

#### UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY BEGION 4

ATLANTA FEDERAL CENTER 61 FORSYTH STREET ATLANTA, GEORGIA 30303-8960

OCT 2 7 2011

CERTIFIED MAIL RETURN RECEIPT REQUESTED

Mr. James Doub Owner Doub Farms, LLC 4113 Cornelius Road East Bend, North Carolina 27018

> Re: Doub Farms, LLC Docket No.: FIFRA-04-2011-3037(b)

Dear Mr. Doub:

Enclosed is a copy of the ratified Consent Agreement and Final Order (CAFO) in the above-referenced matter. The original CAFO has been filed with the Regional Hearing Clerk and served on the parties as directed in Section 22.6 of the Consolidated Rules of Practice, 40 C.F.R. Part 22.

As stated in Section V of the CAFO, the first installment of \$1,076.53 of the assessed penalty of \$4,306.12 is due within 30 days from the effective date. Please ensure that the face of your cashier's or certified check includes the name of the company and the docket number of this case. Penalty payment questions should be directed to Mr. Bryson Lehman either by telephone at (513) 487-2123 or by written correspondence to his attention at the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Cincinnati Accounting Operations address identified in the CAFO. Should you have any questions about this matter or your compliance status in the future, please Ms. Melba Table at (404) 562-9086.

Also enclosed is a copy of a document entitled "Notice of Securities and Exchange Commission Registrants' Duty to Disclose Environmental Legal Proceedings." This document puts you on notice of your potential duty to disclose to the Securities and Exchange Commission (SEC) any environmental enforcement actions taken by the EPA.

Sincerely,

Kimberly L. Bingham Chief Pesticides and Toxic Substances Branch

Enclosures

cc: Karen Hunt NC Department of Agriculture and Consumer Service

# UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY ATLANTA, GEORGIA

)

}

In the Matter of:

Doub Farms, LLC

Respondent.

Docket No.: FIFRA-04-2011-3037(b) PH : 30

# CONSENT AGREEMENT AND FINAL ORDER

#### I. Nature of the Action

- This is a civil penalty proceeding pursuant to Section 14(a) of the Federal Insecticide, Fungicide, and Rodenticide Act, as amended, 7 U.S.C. § 136/(a) (FIFRA), and pursuant to the Consolidated Rules of Practice Governing Administrative Assessment of Civil Penalties and the Revocation/Termination or Suspension of Permits (Consolidated Rules), 40 C.F.R. Part 22. Complainant is the Director of the Air, Pesticides, and Toxics Management Division, United States Environmental Protection Agency, Region 4 (EPA). Respondent is Doub Farms, LLC.
- 2. Complainant and Respondent have conferred for the purpose of settlement pursuant to 40 C.F.R. § 22.18 and desire to resolve this matter and settle the allegations described herein without a formal hearing. Therefore, without the taking of any evidence or testimony, the making of any argument, or the adjudication of any issue in this matter, and in accordance with 40 C.F.R. § 22.13(b), this Consent Agreement and Final Order (CAFO) will simultaneously commence and conclude this matter.

# II. Preliminary Statements

- 3. The authority to take action under Section 14(a) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136/(a), is vested in the Administrator of EPA. The Administrator of EPA has delegated this authority under FIFRA to EPA Region 4 by EPA Delegation 5-14, dated May 11, 1994.
- Pursuant to 40 C.F.R. § 22.5(c)(4) the following individual is authorized to receive service for EPA in this proceeding:

Melba Table Pesticides Section U.S. EPA - Region 4 61 Forsyth Street Atlanta, Georgia 30303-8960 (404) 562- 9086.

- Respondent is Doub Farms, LLC, a North Carolina corporation, located at 4113
  Cornelius Road, East Bend, North Carolina 27108.
- Respondent is a "person" as defined by Section 2(s) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(s), and as such is subject to FIFRA and the regulations promulgated thereunder.

# III. Specific Allegations

- On or about March 24, 2010, an authorized representative of the EPA conducted an inspection at Respondent's facility located at 4113 Cornelius Road, East Bend, North Carolina 27108.
- 8. During the aforementioned inspection, the product Agriculture Soap Surfactant, also known as "Soy Soap and Agriculture Soap", was identified as being sold and/or distributed by the Respondent. At the time of the inspection, this product was considered to be a pesticide because of the pesticidal claims being made for it by the Respondent in advertisements and websites.

- 9. Agriculture Soap Surfactant is a pesticide as defined in Section 2(u) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C.
  § 136(u), which includes any substance or mixture of substances intended for preventing, destroying, repelling, or mitigating any pest.
- 10. A pest is defined in Section 2(t) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(t), as any insect, rodent, nematode, fungus, weed, or any other form of terrestrial or aquatic plant or animal life or virus, bacteria, or other micro-organism (except viruses, bacteria, or other microorganisms on or in living man or other living animals) which the Administrator declares to be a pest under Section 25(c)(1) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136w(c)(1).
- 11. Respondent "distributes or sells" pesticides. The term "to distribute or sell" as defined by Section 2(gg) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(gg), includes to distribute, sell, offer for sale, hold for distribution, hold for sale, hold for shipment, ship, deliver for shipment, or release for shipment.
- Pesticides that are sold and distributed in the United States are required to be registered with the EPA.
- At the time of the inspection, Agriculture Soap Surfactant was not registered as a pesticide with EPA.
- 14. The inspector documented one offer for sale and/or distribution of said pesticide.
- 15. Under Section 12(a)(1)(A) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(1)(A), it is unlawful for any person to distribute or sell to any person any pesticide that is not registered under Section 3 of FIFRA.
- Respondent violated Section 12(a)(1)(A) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(1)(A), on one occasion and is therefore subject to the assessment of civil penalties under Section 14 of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136*l*.

3

- Section 14(a) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136/(a), in conjunction with the Debt Collection Improvement Act of 1996, authorizes the assessment of a civil penalty.
- 18. Section 14(a)(4) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136/(a)(4), requires EPA to consider the appropriateness of the assessed penalty to the size of business of the Respondent, the effect on Respondent's ability to continue in business, and the gravity of the violation.
- 19. After consideration of the factors set forth in Section 14(a)(4) of FIFRA,

7 U.S.C. § 136/(a)(4), the EPA proposes to assess a total civil penalty of FOUR

# THOUSAND TWO HUNDRED AND NINETY DOLLARS (\$4,290) against the Respondent for the above-described violations. Civil penalties under Section 14(a) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C.§ 136*l*(a), may be assessed by Administrative Order.

#### IV. Consent Agreement

- 20. For the purposes of this CAFO, Respondent admits the jurisdictional allegations set forth above and neither admits nor denies the factual allegations set forth above.
- Respondent waives its right to a hearing on the allegations contained herein and its right to appeal the proposed Final Order accompanying the Consent Agreement.
- Respondent consents to the assessment of the penalty proposed by EPA and agrees to pay the civil penalty as set forth in this CAFO.
- Respondent certifies that as of the date of its execution of this CAFO, it is in compliance with all relevant requirements of FIFRA.
- 24. Compliance with this CAFO shall resolve the allegations of the violations contained herein. This CAFO shall not otherwise affect any liability of Respondent to the United States. Other than as expressed herein, neither EPA nor Complainant waives any right to bring an enforcement action against Respondent for violation of any federal or state

statute, regulation or permit, to initiate an action for imminent and substantial endangerment, or to pursue criminal enforcement.

25. Complainant and Respondent agree to settle this matter by their execution of this CAFO. The parties agree that the settlement of this matter is in the public interest and that this CAFO is consistent with the applicable requirements of FIFRA.

#### V. Final Order

# 26. Respondent is assessed a civil penalty of FOUR THOUSAND TWO HUNDRED

NINTEY DOLLARS (\$4,290). Four payments will be made to complete payment of the entire civil penalty including interest. The first installment is due within 30 days of the effective date of this CAFO. The subsequent three payments shall be due in 90 day intervals thereafter. Including the civil penalty and interest, the total amount that will be paid upon the completion of all payments will be FOUR THOUSAND THREE

HUNDRED SIX DOLLARS and TWELVE CENTS (\$4,306.12). Respondent shall make payments in accordance with the following schedule:

Pavment Number	Payment Due Date	Payment Due
	within 30 days of filing of CAFO	\$1,076.53
2	within 120 days of filing of CAFO	\$1,076.53
3	within 210 days of filing of CAFO	\$1,076.53
4	within 300 days of filing of CAFO	\$1,076.53.

27. Respondent shall remit the penalty by either a cashier's or certified check made payable to the "Treasurer, United States of America," and shall send the check via U.S. mail to the following address:

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Fines and Penalties Cincinnati Finance Center P.O. Box 979077 St. Louis, Missouri 63197-9000.

# The check shall reference on its face the name of the Respondent and Docket Number of this CAFO.

28. At the time of payment, Respondent shall send a separate copy of the check and a written

statement that the payment is being made in accordance with this CAFO, to the following

persons at the following addresses:

Regional Hearing Clerk U.S. EPA - Region 4 61 Forsyth Street Atlanta, Georgia 30303-8960;

Melba Table Pesticides Section U.S. EPA - Region 4 61 Forsyth Street Atlanta, Georgia 30303-8960; and

Saundi Wilson Office of Environmental Accountability U.S. EPA - Region 4 61 Forsyth Street Atlanta, Georgía 30303-8960.

- 29. If Respondent fails to make one of the installment payments in accordance with the schedule set forth above, and if such payment is not made within 30 days after the due date, that payment plus all subsequent payments (the entire unpaid balance) shall become immediately due and payable on the 31<sup>st</sup> day from such due date. In addition, Respondent shall be liable for and shall pay administrative handling charges and late payment penalty charges as described below in the event of any such failure or default.
- 30. Further, if Respondent fails to pay the installment payments in accordance with the schedule set forth above, EPA may refer the debt to a collection agency, a credit reporting agency, or to the Department of Justice for filing of a collection action in the appropriate United States District Court. In any such collection action, the validity,

amount, and appropriateness of the assessed penalty and of this CAFO shall not be subject to review.

- 31. Notwithstanding Respondent's agreement to pay the assessed civil penalty in accordance with the installment schedule set forth above, Respondent may pay the entire civil penalty of FOUR THOUSAND TWO HUNDRED NINETY DOLLARS (\$4,290) within 30 calendar days after the date on which a copy of this CAFO is mailed or hand-delivered to Respondent and, thereby, avoid the payment of interest pursuant to 40 C.F.R. § 13.11(a). In addition, Respondent may, at any time after commencement of payments under the installment schedule, elect to pay the entire principal balance remaining, together with interest accrued up to the date of such full payment.
- 32. Pursuant to 31 U.S.C. § 3717 and 40 C.F.R. § 13.11, EPA is entitled to assess interest and penaltics on debts owed to the United States and a charge to cover the cost of processing and handling a delinquent claim. In accordance with 40 C.F.R. § 13.11(a), interest on any civil penalty assessed in a CAFO begins to accrue on the date that a copy of the CAFO is mailed or hand-delivered to the Respondent. However, EPA will not seek to recover interest on any amount of such civil penalty that is paid within 30 calendar days after the date on which such interest begins to accrue. Interest will be assessed at the rate of the United States Treasury tax and loan rate in accordance with 40 C.F.R. § 13.11(a). A charge will also be assessed to cover the administrative costs, both direct and indirect, of overdue debts. In addition, a late payment penalty charge shall be applied on any principal amount not paid within 90 days of the due date.
- 33. For the purposes of state and federal income taxation, Respondent shall not be entitled, and agrees not to attempt, to claim a deduction for any civil penalty payment made

7

pursuant to this CAFO. Any attempt by Respondent to deduct any such payments shall constitute a violation of this CAFO.

- 34. Complainant and Respondent shall bear their own costs and attorney fees in this matter.
- 35. This CAFO shall be binding upon the Respondent, its successors and assigns.
- 36. Each undersigned representative of the parties to this CAFO certifies that he or she is fully authorized by the party represented to enter into this CAFO and hereby legally binds that party to this CAFO.

# THE REMAINDER OF THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK.

# VI. Effective Date

37. The effective date of this CAFO shall be the date on which the CAFO is filed with the

Regional Hearing Clerk.

# AGREED AND CONSENTED TO:

Respondent: Doub Farms, LLC Docket No.: FIFRA 04-2011-3037(b)

By (Signature) Dou b (Typed or Printed) Name: James F.

Date: <u>9-2-11</u>

Title: Owner (Typed or Printed)

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

verly H. Banister, Director

Air, Pesticides and Toxies Management Division

APPROVED AND SO ORDERED this 27 day of October 2011.

Susan B. Schub Regional Judicial Officer

Date: \_\_\_\_ /0 - 5- //

#### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on the date set out below, I filed the original and one copy of the

foregoing Consent Agreement and Final Order and served a true and correct copy of the

foregoing Consent Agreement and Final Order In the Matter of Doub Farms, LLC, Docket

Number: FIFRA-04-2011-3037(b), to the addressees listed below:

James Doub Owner Doub Farms, LLC 4113 Cornelius Road East Bend, NC 27018

Melba Table Pesticides Section U.S. EPA Region 4 61 Forsyth Street Atlanta, Georgia 30303 (via Certified Mail, Return Receipt Requested)

(via EPA's internal mail)

(via EPA's internal mail)

Robert Caplan Associate Regional Counsel Office of Environmental Accountability U.S. EPA Region 4 61 Forsyth Street Atlanta, Georgia 30303

Date: 16 - 27-11

Belinda Johnson, Acting Regional Hearing Clerk JU U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region 4 Atlanta Federal Center 61 Forsyth Street Atlanta, Georgia 30303 (404) 562-9686