

ENVIRONMENTAL APPEALS BOARD UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY WASHINGTON, D.C.

ORDER ON PROCEDURES FOR PETITIONS FOR REIMBURSEMENT SUBMITTED UNDER SECTION 106(b)(2)(A) OF THE COMPREHENSIVE ENVIRONMENTAL RESPONSE, COMPENSATION, AND LIABILITY ACT OF 1980, 42 U.S.C. § 9606(b)(2)(A)

Before the Environmental Appeals Board.

Per Curiam:

Section 106(b)(2)(A) of the Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act ("CERCLA") provides that "[a]ny person who receives and complies with the terms of any order issued under subsection (a) may, within 60 days after completion of the required action, petition the President for reimbursement * * * for the reasonable costs of such action, plus interest." 42 U.S.C. § 9606(b)(2)(A). The President delegated the authority to decide claims for reimbursement under section 106(b) to the Administrator of the Environmental Protection Agency ("EPA"). Exec. Order No. 12,580, 52 Fed. Reg. 2923 (Jan. 29, 1987). The Administrator has redelegated the authority to receive, evaluate, make determinations regarding petitions for reimbursement submitted pursuant to section 106(b), and as appropriate, authorize payment, to the Environmental Appeals Board ("Board"). U.S. EPA, *Delegation of Authority 14-27*, *Petitions for Reimbursement* §§ 1.a, 2.a (rev. Jan. 18, 2017).

¹ Certain federal agencies other than EPA, including the U.S. Coast Guard, also have the authority to issue CERCLA section 106(a) orders. *See* Exec. Order No. 12,580, 52 Fed. Reg. 2923 (Jan. 29, 1987), *as amended by* Exec. Order No. 13,016, 61 Fed. Reg. 45,871-72 (Aug. 28, 1996). Reimbursement claims based on orders issued by these agencies must also be filed with the Board. *See* U.S. EPA Delegation of Authority 14-27, Petitions for Reimbursement §§ 1.a, 2.a (rev. Jan. 18, 2017). The procedures set forth in this order apply to those claims as well.

The Board's procedures governing submission and review of petitions for reimbursement

are detailed in Appendix A of this order and apply to all CERCLA section 106(b)(2)(A) petitions.

The Board hereby authorizes parties in all petitions for reimbursement to utilize email to fulfill

their service obligations under the attached procedures. See App. A, at § I.B. The relevant

CERCLA provisions are included in Appendix B below.

The Board in its discretion may issue an order modifying these procedures as appropriate

on a case-by-case basis and the Board may revoke or amend this order at any time. This order

supersedes all prior Board orders addressing CERCLA section 106(b)(2)(A) petitions. This order

creates no vested rights in any party.

So ordered.

Dated: September 29, 2025

- 2 -

APPENDIX A PROCEDURES FOR CERCLA SECTION 106(B)(2)(A) REIMBURSEMENT PETITIONS

I. FILING PROCEDURES, SERVICE PROCEDURES, AND DEADLINES

Section 106(b)(2)(A) of CERCLA provides that a person seeking reimbursement must "petition * * * for reimbursement" within 60 days after completion of the required action. 42 U.S.C. § 9606(b)(2)(A). A petitioner must submit its petition and supporting documents to the Environmental Appeals Board ("EAB" or "Board") by filing the document(s) either electronically, by mail, or by hand delivery as described below. For additional information, *see* Guide to the Environmental Appeals Board as well as the Board's standing orders on electronic filing, and electronic service.

A. Filing Methods

There are two methods for filing CERCLA reimbursement documents with the Board:

1. By e-Filing. Parties may file electronically by using the EAB's e-Filing System, subject to any appropriate conditions and limitations imposed by order of the Board. All documents filed electronically must include the full name of the person filing below the signature line. Compliance with the Board's electronic filing requirements constitutes compliance with applicable signature requirements.

For the purpose of determining whether a petitioner has complied with the statutory 60-day deadline, a petition filed electronically needs to be received by the Board no later than 11:59 p.m. Eastern Time on the 60th day after the date of completion of the required action.

2. By U.S. Mail or Hand Delivery. Parties may file documents on paper via U.S. postal service, personal delivery, or via courier or commercial delivery service. The original and two copies of each document must be filed. The person filing the documents must include a cover letter to the Clerk of the Board clearly identifying the documents that are being submitted, the name of the party on whose behalf the documents are being submitted, and the name of the person filing the documents, his or her address, telephone number, and e-mail address.

Documents that are sent by U.S. mail (except by U.S. Express Mail) must be sent to the official mailing address of the Clerk of the Board at:

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Environmental Appeals Board 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. Mail Code 1103M Washington, D.C. 20460-0001. A petition sent by U.S. mail needs to be postmarked no later than the 60th day after the date of completion of the required action.

Documents delivered by hand or courier (including deliveries by U.S. Express Mail or by a commercial delivery service) must be delivered to the Clerk of the Board at:

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Environmental Appeals Board 1201 Constitution Avenue, N.W. WJC East Building Room 3332 Washington, D.C. 20004.

A petition that is delivered by hand or courier must be received by the Clerk of the Board at its hand-delivery address not later than the 60th day after the date of completion of the required action. If the 60-day period for filing the petition with EPA expires on a Saturday, Sunday, or federal legal holiday, the period will be extended to include the next business day.

B. Service Requirements

When filing a petition, the petitioner must send a copy of the petition and supporting documents, including attachments, to the EPA Regional Office (or federal agency, if other than EPA) that issued the underlying administrative order. Once an appeal is docketed, every document a party files with the Board must be served on all other parties. Parties are responsible for serving each other. Service must be by first class mail, any reliable commercial delivery service, or other electronic means. The Board may by order require service by email, or other electronic means, subject to any appropriate conditions or limitations. The Board has authorized parties in all matters filed with it, including in petitions for reimbursement, to utilize email to fulfill their service obligations. *See* Board's standing Order on Electronic Service.

When a party must act within a prescribed period after being served and service is made by U.S. mail, EPA's internal mail, or reliable commercial delivery service, 3 days shall be added to the prescribed time. The prescribed period for acting after being served is not extended by 3 days when service is made by personal delivery or email.

The Clerk of the Board will serve copies of rulings, orders, and decisions on all parties by U.S. mail (including by certified mail or return receipt requested, overnight express and priority mail), EPA's internal mail, any reliable commercial delivery service, or electronic means (including but not necessarily limited to email).

C. Proof of Service

A certificate of service must be appended to each document filed stating the names of persons served, the date and manner of service, as well as the electronic, mailing, or hand delivery address as appropriate.

II. CONTENTS OF THE PETITION FOR REIMBURSEMENT

A. Required Information

A petition must include the following information:

- the petitioner's full name, title, and address;
- the name, title, address, telephone number, and email address of any agent or attorney authorized to represent the petitioner (or, if the petitioner is not represented, the petitioner's own address, telephone number, and email address);
- the name and address of the facility at which the response action was implemented;
- the U.S. EPA docket number for the CERCLA section 106(a) administrative order, if issued by EPA; if the administrative order was issued by another agency, include the docket number or the order identifier;
- demonstration that the petitioner satisfies the statutory prerequisites, *see* section II.B, below;
- grounds for the reimbursement claim, as set forth in Section II.C below; and
- the required attachments identified in Section II.D below.

The petition must be signed by the petitioner or any agent or attorney representing the petitioner. If the petitioner is not a natural person (e.g., if the petitioner is a corporation), the petition must be signed by the petitioner's attorney or by an agent or officer of the petitioner who is qualified to act as a signatory. For purposes of this requirement, a "qualified" agent or officer means one who satisfies the definition provided in 40 C.F.R. § 270.11(a). The Board may at any time require any factual assertion contained in a petition to be substantiated by an affidavit based on the affiant's personal knowledge of the matter asserted.

B. Statutory Prerequisites for Obtaining Review on the Merits (Threshold Issues)

CERCLA section 106(b), 42 U.S.C. § 9606(b), establishes four prerequisites for obtaining review of a reimbursement petition on the merits, and the petitioner must demonstrate that it satisfies all four of them. The Board will not address the merits of a petition unless the petitioner has first demonstrated that it has satisfied these prerequisites. The four prerequisites are:

1. Compliance with the Section 106(a) Administrative Order. The petition must state that the petitioner has complied with the underlying section 106(a) administrative order and the petition must be accompanied by evidence supporting that statement.

- 2. Completion of the Required Action. The petition must state that the required action has been completed, and the petition must be accompanied by evidence supporting that statement.
- 3. *Timeliness of the Petition*. The petition must state the date on which the action required by the section 106(a) administrative order was completed, so that the Board can determine whether the petition is timely.
- 4. *Incurrence of Costs*. A reimbursement petition must contain a demonstration that the petitioner incurred costs in connection with the section 106(a) administrative order and must contain an estimate of the total costs the petitioner is claiming. The petition need not contain a demonstration that the costs were reasonable. The Board will ordinarily not consider any dispute concerning the reasonableness of the costs incurred until after it decides that reimbursement of some amount should be awarded. However, the Board may request cost information at any time after the petition was filed if it deems that such information may be useful in determining either threshold eligibility issues or a petitioner's entitlement to reimbursement on the merits.

C. Statements of Grounds for Reimbursement

The petition must set forth all legal arguments, factual contentions (including contentions, if any, regarding technical or scientific matters), and supporting evidence on which the petitioner relies in support of its claim for reimbursement. See generally, 42 U.S.C. § 9606(b)(2)(C)-(D). Except as may be permitted by the Board for good cause shown, and except as specifically provided in sections II.B.4 and III.F of these procedures (describing procedures for submitting cost-related information), a petitioner may not raise any issues during the petition review process that were not identified in the petition, and may not submit any evidence or information during the petition review process that was not identified in the petition, unless the petitioner demonstrates in a motion to the Board that: (1) for new issues, such issues were not reasonably ascertainable as of the date the petition was filed; or (2) for new evidence or information, the petitioner could not reasonably have known of its existence, or could not reasonably have anticipated its relevance or materiality, as of the date the petition was filed.

The petition must explicitly state, as to each claim set forth therein, whether the claim arises under CERCLA § 106(b)(2)(C) or under CERCLA § 106(b)(2)(D), or both. Both subparagraphs (b)(2)(C) and (b)(2)(D) expressly place the burden of proof on the petitioner. 42 U.S.C. § 9606(b)(2)(C)-(D). Section 106(b)(2)(D) provides for the reimbursement of "all reasonable response costs incurred by the petitioner pursuant *to the portions of the order* found to be arbitrary and capricious or otherwise not in accordance with law." *Id.* § 9606(b)(2)(D) (emphasis added). Therefore, when making a claim under section 106(b)(2)(D), the petitioner must be specific in identifying the portion(s) of the order that it seeks to challenge.

D. Required Attachments

A copy of the section 106(a) administrative order on which the petitioner's claim is based must accompany the petition as an attachment. In addition, all other documents on which the petitioner relies in support of its claim must also be submitted as attachments to the petition, except for documents to be relied on solely as evidence of the costs incurred or as evidence of their reasonableness. Each of the attachments must be separately identified, and the relevance of each attachment to the petitioner's claim briefly explained, in the body of the petition.

III. PROCEDURES FOR PROCESSING SECTION 106(B)(2)(A) PETITIONS

A. Response to Petitions

Upon receiving a petition for reimbursement, the Board will send a letter to the appropriate EPA Regional office (or federal agency, if other than EPA) that issued the section 106 administrative order (with a copy to the petitioner) soliciting a response ("Response") to the petition.² The Region will file either a limited response under section III.A.1 below, asserting that petitioner has not met one or more prerequisites for obtaining review, or a response on the merits in accordance with section III.A.2, also below.

1. Limited Response Addressing Prerequisites for Obtaining Review

If the Region contends that one or more of the four statutory prerequisites for obtaining review have not been met, the Region will raise those contentions by submitting a motion to dismiss the petition without reaching the merits of petitioner's claim. The motion should address only the petitioner's alleged failure to meet one or more of the prerequisites for obtaining review. Unless otherwise ordered by the Board, the Region's pleading is due within 30 days after the date of the Board's letter soliciting a response to the petition. The petitioner will then have 20 days, from the date the Region files its motion, to file a reply to the motion.

If the Region has filed a pleading moving to dismiss the petition for failure to meet one or more of the prerequisites for obtaining review, and after the petitioner has had the opportunity to respond, the Board may rule on any or all of the prerequisite issues or may defer ruling on them until it rules on the merits. The Region's filing of a responsive pleading in the nature of a motion to dismiss does not waive any of the Region's arguments with respect to the merits of the petitioner's claims. The Board's dismissal of a petition as premature on the ground that the petitioner has not completed the response action is without prejudice to the petitioner's refiling a petition for reimbursement at a subsequent time.

² For the purpose of this order the term "Region" refers to the EPA Region or other federal agency that issued the section 106 order.

2. Response on the Merits

If the Region does not contend or file a motion to dismiss the petition on the ground that the petitioner failed to satisfy one or more of the statutory prerequisites, the Region must submit a response addressing the merits of the petitioner's claims. The Region's response must be received by the Clerk of the Board within 60 days after the date of the Board's letter soliciting a response to the petition (unless a later date is specified by the Board). The Region's submission of a response addressing the merits of the petitioner's claims in no way limits the Board's authority to reject the petition for failure to satisfy one or more of the statutory prerequisites described in section II.B of these procedures.

3. *Certified Index and Copies of Documents*

The Region's response must be accompanied by: (1) a certified index to the administrative record that the Region compiled in connection with the issuance of the underlying CERCLA section 106(a) administrative order and (2) all documents that are relied on in the responsive pleading and that have not already been submitted by the petitioner.

B. Board Authority and Additional Briefing

In exercising its responsibilities, the Board will take all measures necessary for the efficient, fair, and impartial adjudication of issues arising in section 106(b) petitions. This may include, but is not limited to, the Board requiring, at any time, the petitioner and/or the Region to provide such supplemental briefing as the Board may deem necessary for an informed resolution of any of the issues presented. Briefs other than those expressly required by the Board may be submitted only with leave of the Board. Additionally, for good cause, the Board may relax or suspend the filing requirements prescribed by this order.

C. Evidentiary Hearing

CERCLA section 106(b), 42 U.S.C. § 9606(b), does not require that the agency issuing the order provide an evidentiary hearing on a reimbursement petition. However, the Board may, in its discretion, order an evidentiary hearing with respect to any issue of fact that it considers material to the resolution of the petition. The Board will designate an EPA employee who has had no prior involvement in the matter under review to serve as a hearing officer and to issue a recommended decision to the Board with respect to the issues addressed at the hearing. Both the Region and the petitioner will be expected to participate in the evidentiary hearing. A party's failure to participate may cause adverse inferences or conclusions to be drawn against that party with respect to any matter to be addressed at the proceedings.

D. Oral Argument

The Board may, in its discretion, schedule oral argument with respect to one or more specified issues, or the case as a whole, either in response to a request by a party or on its own initiative. It will notify the parties in writing of the place, time, and date of the argument, and, as appropriate,

the issues to be addressed. Oral arguments ordinarily take place at the EPA Administrative Courtroom, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, WJC East Building, Room 1152, 1201 Constitution Avenue, N.W., Washington, D.C. 20004. Parties may also participate via videoconference. The Board's website provides further information on oral arguments.

E. Stays and Withdrawals

The Board may exercise its discretion to stay action on a petition at any time, either while settlement discussions or judicial actions are proceeding or for other good cause. A petitioner may elect to withdraw its petition or to withdraw its claim from a petition submitted jointly with other petitioners. Whenever a petitioner withdraws a claim for reimbursement, the petitioner will be permitted to refile that claim only if the 60-day statutory deadline (measured from the date of completion of the required action) has not yet expired.

F. Board Decision

The Board will issue either a Final Decision and Order Granting Reimbursement or a Final Order Denying Reimbursement. It will issue a Final Decision and Order Granting Reimbursement if it determines that a petitioner is entitled to reimbursement of all or any portion of the costs claimed in the petition. It will issue a Final Order Denying Reimbursement only if it determines that no portion of the costs claimed by the petitioner should be reimbursed.

Final Decision and Order Granting Reimbursement. A Final Decision and Order Granting Reimbursement does not constitute the Agency's final action on the petition because the Board must still determine the amount of reimbursement to be awarded. When issuing a Final Decision and Order Granting Reimbursement, therefore, the Board will also direct the petitioner to file a brief with supporting documentation of all reasonable costs that it incurred in implementing the order. The Region will then be afforded an opportunity to respond and challenge particular cost items (as unreasonable or otherwise not recoverable), and the petitioner will be permitted to reply to those challenges, in accordance with a briefing schedule established by the Board. Upon granting a petition for reimbursement, the Board will notify the Assistant Administrator for the Office of Land and Emergency Management, formerly known as the Office of Solid Waste and Emergency Response. U.S. EPA Delegation of Authority 14-27, Petitions for Reimbursement § 3.a (rev. Jan. 18, 2017).

Final Order Denying Reimbursement. A Final Order Denying Reimbursement is the Agency's final decision with respect to the petitioner's claim. Under CERCLA section 106(b)(2)(B), a petitioner who wishes to file an action in the appropriate federal district court challenging a Final Order Denying Reimbursement must do so within 30 days of receipt of that Final Order. See 42 U.S.C § 9606(b)(2)(B).

After the cost issues have been briefed, the Board will issue a Final Decision Determining Reimbursable Costs and Authorizing Payment.

Final Decision Determining Reimbursable Costs and Authorizing Payment. A Final Decision Determining Reimbursable Costs and Authorizing Payment represents the Agency's final decision with respect to the petitioner's claim. Under CERCLA section 106(b)(2)(B), 42 U.S.C § 9606(b)(2)(B), a petitioner who wishes to file an action in the appropriate federal district court challenging a Final Decision Determining Reimbursable Costs and Authorizing Payment must do so within 30 days of receipt of the Board's decision.

The Board's Final Orders Denying Reimbursement, Final Decisions and Orders Granting Reimbursement, and Final Decisions Determining Reimbursable Costs and Authorizing Payment are available on the Board's website at www.epa.gov/eab. These decisions may also be available through online legal research services.

IV. FURTHER INFORMATION

For further information concerning the matters addressed in these procedures, contact the Clerk of the Board at: Environmental Appeals Board, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W., Mail Code 1103M, Washington, D.C. 20460-0001, (202) 233-0122; or clerk_eab@epa.gov. The office hours of the Clerk of the Board are 8:00 a.m. to 4:30 p.m., Monday through Friday (excluding federal holidays).

APPENDIX B

CERCLA Section 106(a), 42 U.S.C. § 9606(a), provides:

In addition to any other action taken by a State or local government, when the President determines that there may be an imminent and substantial endangerment to the public health or welfare or the environment because of an actual or threatened release of a hazardous substance from a facility, he may require the Attorney General of the United States to secure such relief as may be necessary to abate such danger or threat, and the district court of the United States in the district in which the threat occurs shall have jurisdiction to grant such relief as the public interest and the equities of the case may require. The President may also, after notice to the affected State, take other action under this section including, but not limited to, issuing such orders as may be necessary to protect public health and welfare and the environment.

CERCLA Section 106(b)(2), 42 U.S.C. § 9606(b)(2), provides:

- (A) Any person who receives and complies with the terms of any order issued under subsection (a) may, within 60 days after completion of the required action, petition the President for reimbursement from the Fund for the reasonable costs of such action, plus interest. Any interest payable under this paragraph shall accrue on the amounts expended from the date of expenditure at the same rate as specified for interest on investments of the Hazardous Substance Superfund established under subchapter A of chapter 98 of [the Internal Revenue Code].
- (B) If the President refuses to grant all or part of a petition made under this paragraph, the petitioner may within 30 days of receipt of such refusal file an action against the President in the appropriate United States district court seeking reimbursement from the Fund.
- (C) Except as provided in subparagraph (D), to obtain reimbursement, the petitioner shall establish by a preponderance of the evidence that it is not liable for response costs under section 9607(a) [CERCLA § 107(a)] and that costs for which it seeks reimbursement are reasonable in light of the action required by the relevant order.
- (D) A petitioner who is liable for response costs under section 9607(a) [CERCLA § 107(a)] may also recover its reasonable costs of response to the extent that it can demonstrate, on the administrative record, that the President's decision in selecting the response action ordered was arbitrary and capricious or was otherwise not in accordance with law. Reimbursement awarded under this subparagraph shall include all reasonable response costs incurred by the petitioner pursuant to the portions of the order found to be arbitrary and capricious or otherwise not in accordance with law.
- (E) Reimbursement awarded by a court under subparagraph (C) or (D) may include appropriate costs, fees, and other expenses in accordance with subsections (a) and (d) of section 2412 of Title 28 of the United States Code.