# NA GEN CY AND THE COLOR OF THE PROPERTY OF THE

## UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

REGION 4
ATLANTA FEDERAL CENTER
61 FORSYTH STREET
ATLANTA, GEORGIA 30303-8960

MUL 19 2012

<u>CERTIFIED MAIL</u> 7010 1060 0002 1703 0925 RETURN RECEIPT REQUESTED

John Vogler P. O. Box 319 Greenville, Kentucky 42345

Re: Consent Agreement and Final Order (CA/FO) Docket No. SDWA-04-2012-1003(b)

Dear Mr. Vogler:

Enclosed is a copy of the Consent Agreement and Final Order (CA/FO) in this matter that has been filed with the Regional Hearing Clerk and served on the parties as required by 40 C.F.R. § 22.6. This CA/FO was effective upon the date filed with the Regional Hearing Clerk and you are hereby ordered to comply immediately with the terms of the subject Order.

Thank you for your cooperation in settling this matter. Should you have any questions or concerns, please contact Mr. W. Scott Hoskins, Underground Injection Control Enforcement, at (404) 562-9299.

Sincerely,

James D. Giattina

Director

Water Protection Division

Mode li

Enclosure

cc: Regional Hearing Clerk

## UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY REGION 4

IN THE MATTER OF

John Vogler P.O. Box 319 Greenville, Kentucky 42345

Respondent

RECEIVED
RECEIVED
RECEIVED
HEARING CHART 7: 22
Consent Agreement and Final Order 7: 22
Docket No. SDWA-04-2012-1003(b)

## STATUTORY AUTHORITY

- 1. Pursuant to the Consolidated Rules of Practice Governing the Administrative Assessment of Civil Penalties, Issuance of Compliance or Corrective Action Orders, and the Revocation, Termination or Suspension of Permits (Consolidated Rules of Practice or Part 22), specifically Subpart I, published at 64 Fed. Reg. 40138 (July 23, 1999) and the delegated authority of the Administrator of the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA or Complainant) under Section 1423 of the Safe Drinking Water Act (SDWA), 42 U.S.C. § 300h-2, the EPA, as Complainant, hereby enters into the following Consent Agreement and Final Order (CA/FO) with John Vogler (Respondent).
- 2. Section 1450(a)(1) of the SDWA 42 U.S.C. § 300j-9(a)(1) authorizes the Administrator to prescribe such regulations as are necessary or appropriate to carry out her functions under the SDWA. These regulations are found at 40 C.F.R. Parts 124, 144, 146, 147, and 148, and set forth requirements for the Underground Injection Control (UIC) program promulgated under Part C of the SDWA, 42 U.S.C. § 300h, et seq.
- 3. Injection well owners and operators are required to comply with the UIC program requirements. The UIC program for the Commonwealth of Kentucky, including all Indian lands, is administered by the EPA. See 40 C.F.R § 147.901(a).

## **ALLEGATIONS**

- 4. Respondent is a limited liability company organized under the laws of Illinois and doing business in the Commonwealth of Kentucky, with a business address of P.O Box 319, Greenville, Kentucky 42345.
- 5. Respondent is a "person" as that term is defined in Section 1401(12) of the SDWA, 42 U.S.C. § 300f(12) and 40 C.F.R. § 144.3.
- 6. Respondent owns and/or operates the following Class II underground injection well (Subject Well).

Permit No.	EPA ID No.	Well	County	<b>Status</b>
KYA0659	KYS1770185	Richard Bivins #5	Muhlenberg	Active

7. The Subject Well is a "facility" as that term is defined in 40 C.F.R. § 144.3, and is subject to the requirements of the SDWA and the UIC regulations.

- 8. The Subject Well is permitted in accordance with 40 C.F.R. § 144.31.
- 9. The SDWA, 42 U.S.C. § 300f, et seq., and 40 C.F.R. § 144.51(a) require the permittee to comply with all conditions of the permit. Noncompliance constitutes a violation of the SDWA and is grounds for an enforcement action.
- 10. Part II, Section G, Paragraph 3, of the UIC permit, requires that a demonstration of mechanical integrity in accordance with 40 C.F.R. § 146.8 be made no later than 5 years from the last approved demonstration.
- 11. The mechanical integrity demonstration for the following Subject Well was performed late, as shown below.

Permit No.	EPA ID No.	Well	MIT Due	MIT Done
KYA0659	KYS1770185	Richard Bivins #5	3/16/08	5/5/2010

- 12. Therefore, Respondent is in violation of 40 C.F.R. § 146.8, the UIC permit and the SDWA for failure to timely demonstrate the mechanical integrity of the active permitted Subject Well.
- 13. Part I, Section C, Paragraph 1(b) (i), of the UIC permit, requires that a maximum injection pressure, measured at the wellhead, shall not exceed 425 pounds per square inch (psig) for the Subject Well. Field inspections show that the Subject Well was actively injecting at 1200 psig during one inspection and 1290 psig through the tubing at the wellhead during a second inspection. The inspections were performed on September 14, 2006 and June 15, 2011 on the Subject Well as shown below:

			Tubing Pressure on	Tubing Pressure on
Permit No.	EPA ID No.	Well	September 14, 2006	June 15, 2011
KYA0659	KYS1770185	Richard Bivins #5	1200 psig	1290 psig

- 14. Therefore, Respondent is in violation of 40 C.F.R. §144.51(a), its permit and the SDWA for exceeding the maximum allowable injection pressure for the Subject Well.
- 15. On December 1, 2011, Respondent participated in a show cause hearing with EPA representatives to discuss its violation of the SDWA and the implementing regulations.

## STIPULATIONS AND FINDINGS

- 16. Respondent admits the jurisdictional allegations set forth above and neither admits nor denies the facts and findings of violation as alleged herein. Respondent waives any right to a hearing and waives any right to appeal a final order in this matter, and consents to the issuance of a final order without further adjudication.
- 17. Complainant and Respondent have conferred for the purpose of settlement, pursuant to 40 C.F.R. § 22.18, and desire to resolve this matter and settle the violations described herein without resorting to a formal hearing. Therefore, without the taking of any evidence or testimony, the making of an argument, or the adjudication of any issue in this matter, and in accordance with 40 C.F.R. § 22.13(b), this CA/FO will simultaneously commence and conclude this matter.

## PENALTY AND INJUNCTIVE RELIEF

Based upon the foregoing findings, the parties hereby agree and consent to entry of the following Order:

- 18. Respondent shall pay a civil penalty of \$6,053.34 (six thousand fifty three and 34/100 dollars). Based on Respondent's alleged inability to pay the full penalty, EPA agreed to allow the Respondent to pay the full penalty amount in quarterly payments in accordance with the terms set forth below.
- 19. Respondent shall submit a cashiers or certified check for each penalty payment.

Payment 1	\$1008.89	Received within 90 days of effective date of this Order.
Payment 2	\$1008.89	Received within 180 days of effective date of this Order
Payment 3	\$1008.89	Received within 270 days of effective date of this Order.
Payment 4	\$1008.89	Received within 360 days of effective date of this Order.
Payment 5	\$1008.89	Received within 450 days of effective date of this Order.
Payment 6	\$1008.89	Received within 540 days of effective date of this Order.

<u>Payment</u>	Payment Amount	<u>Principal</u>	<u>Interest</u>	<b>Balance</b>
1	\$1,008.89	\$ <del>99</del> 3.72	\$15.17	\$5,006.28
2	\$1,008.89	\$ <del>99</del> 6.24	\$12.65	\$4,010.04
3	\$1,008.89	\$998.64	\$10.25	\$3,011.40
4	\$1,008.89	\$1,001.19	\$7.70	\$2,010.21
5	\$1,008.89	\$1,003.86	\$5.03	\$1,006.35
6	\$1,008.89	\$1,006.35	\$2.54	\$0.00
Total:	\$6,053.34	\$6,000.00	\$53.34	

20. The penalty payment as set forth shall be made payable to the Treasurer, United States of America at the following address:

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Fines and Penalties
Cincinnati Finance Center
P.O. Box 979077
St. Louis, MO 63197-9000

Respondent shall note the title and docket number of the case on the penalty payment certified or cashiers check.

21. Respondent shall submit copies of the check to the following persons:

Regional Hearing Clerk U.S. EPA - Region 4 61 Forsyth Street SW Atlanta, GA 30303-8960

Fred McManus, Chief

## Ground Water and SDWA Enforcement Section U. S. EPA - Region 4 61 Forsyth Street SW Atlanta, GA 30303-8960

- 22. Pursuant to Section 1423(c)(7) of the SDWA, 42 U.S.C. § 300h-2(c)(7), failure by Respondent to pay the penalty assessed by this CA/FO in full by its due date may subject Respondent to a civil action in an appropriate district court to recover the amount assessed (plus costs, attorneys fees and interest at currently prevailing rates from the date the order is effective). In such an action, the validity, amount and appropriateness of the penalty shall not be subject to review. Additionally, pursuant to 40 C.F.R. Part 13 and 31 U.S.C. § 3717 et seq., if EPA does not receive payment of the penalty assessed by this CA/FO in full by its due date, interest shall accrue on the unpaid balance from the due date through date of payment at an annual rate equal to the rate of the current value of funds to the United States Treasury as prescribed and published by the Secretary of the Treasury. If all or part of the payment is overdue, EPA shall assess an administrative fee of \$15 for each subsequent 30 day period. EPA shall assess, on a monthly basis, a 6% per annum penalty on any principal amount not paid within 90 days of the due date.
- 23. In addition to payment of the penalty described above, Respondent shall perform the following injunctive relief:
  - a. Respondent is ordered to provide advance notification and successfully demonstrate the mechanical integrity or close, plug, and abandon the following well within 90 days of receipt of this Order. Mechanical integrity testing or plugging and abandonment must be witnessed by an authorized EPA inspector.

Permit No. EPA ID No. Well Richard Bivins #5

- 24. Respondent agrees to pay stipulated civil penalties for violation of the conditions set forth in Paragraph 23 above as follows:
- 25. For failure to comply with the condition described in paragraph 24 above, Respondent shall pay a stipulated civil penalty according to the following schedule.
  - a. \$300 for any portion of the first 7 calendar days Respondent is in violation of this Agreement; and
  - b. \$200 per day for each day after the first 7 calendar days Respondent is in violation of this Agreement.
- 26. Stipulated penalties shall become due and payable no later than 30 days after receipt of demand from EPA. Payment shall be in the form of a certified or cashier's check made payable to the Treasurer of the United States of America, and sent to the following address:

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Fines and Penalties Cincinnati Finance Center P.O. Box 979077 St. Louis, MO 63197-9000

- 27. A copy of the check shall be sent to the Ground Water & Safe Drinking Water Act Enforcement Section, Safe Drinking Water Branch, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region 4, 61 Forsyth Street, S.W., Atlanta, GA 30303-8960. Respondent shall state the docket number of this Order on the face of any such check. The stipulated civil penalties set forth above shall be in addition to any other remedies or sanctions which are or may be available to EPA.
- 28. The names, addresses and telephone numbers of the individuals authorized to receive service relating to the proceeding are listed below.

For Respondent:

John Vogler P.O. Box 319

Greenville, Kentucky 42345

270-543-6011

For EPA:

Wilda Cobb, Associate Regional Counsel

U.S. EPA - Region 4 61 Forsyth Street SW Atlanta, GA 30303-8960

404-562-9530

### **GENERAL PROVISIONS**

- 29. The provisions of this CA/FO shall be binding upon Respondent, and its officers, directors, agents, servants, employees, and successors or assigns. Notice of this CA/FO shall be given to any successors in interest prior to transfer of the ownership or operational control of the facility.
- 30. This CA/FO does not constitute a waiver, suspension or modification of the requirements of Part C of the SDWA, 42 U.S.C. § 300h, et seq. or any regulations promulgated thereunder. This CA/FO is not and shall not be interpreted to be, a permit for the injection of fluids under Section 1421 of the SDWA, 42 U.S.C. § 300h nor shall it in any way relieve Respondent of any obligation imposed by any permit issued thereunder, or of Respondent's obligation to comply with any provision of the SDWA, its implementing regulations, or any other local, state or federal law. Payment of the penalty agreed to in this CA/FO shall not in any way affect the right of the Agency or the United States to pursue appropriate injunctive or other equitable relief or criminal sanctions for any other violations of law. Full payment of the penalty and performance of the injunctive relief agreed to in this CA/FO resolves only Respondents liability for federal civil penalties for the violations and facts stipulated herein.
- 31. For the purposes of state and federal income taxation, Respondent shall not be entitled to and agrees not to attempt to claim a deduction for any penalty payment made pursuant to this CA/FO. Any attempt to deduct any such penalty shall constitute a violation of this CA/FO.
- 32. If any event beyond the control of Respondent, its successors or assigns, occurs which causes or may cause a delay in the achievement of any requirement of this CA/FO, Respondent shall notify EPA orally within 4 days of the time it has knowledge of the occurrence of such event. A written report of said event shall be submitted by certified mail to EPA within 10 days of the date Respondent received knowledge of the event. Said report shall describe the violation or failure, its cause and all attendant circumstances, and the measures taken or to be taken to prevent or minimize any such violation or

failure and to comply with the pertinent requirements of this CA/FO as soon as possible, and the timetable by which those measures are proposed to be implemented.

- 33. The burden of proving that any violation or failure is caused by circumstances beyond the control of and without fault of Respondent and the length of the delay attributable to such circumstances shall rest with Respondent. Financial, economic, or business conditions or changes in same, unanticipated or increased costs or expenses, or problems relating to reasonably foreseeable technological infeasibility associated with the implementation of actions called for by this CA/FO, shall not relieve Respondent of any obligation imposed under the terms of this CA/FO, nor from payment of any penalty set forth in this CA/FO. EPA will notify Respondent of its determination that certain circumstances are considered to be beyond Respondent's control and the extension of time, if any, for completion of the affected requirements. Respondent shall waive this right to any extension for failure to provide EPA with written notice as provided herein or for failure to provide adequate proof for the cause of the delay.
- 34. The parties acknowledge and agree that final approval by EPA of this CA/FO is subject to 40 C.F.R. § 22.45(c)(4) which sets forth requirements under which a person not a party to this proceeding may petition to set aside a consent agreement and final order on the basis that material evidence was not considered.
- 35. The parties acknowledge and agree that final approval by EPA of this CA/FO is subject to 40 C.F.R. § 22.45(c)(4) which sets forth requirements under which a person not a party to this proceeding may petition to set aside a consent agreement and final order on the basis that material evidence was not considered.
- 36. This CA/FO shall become effective upon the date that it is filed with the Regional Hearing Clerk.
- 37. The undersigned representative of Respondent certifies that he or she is fully authorized to enter into the terms and conditions of this Consent Agreement and to execute and legally bind the Party he or she represents to this Agreement.

## RESPONDENT

Date:

John Vogler

**COMPLAINANT** 

Date:

James D. Giattina, Director
Water Protection Division

## FINAL ORDER

Pursuant to the Consolidated Rules of Practice and the delegated authority of the Administrator under the SDWA, the above and foregoing Consent Agreement is hereby approved and incorporated by reference into this Final Order. Respondent is ordered to comply immediately with the terms of the Consent Agreement, which are fully incorporated into this Final Order.

## U.S. ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

Date: July 2, 2012

Susan Schub

Regional Judicial Officer

## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I HEREBY CERTIFY that I have this day served a true and correct copy of the foregoing Consent Agreement and Final Order, in the Matter of John Vogler; Docket No. SDWA-04-2012-1003(b), on the parties listed below in the manner indicated:

W. Scott Hoskins

Via EPA Internal Mail

Wilda Cobb

Via EPA Internal Mail

John Vogler P.O. Box 319 Via Certified Mail/ Return Receipt Requested

Greenville, Kentucky 42345

Date: /-19-12

Patricia A. Bullock, Regional Hearing Clerk

United States EPA - Region 4

Atlanta Federal Center 61 Forsyth Street, S.W. Atlanta, GA 30303-8960 (404) 562-9511