

**Summary Minutes of the
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Science Advisory Board
Chemical Assessment Advisory Committee Augmented for the
Review of the Draft IRIS Ammonia Assessment (CAAC-Ammonia Panel)
Public Teleconference
December 19, 2014**

CAAC-Ammonia Panel Members:

Dr. Michael Dourson, CHAIR
Dr. Daniel Acosta
Dr. Henry Anderson
Dr. Scott Bartell
Dr. Arthur Cooper
Dr. David Eastmond
Dr. William Michael Foster
Dr. Russ Hauser
Dr. Abby A. Li
Dr. Jacob McDonald
Dr. Maria Morandi
Dr. Victoria Persky
Dr. Kenneth Ramos
Dr. Alan Stern
Dr. I. David Weiner

Location: via telephone only

Purpose: To continue reviewing and discussing the panel's November 14, 2014 draft report of the EPA's IRIS Toxicological Review of Ammonia (August 2013 External Review Draft, EPA/635/R-13/139a) and EPA's progress in addressing the NRC recommendations to improve the development of IRIS assessments.

Attendees: see Appendix A

Meeting Materials and Meeting Webpage:

The materials listed below may be found on the meeting webpage at:

<http://yosemite.epa.gov/sab/sabproduct.nsf/MeetingCal/1E648E3C931692BA85257D8700654910?OpenDocument>

- Agenda
- Federal Register Notice
- Agency Charge
- Draft Report
 - Science Advisory Board Review of the IRIS Draft Toxicological Review of Ammonia (11/14/14 draft)
- Committee-Developed or Provided Background Material
 - Comments submitted by Dr. Abby Li.
 - Comments submitted by Dr. Dave Eastmond

- Comments submitted by Dr. Maria Morandi

Meeting Summary:

The discussion of the charge questions continued from where the panel ended its discussion during the December 17, 2014 teleconference.

Opening Remarks:

Dr. Shallal, DFO of the CAAC-Ammonia panel, convened the meeting and called the roll. All panel members were present except, Dr. Acosta, Dr. Hauser, Dr. McDonald, Dr. Persky and Dr. Stern. Dr. Shallal welcomed panel members and members of the public to the continuation of the December 17th teleconference to complete the discussion of the panel's draft report. She explained that the SAB CAAC-Ammonia Panel operates under the auspices of the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA). The DFO stated that the SAB consists entirely of special government employees (SGEs) appointed by EPA to their positions. As SGEs, chartered SAB members are subject to all applicable ethics laws and implementing regulations. EPA has determined that advisors participating in this meeting have no financial conflicts of interest or appearance of a loss relating to the topic of this meeting.

The DFO then noted that Dr. Dourson disclosed during the panel's December 17th teleconference that he had recently applied for a position as Director of EPA's IRIS Program. Since it is the SAB Staff Office Director that makes the final determination of whether a member can serve on an advisory panel, the DFO took the opportunity to clarify some of the factors that the SAB staff office considered before determining if Dr. Dourson could continue to participate in this advisory activity.

- 1) Seeking employment with the agency while participating in an SAB review does not violate federal ethics regulations.
- 2) In reference to questions arising about a member's objectivity, the SAB Staff Office noted that Dr. Dourson sought employment with EPA as a Director of the IRIS Program after the deliberations on the charge questions had already taken place and the panel had already made significant progress on developing their recommendations. Therefore, the SAB Staff Office Director made the determination that Dr. Dourson may continue to serve as Chair of the CAAC-Ammonia Review Panel at this time.

Panel Deliberations:

Dr. Dourson asked panel members if they had additional comments on Charge Question G1 and then continued with the meeting agenda.

The panel discussed each of the charge questions and agreed to several action items, as follows:

- On page 36, delete line 24-26 and any other place in the report where it is repeated.
- Revise paragraph with Dr, Morandi's submission
- Change NH₃ to ammonia
- Remove some of the endogenous ammonia discussion and place it in the "additional comments" section in the appendix
- The table provided by Dr. Li will be replaced. A description will be provided of the items that should be included in such a table rather than a sample table.

- On page 32, comments 1-8 will be distributed throughout the report as footnotes or added to the appendix.
- On page 21, recommendation #4 is for future assessments and recommendation #5- see revision on page 21.
- The draft report's Executive Summary should be revised to include changes made in the body of the report.
- On page 12, line 15 should be removed.
- Clarification is needed as to whether recommendations for the Preamble should be incorporated in the current assessment or for future assessments.
- In the letter to the Administrator- improve the paragraph on endogenous ammonia and change "appendix" to "appendices".

At the conclusion of the panel's discussion, Dr. Dourson asked EPA representatives and members of the public if they wished to present clarifying comments. No one had any comments for the panel's consideration.

Next Steps:

Dr. Li was asked to provide caveats for the use of the Satpute et al. study.

Dr. Dourson was asked to provide a bridge sentence for the endogenous ammonia section of the report.

Dr. Morandi was asked to provide a sentence to be inserted on page 10, line 14.

Members were asked to complete their assignments by January 2.

A draft report with the revisions incorporated would be sent for member's review and comments by about January 23. Member comments would be due about 2 weeks later, by February 6.

The teleconference meeting was adjourned at approximately 4:15 pm eastern time.

Respectfully Submitted,

 /s/
 Suhair Shallal, Ph.D.
 Designated Federal Officer

Certified as Accurate:

 /s/
 Michael Dourson, Ph.D.
 Chair, SAB CAAC-Ammonia Review Panel

NOTE AND DISCLAIMER: The minutes of this public meeting reflect diverse ideas and suggestions offered by panel members during the course of deliberations within the meeting. Such ideas, suggestions, and deliberations do not necessarily reflect definitive consensus advice from the panel members. The reader is cautioned to not rely on the minutes to represent final, approved, consensus advice and recommendations offered to the Agency. Such advice and recommendations may be found in the final advisories, commentaries, letters, or reports prepared and transmitted to the EPA Administrator following the public meetings.

APPENDIX A

List of Attendees- December 19, 2014 teleconference

<u>Name</u>	<u>Affiliation</u>
Wade Foster	TFI
Nancy Beck	ACC
Arthur A. Ransome	CH-IV
Ernie Megginson	Magnolia LNG
Wanda Deal	USAF
Vince Cogliano	EPA
Samantha Jones	EPA
Sue Rieth	EPA
Amanda Persad	EPA
David Reynolds	Inside EPA
Christine Ross	EPA
Haylie Choi	RegNet Environmental Services
Robert Fensterheim	RegNet Environmental Services