

Summary Minutes of the  
Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee  
Ozone Review Panel for the Reconsideration of the 2008 Ozone NAAQS  
Public Teleconference  
January 25, 2010

Committee Members: Dr. Jonathan Samet, Chair  
Dr. John Balmes  
Dr. Ellis Cowling  
Dr. James Crapo  
Dr. James Gauderman  
Dr. Paul Hanson  
Dr. Jack Harkema  
Dr. Rogene Henderson  
Dr. Philip Hopke  
Dr. Michael Kleinman  
Dr. Allan Legge  
Dr. Fred Miller  
Dr. Maria Morandi  
Dr. Charles Plopper  
Mr. Richard Poirot  
Dr. Armistead (Ted) Russell  
Dr. Elizabeth (Lianne) Sheppard  
Dr. Frank Speizer  
Dr. James Ultman  
Dr. Barbara Zielinska

Not in Attendance: Dr. Morton Lippmann  
Dr. Sverre Vedal

Date and Time: January 25, 2010: 10:00 am – 1:00 pm

Purpose: The Clean Air Scientific Committee Review Panel (CASAC) reviewed EPA’s proposed Ozone National Ambient Air Quality Standard proposed in the *Federal Register* on 1-19-10.

SAB Staff: Dr. Holly Stallworth, Designated Federal Officer

Other EPA Staff: Lydia Wegman, Karen Martin, John J. Kelly, Susan Stone, Tim Benner, Gilberto Alvarez

Public Commenters: Greg Schaefer, Arch Coal  
Roger McClellan, Advisor

Nick Goldstein, American Road & Transportation Builders Association

Other:

Paul Nazaryk, BHP Billiton, New Mexico Coal  
Stuart Parker, Inside Washington Publishers  
Andrew Childers, BNA, Daily Environment Report\*  
Deborah Shprentz, Consultant to the American Lung Association\*  
Tamara McCann Thies, National Cattlemen's Beef Association  
Linda Wilson, state of New York\*  
Deb McGuire, NE Department of Environmental Quality\*  
Laura L. LaValle, Beveridge & Diamond, P.C.\*  
Heidi King, OMB  
Scott DiBiase, Pinal County Air Quality, AZ\*  
Harvey Richmond, retired EPA  
Steve Gouze, California Air Resources Board\*  
Stephanie Tsao, NRG Energy, Princeton, NJ\*  
Verne Shortell, NRG  
David Bacher, NRG\*  
Cindy Karlic, NRG  
Jeff Davis, NRG  
Gary Ellender, NRG  
Trevor Woods, Credit-Suisse  
Jon Kallen, MidAmerican Energy  
Diane L. Arnst, Arizona Department of Environmental Quality  
Doug Austin, Institute of Clean Air Companies  
Leslie May, Calpine Corporation\*  
John Hampp, FPL Corporate Environmental\*  
Scott Park, Florence County, SC\*  
Sandra E. Yúdice , County of Greenville, South Carolina\*  
Kenneth Hancock, American Nurses Association  
Tiffany Drake, Department of Natural Resources, Missouri  
Larry Gephart, ExxonMobil Biomedical Sciences\*  
Annette G. Habetz, PPG Industries, Inc.  
Maria J. Zufall, Georgia Pacific  
Virginia Collins, Ministry of the Environment, Ontario, Canada\*  
Robyn Prueitt, Gradient\*  
Michael George, National Park Service  
Adele Noel, County of Travis, TX\*  
Linda Smith, California EPA  
Timothy M. Duerr, Alliance Pickens\*  
Bruce Henderson, Charlotte Observer  
Brian Barnes, SC Dept. of Health and Env. Control\*

Pamela Najor, Argus Air Daily\*  
Melinda C. Mathias, Bureau of Air Quality, Columbia, SC\*  
Henry Phillips, SC Dept. of Trans. \*  
Lucinda Roth, San Joaquin Valley, CA\*  
Ted Steichen, American Petroleum Institute\*  
Wanda Briget, Peabody\*  
Joe Suchecki, Engine Manufacturers Association\*

*\* These individuals announced themselves on the call. Others listed above requested the phone number but did not announce themselves.*

### Meeting Summary

The discussion followed the issues and general timing as presented in the meeting agenda. The meeting agenda, Federal Register Notice and public comments from American Road and Transportation Builders Association, American Lung Association, Arch Coal, Inc. and Dr. Roger McClellan may be found at this URL:

<http://yosemite.epa.gov/sab/sabproduct.nsf/bf498bd32a1c7fdf85257242006dd6cb/3b22e6307e3abe778525767f00612270!OpenDocument&Date=2010-01-25>

### **MONDAY, JANUARY 25, 2010**

#### Opening of Public Meeting

Dr. Holly Stallworth, Designated Federal Officer (DFO), opened the meeting with a statement that the CASAC Ozone Review Panel is a federal advisory committee whose meetings and deliberations meet the requirements of the Federal Advisory Committee Act. Dr. Samet reviewed the agenda and purpose of the meeting.

Ms. Lydia Wegman of EPA's Office of Air Quality Planning and Standards summarized the proposed Ozone standards announced in the *Federal Register* on January 19, 2010. Three public commenters then presented their remarks. Greg Schaefer from Arch Coal presented comments emphasizing high ozone background levels in Wyoming. Roger McClellan presented comments that criticized CASAC for recommending policy to EPA. Nick Goldstein, American Road & Transportation Builders Association, presented comments that emphasized the effect of increased non-attainment designations on federal highway funding and hence roadbuilding.

Following these public commenters, Dr. Samet directed the panel to discussion of the proposed NAAQS standards. Panelists unanimously expressed support for EPA's proposed standard of 0.060 – 0.070 parts per million (ppm) for the 8-hour primary ozone standard. One panelist asked to what extent EPA had taken background levels into consideration. Others suggested background levels had been covered extensively in the Staff Paper. Several panelists expressed the opinion that CASAC should not be involved in issues of implementation. Panelists agreed to suggest in its letter to the Administrator that EPA consider background levels as it implements the new standards.

Panelists also voiced unanimous support for EPA's proposed new cumulative, seasonal standard expressed as an annual index of the sum of weighted hourly concentrations (i.e., the W126 form), cumulated over 12 hours per day (8am to 8pm) during the consecutive 3-month period within the ozone season with the maximum index value, set as a level within the range of 7 to 15 ppm-hours. Panelists discussed the propagation of uncertainty in developing the new W126 form and agreed to recommend in its letter that EPA collect information and carry out research that would enable continuous improvement of the W126 measure.

In concluding the meeting, Dr. Stallworth said that a draft letter to the Administrator would be shared with the panel for their comment and would be transmitted to the Administrator shortly thereafter.

Respectfully Submitted:

Holly Stallworth, Ph.D. /s/  
Designated Federal Officer

Certified as True:

Jonathan Samet, M.D., M.S. /s/  
Chair

NOTE AND DISCLAIMER: The minutes of this public meeting reflect diverse ideas and suggestions offered by Committee member during the course of deliberations within the meeting. Such ideas, suggestions and deliberations do not necessarily reflect consensus advice from the panel members. The reader is cautioned to not rely on the minutes to represent final, approved, consensus advice and recommendations offered to the Agency. Such advice and recommendations may be found in the final advisories, commentaries, letters or reports prepared and transmitted to the EPA Administrator following the public meetings.