

**Summary Minutes of the  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA)  
Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee (CASAC)  
Lead Review Panel  
Public Teleconference  
May 30, 2012**

Date and Time: Wednesday, May 30, 2012, 12:00 PM – 3:00 PM ET

Location: Teleconference Only

Purpose: The purpose of the meeting was to discuss the CASAC Lead Review Panel's 05-16-12 Draft Review of the EPA's Integrated Science Assessment (ISA) for Lead (Second External Review Draft – February 2012)

Participants: Lead Review Panel (for full roster, see Attachment A)

Dr. H. Christopher Frey, Chair

Mr. George Allen

Dr. Herbert Allen

Dr. Richard Canfield

Dr. Cliff Davidson

Dr. Sean Hays

Dr. Susan Korrick

Dr. Michael Kosnett

Dr. Roman Lanno

Mr. Richard Poirot

Dr. Joel Pounds

Dr. Michael Rabinowitz

Dr. William Stubblefield

Dr. Ian von Lindern

Dr. Gail Wasserman

Mr. Aaron Yeow, Designated Federal Officer (DFO)

**Wednesday, May 30, 2012**

**Opening Remarks**

Mr. Aaron Yeow, the DFO for the CASAC Lead Review Panel took roll and opened the meeting. He noted that as required under the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA), the Panel's deliberations are held in public with advanced notice given in the Federal Register<sup>1</sup>, and the meeting minutes will be made publicly available after the meeting. He noted that there was one registered public speaker and a copy of the oral statement was available on the meeting webpage. He also noted that the SAB Staff Office determined that there were no issues with

conflict-of-interest or appearance of a lack of impartiality for any of the advisory panel members participating in the review. He then turned the meeting over to Dr. Chris Frey, Chair of the CASAC Lead Review Panel.

Dr. Frey welcomed everyone, stated the purpose of the teleconference was to review the Panel's draft review of EPA's 2<sup>nd</sup> Draft Lead ISA, and reviewed the Agenda<sup>2</sup>.

### **Public Comments**

Stephanie Shirley, Texas Commission on Environmental Quality, presented her oral statement<sup>3</sup> and stated that the draft ISA frequently confuses associations with causations. She stated that the discussion of lead exposure and IQ did not adequately address uncertainties and confounders. Lastly she stated that inhalation of Pb is a minor exposure pathway compared to other exposure pathways. One panel member asked her which confounders in the Pb-IQ literature she found were not addressed. She indicated it was mainly paternal IQ, which another panel member stated was addressed in some of her studies.

### **Discussion of Consensus Responses**

The Panel proceeded through the Consensus Responses. There was some discussion on how to clarify the statement in the response to the Chapter 1 charge question on the reversibility of health effects. For the response to Chapter 3 charge questions, there was some discussion on Pb wheel weights and it was agreed to add a sentence stating that EPA should review a particular recent study on Pb wheel weights. For the response to the Chapter 5 charge questions, there was some discussion on refining the comment regarding the need for utilizing experts in psychometric assessment as well as clarifying the comment on short duration exposures. For the response to the Chapter 6 charge questions, there was discussion of adding a bullet regarding the potential susceptibility of African Americans to lead possibly arising from factors not mediated by SES or exposure. There was also discussion about adding a statement that the discussion of the effect of fluoridation on lead exposure in the Integrative Summary was not supported by the literature and should be removed.

### **Discussion of Letter to Administrator**

The Panel proceeded through the Letter to the Administrator with recommendations to improve the clarity and had some discussion on the need for an overarching comment that states that the ISA presents the discussion of many studies in an encyclopedic fashion, lacking an integrative synthesis.

The Panel and the members of CASAC were satisfied with the letter/report with the changes discussed and did not have any further comments.

With business concluded, the meeting was adjourned by the DFO at 2:15 pm.

Respectfully Submitted:

Certified as Accurate:

*/SIGNED/*

*/SIGNED/*

---

Mr. Aaron Yeow  
Designated Federal Officer  
EPA SAB Staff Office

---

Dr. H. Christopher Frey  
Chair  
CASAC Lead Review Panel

NOTE AND DISCLAIMER: The minutes of this public meeting reflect diverse ideas and suggestions offered by Panel members during the course of deliberations within the meeting. Such ideas, suggestions and deliberations do not necessarily reflect consensus advice from the Panel members. The reader is cautioned to not rely on the minutes to represent final, approved, consensus advice and recommendations offered to the Agency. Such advice and recommendations may be found in the final advisories, commentaries, letters or reports prepared and transmitted to the EPA Administrator following the public meetings.

## Materials Cited

The following meeting materials are available on the CASAC website:

<http://www.epa.gov/casac>, at the [May 30, 2012 CASAC Lead Review Panel Meeting page](#):

---

<sup>1</sup> Federal Register Notice Announcing the Meeting

<sup>2</sup> Agenda for May 30, 2012 Public Meeting

<sup>3</sup> Oral Statement from Stephanie Shirley, Texas Commission on Environmental Quality

## **ATTACHMENT A - ROSTER**

### **U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee CASAC Lead Review Panel**

#### **CHAIR**

**Dr. H. Christopher Frey**, Professor, Department of Civil, Construction and Environmental Engineering, College of Engineering, North Carolina State University, Raleigh, NC

#### **CASAC MEMBER**

**Mr. George A. Allen**, Senior Scientist, Northeast States for Coordinated Air Use Management (NESCAUM), Boston, MA

#### **CONSULTANTS**

**Dr. Herbert Allen**, Professor Emeritus, Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering, University of Delaware, Newark, DE

**Dr. Richard Canfield**, Senior Research Associate, Division of Nutritional Sciences, Cornell University, Ithaca, NY

**Dr. Deborah Cory-Slechta**, Professor, Department of Environmental Medicine, School of Medicine and Dentistry, University of Rochester, Rochester, NY

**Dr. Cliff Davidson**, Professor, Civil and Environmental Engineering, Syracuse University, Syracuse, NY

**Dr. Philip E. Goodrum**, Senior Consultant, Cardno ENTRIX, Syracuse, NY

**Dr. Sean Hays**, President, Summit Toxicology, Allenspark, CO

**Dr. Philip Hopke**, Bayard D. Clarkson Distinguished Professor, Department of Chemical and Biomolecular Engineering, Clarkson University, Potsdam, NY

**Dr. Chris Johnson**, Professor, Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering, Syracuse University, Syracuse, NY

**Dr. Susan Korrick**, Assistant Professor of Medicine, Department of Medicine, Brigham and Women's Hospital, Channing Laboratory, Harvard Medical School, Boston, MA

**Dr. Michael Kosnett**, Associate Clinical Professor, Division of Clinical Pharmacology and Toxicology, Department of Medicine, University of Colorado School of Medicine, Denver, CO

**Dr. Roman Lanno**, Associate Professor and Associate Chair, Department of Evolution, Ecology, and Organismal Biology, Ohio State University, Columbus, OH

**Mr. Richard L. Poirot**, Environmental Analyst, Air Pollution Control Division, Department of Environmental Conservation, Vermont Agency of Natural Resources, Waterbury, VT

**Dr. Joel G. Pounds**, Laboratory Fellow, Cell Biology & Biochemistry, Biological Sciences Division, Pacific Northwest National Laboratory, Richland, WA

**Dr. Michael Rabinowitz**, Geochemist, Marine Biological Laboratory, Newport, RI

**Dr. William Stubblefield**, Senior Research Professor, Department of Molecular and Environmental Toxicology, Oregon State University, Corvallis, OR

**Dr. Ian von Lindern**, President, TerraGraphics Environmental Engineering, Inc., Moscow, ID

**Dr. Gail Wasserman**, Professor of Clinical Psychology in Child Psychiatry, Division of Child and Adolescent Psychiatry, College of Physicians and Surgeons, Columbia University, New York, NY

**Dr. Michael Weitzman**, Professor, Pediatrics; Psychiatry, New York University School of Medicine, New York, NY

#### **SCIENCE ADVISORY BOARD STAFF**

**Mr. Aaron Yeow**, Designated Federal Officer, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Science Advisory Board, Washington, DC

**ATTACHMENT B – Other Attendees**  
**CASAC Lead Review Panel Public Teleconference**  
(Persons who requested the teleconference call-in number or indicated they were on the call)

**May 30, 2012**

<b>Name</b>	<b>Affiliation</b>
Brown, James	EPA
Deitrich, Casey	FDCH
Dubois, Jean Jacques	EPA
Hopkinson, Jenny	InsideEPA
Hoyer, Marion	EPA
Jacobs, Jeremy	Greenwire
Kirrane, Ellen	EPA
Kotchmar, Dennis	EPA
Lassiter, Meredith	EPA
Murphy, Deirdre	EPA
Nystrom, Marci	California Air Resources Board
Orlin, David	EPA
Owens, Elizabeth	EPA
Patel, Molini	EPA
Richmond-Bryant, Jennifer	EPA
Ross, Mary	EPA
Shirley, Stephanie	Texas Commission on Environmental Quality
Stanek, Lindsay	EPA
Tennant, Ginger	EPA
Vinikoor-Imler, Lisa	EPA
Walsh, Debra	EPA
Wilson, Linda	NYS Office of the Attorney General