improving knowledge, methodologies, practice, and research.

The SAB 3MRA Panel will hold three public teleconferences for the SAB 3MRA Panel to further edit and discuss approval of the SAB 3MRA Panel's final report. The SAB 3MRA Panel will complete discussion of its second draft report during the January 16, 2004 teleconference. The

SAB 3MRA Panel will discuss its third draft report during the February 6, 2004 teleconference. The purpose of the February 27, 2004 teleconference is to finalize the SAB 3MRA Panel's report for the SAB's consideration and for transmittal to the Administrator.

Background on the SAB 3MRA Panel, and this review was provided in Federal Register notice published on April 11, 2003 (68 FR 17797-17800). Additional meetings were announced in a Federal Register notice published on August 6, 2003 (68 FR 46606-46607). More information

[[Page 658]]

<http://www.epa.gov/sab/panels/SAB3MRAMspanel.html>.

The CASAC, comprised of seven members appointed by the Administrator, was established under section 109(d)(2) of the Clean Air Act (CAA or "Act") (42 U.S.C. 7409) as an independent scientific advisory committee, in part to provide advice, information and recommendations on the scientific and technical aspects of issues related to air quality criteria and National Ambient Air Quality Standards (NAAQS) under sections 108 and 109 of the Act. The CASAC, which is administratively located under the EPA Science Advisory Board Staff Office, is a Federal advisory committee chartered under the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA), as amended, 5 U.S.C., App. The CASAC PM Review Panel consists of the CASAC, supplemented by expert consultants. The CASAC PM Review Panel will comply with the provisions of FACA and all appropriate SAB Staff Office procedural policies.

The CASAC PM Review Panel is charged in part with providing advice, information and recommendations on the scientific and technical aspects of issues related to air quality criteria and NAAQS for particulate matter. The February 3, 2004 teleconference is a follow-on to the CASAC PM Review Panel's review of the EPA Air Quality Criteria Document for Particulate Matter (Fourth External Review Draft), which took place in a public meeting held in Research Triangle Park on August 25-26, 2003 (68 FR 47060, August 7, 2003); and which was continued during a public teleconference held on October 3, 2003 (68 FR 53734, September 12, 2003); and a public meeting which took place in Research Triangle Park on November 12-13, 2003 (68 FR 60363, October 22, 2003). More information regarding this review can be found at the SAB Web site at <http://www.epa.gov/sab/pdf/casac104002.pdf>.

Providing Oral or Written Comments at SAB Meetings

It is the policy of the SAB Staff Office to accept written public comments of any length, and to accommodate oral public comments whenever possible. The SAB Staff Office expects that public statements presented at its teleconferences and meetings will not be repetitive of previously-submitted oral or written statements. Oral Comments: In

general, for teleconference meetings, opportunities for oral comment will be limited to no more than three minutes per speaker and no more than fifteen minutes total. Requests to provide oral comments must be in writing (e-mail, fax or mail) and received by the DFO no later than noon Eastern Time five business days prior to each teleconference in order to reserve time on the teleconference agenda. Written Comments: Although the SAB Staff Office accepts written comments until the date of the meeting (unless otherwise stated), written comments should be received in the SAB Staff Office at least seven business days prior to the teleconference date so that the comments may be made available to the committee or panel for their consideration. Comments should be supplied to the DFO at the address/contact information noted above in the following formats: one hard copy with original signature, and one electronic copy via e-mail (acceptable file format: Adobe Acrobat, WordPerfect, Word, or Rich Text files (in IBM-PC/Windows 95/98 format)).

Meeting Accommodations

Individuals requiring special accommodation to access these teleconferences, should contact the DFO at least five business days prior to the teleconference so that appropriate arrangements can be made.

**Dated: December 30, 2003.
Vanessa T. Vu,
Director, EPA Science Advisory Board Staff Office.
[FR Doc. 04-209 Filed 1-5-04; 8:45 am]
BILLING CODE 6560-50-P**

Attachment C: Agenda

US EPA Committee on Valuing the Protection of Ecological Systems and Services Public Teleconference

**January 20, 2003, 12:30-2:30 PM Eastern Time
Draft Agenda**

Purpose: 1) to plan its future work, including workshops and advisory meetings and 2) to hear and discuss reports from Committee Theme Groups.

12:30-12:35	Opening of Call and Roll Call	Dr. Angela Nugent, Designated Federal Officer, EPA SAB Staff Office
12:35-12:40	Purpose of Meeting and Review of Agenda	Dr. Domenico Grasso, Chair
12:40-12:50	Update on Formation of Steering Group and Special Consultant to the Committee	Dr. Domenico Grasso
12:50-1:30	Discussion of draft documents linking the work of the Theme Groups to the Committee's Charge a. Diagram: "Proposed Relationship Between the Charge to the Committee and Work on the Committee Themes") b. Diagram: "Map of Theme Efforts to Generic Benefits Assessment Process" c. Template Questions in "Proposed Approach to Link Planning of the Work of the Eco-Value Group Themes to the Committee's Overall Charge"	Committee
1:30-2:10	Report from Alternate Methods Theme Group and Committee Discussion	Dr. James Boyd Committee
2:10-2:25	Feedback on Teleconference	Committee
2:25-2:30	Next Steps	Dr. Domenico Grasso
2:30	Adjourn	