

**Summary Minutes of the
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee (CASAC) Ozone Review Panel for the
Reconsideration of the 2008 National Ambient Air Quality Standards (NAAQS)
Public Teleconference
March 23, 2011
9:30am – 1:30pm**

CASAC Ozone Review Panel for the Reconsideration of the 2008 Ozone National
Ambient Air Quality Standards (NAAQS):

Dr. Jonathan Samet, Chair
Dr. Kathy Weathers
Mr. George Allen
Dr. Joe Brain
Dr. Charlie Plopper
Mr. Rich Poirot
Dr. Fred Miller
Dr. Jack Harkema
Dr. Phil Hopke
Dr. Rogene Henderson
Dr. John Balmes
Dr. Lianne Sheppard
Dr. Frank Speizer
Dr. Sverre Vedal
Dr. Morton Lippmann
Dr. James Gauderman
Dr. James Ultman
Dr. Michael Kleinman
Dr. Maria Morandi
Dr. Barbara Zielinska
Dr. Allen Legge

Purpose: To discuss CASAC's draft letter on the ozone reconsideration.

Designated Federal Officer (DFO): Dr. Holly Stallworth

Other EPA Staff:

Brown, James
Buckley, Barbara
Johns, Doug
Langstaff, John
Long, Tom
Martin, Karen
Owens, Beth
Sandiford, Vicki

Silver, Monica
Wegman, Lydia
Zachek, Christine

Public:

Aucoin, Vivian (Louisiana Department of Environmental Quality)
Cooke, Gail (New Mexico Air Quality Bureau)
Forgren, Frank (State of Nevada)
Gephart, Larry (ExxonMobil Biomedical Sciences, Inc.)
Goodman, Julie (Gradient)
Heuss, Jon (Air Improvement Resource)
Jones, Mark (state of New Mexico)
Langworthy, Cindy (Hunton & Williams)
Neeraja Erraguntla (Texas Commission on Environmental Quality)
Nelson, Gabe (Environment & Energy Publishing)
Nelson, Gabe (Greenwire)
Pendery, Bruce (Wyoming Outdoor Council)
Prete, Phil (City of Wilmington, NC)
Richmond, Harvey (Abt Associates)
Shprentz, Deborah (Consultant to American Lung Association)
Steichen, Ted (American Petroleum Institute)
Wilson, Linda (New York Attorney General's Office)

Meeting Materials and Meeting Webpage:

The materials listed below may be found on the meeting webpage at:
<http://yosemite.epa.gov/sab/sabproduct.nsf/bf498bd32a1c7fdf85257242006dd6cb/f352c68095691565852578340063f7c7!OpenDocument&Date=2011-03-23>

- Agenda
- Federal Register Notice
- Public Comments
- Draft Letter on the Ozone Reconsideration dated 3-17-11

Meeting Summary

The discussion followed the plan presented in the meeting agenda.

WEDNESDAY, MARCH 23, 2011

Dr. Stallworth convened the meeting and explained that CASAC operates under the Federal Advisory Committee Act.

Dr. Samet led the Panel through a discussion of the draft letter posted at the URL above. Panelists discussed the meaning of “clinically significant” and decided to include a reference to the American Thoracic Society definition. In reference to the draft letter’s description of public comments, panelists agreed that the letter should say some questions were raised about the evidence of health effects at the lower end of the ozone

concentration range in the U.S. Panelists also agreed to a minor change in the language referencing public comments on the policy relevant background. In reference to charge question 3, it was agreed that a few sentences on the Brown reanalysis of the Adams study should be added. Minor edits were suggested for questions 4 and 6. With respect to question 7, Dr. Karen Martin of EPA's Office of Air Quality Planning and Standards pointed out that Table 1 shows the number of children that would experience exposures above, for example, 80 ppb without implying anything about experiencing health effects at the lower levels of exposure. Dr. Martin said Table 2 estimates health effects for children in a subset of cities that would be caused by exposures lower than the benchmark levels (as well as above benchmark levels). Panelists discussed how to describe the public health significance based on exposure information and agreed to delete any subjective terms like "small" and instead rely on numerical estimates. One panelist noted that direct use of Table 1 to make inferences about the public health significance of various standards requires an assumption that there is a threshold at the benchmark level of concern. In reference to charge question 8, panelists discussed how to improve the language that states that CASAC did not rely solely on estimates of ozone-related mortality in making in recommendations in 2006 and 2008. Panelists agreed that CASAC should offer some disclaimer to specify that it did not rely on the risk assessment of ozone mortality. Panelists decided to export some of the general concluding language in charge question 8 to charge question 1.

Dr. Samet asked for revisions to be sent to the DFO as soon as possible so that the letter could be finalized and transmitted to the Administrator within a few days.

On Behalf of the Committee,
Respectfully Submitted,

Holly Stallworth, Ph.D. /s/
Designated Federal Officer

Certified as True:

Jonathan Samet, M.D. /s/
Chair, Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee
Sulfur Oxides Primary NAAQS Review Panel

NOTE AND DISCLAIMER: The minutes of this public meeting reflect diverse ideas and suggestions offered by committee members during the course of deliberations within the meeting. Such ideas, suggestions, and deliberations do not necessarily reflect definitive consensus advice from the panel members. The reader is cautioned to not rely on the minutes represent final, approved, consensus advice and recommendations offered to the Agency. Such advice and recommendations may be found in the final advisories, commentaries, letters, or reports prepared and transmitted to the EPA Administrator following the public meetings