#### UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

REGION 2 290 BROADWAY NEW YORK, NY 10007-1866

## FEB 1 7 2011 OVERNIGHT DELIVERY AND FACSIMILE

Benjamín Hernández Nieves, Esq. 268 Ponce de Leon Ave. The Hato Rey Center Building, Suite 513 Hato Rey, P.R. 00918

Re:

In the Matter of Oliver Exterminating

Docket No. FIFRA-02-2010-5305

Dear Mr. Hernández:

Enclosed is a copy of the Consent Agreement and Final Order ("CA/FO") in the above referenced proceeding signed by the Regional Judicial Officer of the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region 2.

Please note that payment is due within forty-five (45) days of signature of the Final Order by the Regional Judicial Officer. Please arrange for payment of the entire penalty according to the instructions given in that Order.

Sincerely yours,

H. L. Velez Cruz by CHP. F. Héctor L. Vélez Cruz, Esq.

Assistant Regional Counsel

cc: Juan Carlos Muñoz Roberto Rivera Puerto Rico Department of Agriculture Laboratorio Agrologico Numero 7 Carretera 693, Km. 4.0 Dorado, P. R. 00646-3445

Carl A.Soderberg, Director CEPD

Internet Address (URL) • http://www.epa.gov
Recycled/Recyclable • Printed with Vegetable Oil Based Inks on 100% Postconsumer, Process Chlorine Free Recycled Paper

bcc: Lizette Lugo, CEPD

John Martin, PAD

Linda Hall, DECA-PTSB Adrian Enache, DECA-PTSB Richard Koustas, DECA-PTSB

Coles Phinizy, ORC-WTS

Héctor L. Vélez Cruz, ORC-CT

# UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY REGION 2

IN THE MATTER OF:

**Oliver Exterminating** 

**RESPONDENT** 

Proceeding Under the Federal Insecticide, Fungicide and Rodenticide Act, as amended.

# CONSENT AGREEMENT AND FINAL ORDER

Docket No. FIFRA-02-2010-5305

#### PRELIMINARY STATEMENT

This administrative proceeding for the assessment of a civil penalty is initiated pursuant to Section 14(a) of the Federal Insecticide, Fungicide and Rodenticide Act, as amended, 7 U.S.C. Section 136/(a) (hereinafter referred to as "FIFRA" or the "Act").

Complainant in this proceeding is the Director of the Division of Enforcement and Compliance Assistance, United States Environmental Protection Agency ("EPA" or "Agency"), Region 2. Complainant and Respondent, Oliver Exterminating, agree that settling this matter by entering into this Consent Agreement and Final Order (CA/FO) pursuant to 40 C.F.R. Section 22.18(b) of the Consolidated Rules of Practice Governing the Administrative Assessment of Civil Penalties, 40 C.F.R. Part 22 (hereinafter "CROP"), is an appropriate means of resolving this matter without further litigation.

#### **EPA'S FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW**

- 1. On September 30, 2010, EPA issued a Complaint to Respondent for the assessment of a civil penalty, pursuant to Section 14(a) of the Act.
- 2. The Complaint alleged that on or about August 7, 2009, Respondent was hired by Mr. Celso González Anaya, owner of a wooden house located on Road No. 108, Km. 9.1, Mayagüez, Puerto Rico, to conduct pesticide applications throughout the property to eliminate an infestation of termites.
- 3. The Complaint also alleged that Respondent failed to comply with the requirements of the Vikane label by failing to:
  - a. provide Mr. Celso González with the Fact Sheet for Vikane prior to the parties entering into a fumigation agreement;
  - notify Mr. Celso González that he had to remove edible items from the structure before the fumigation if they could not be adequately sealed to prevent exposure to the product; and
  - c. post all entrances to the fumigated areas with signs bearing, in English and Spanish the signal word DANGER/PELIGRO, "Area under fumigation, DO NOT ENTER/NO ENTRE," date of fumigation, name of fumigant used, and name, address, and telephone number of the applicator.

- 4. Respondent's failure to comply with the specific requirements of the Vikane label is a violation of FIFRA §12(a)(2)(G), which makes unlawful the use of any registered pesticide in a manner inconsistent with its labeling.
- 5. The Complaint proposed a penalty of \$6,804.00.
- On November 5, 2010, Respondent filed an answer to the Complaint, denying certain facts, admitting others, raising affirmative defenses and requesting a hearing.

#### **CONSENT AGREEMENT**

Based upon the foregoing, and pursuant to Section 14(a) FIFRA, as amended, 7 U.S.C. § 136/(a), and 40 C.F.R. § 22. 18 of the CROP, it is hereby agreed by and between Complainant and Respondent, and voluntarily accepted by Respondent, that, for purposes of this Consent Agreement and in the interest of settling this matter expeditiously without the time, expense or uncertainty of a formal adjudicatory hearing on the merits, Respondent: (a) admits the jurisdictional allegations of the Complaint; (b) neither admits nor denies the non-jurisdictional allegations of the Complaint; (c) neither admits nor denies the EPA Findings of Fact or Conclusions of Law as set forth in this document; (d) consents to the assessment of the civil penalty as set forth below; (e) consents to the issuance of the Final Order accompanying this Consent Agreement;

and (f) waives its right to seek and obtain judicial review of, or otherwise contest, said Final Order.

Pursuant to 40 C.F.R. § 22.31 (b), the executed CA/FO shall become effective and binding when filed with the Regional Hearing Clerk of the Agency, Region 2.

It is further hereby agreed by and between Complainant and Respondent, and voluntarily accepted by Respondent, that there shall be compliance with the following terms and conditions:

- Respondent shall pay a civil penalty, on or before 45 calendar days after the date
  of signature of the Final Order at the end of this document, in the amount of FIVE
  THOUSAND EIGHT HUNDRED FOUR DOLLARS (\$5,804.00) in settlement of
  this case.
- 2. Payment in accordance with the terms and schedule of this Consent Agreement shall be made by cashier's check, certified check or by electronic fund transfer (EFT). If payment is made by cashier's check or by certified check, such check shall be made payable to the "Treasurer, United States of America," and shall be identified with a notation thereon listing the following: *In re Oliver Exterminating*, Docket Number FIFRA-02-2010-5305. If payment is made by either form of check, such payment shall be mailed to the following address:

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Fines and Penalties Cincinnati Finance Center P.O. Box 979077 St. Louis, Missouri 63197-9000

- 3. Alternatively, if Respondent chooses to make payment by EFT, Respondent shall then provide the following information to its remitter bank when payment is made:
  - a. Amount of Payment
  - b. SWIFT address: FRNYUS33, 33 Liberty Street, New York, New York 10045
  - c. Account Code for Federal Reserve Bank of New York receiving payment: **68010727**
  - d. Federal Reserve Bank of New York ABA routing number: 021030004
  - e. Field Tag.4200 of the Fedwire message should read:

    D 68010727 Environmental Protection Agency
  - f. Name of Respondent: Oliver Exterminating
  - g. Case docket number: FIFRA-02-2010-5305

#### 4. Payment instructions:

- a. Payment shall be in accordance with the instructions set forth in paragraphs 1-3 of this section, above. If Respondent makes the payment by cashier's check or certified check, then such check shall be *received* at the above-listed address on or before the date specified. If Respondent makes the payment by the EFT method, then the EFT shall be *received* on or before the date specified.
- Whether Respondent makes payment by cashier's check, certified
   check or by the EFT method, Respondent shall promptly after such

payment has been made furnish reasonable proof that it has been made, and such proof shall be furnished to both:

Héctor L. Vélez Cruz, Esq.
Assistant Regional Counsel
Office of Regional Counsel
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region 2
Centro Europa Bldg., Suite 417
1492 Ponce de León Avenue
San Juan, Puerto Rico 00907-4127;

and

Karen Maples
Regional Hearing Clerk
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region 2
290 Broadway, 16<sup>th</sup> Floor
New York, N.Y. 10007-1866.

- c. Failure to pay the penalty in full according to the above provisions will result in referral of this matter to the United States Department of Justice or the United States Department of the Treasury for collection or other appropriate action.
- d. Furthermore, if the payment is not received on or before its due date, interest will be assessed at the annual rate established by the Secretary of the Treasury pursuant to the Debt Collection Act, 31 U.S.C. § 3717, on the overdue amount from the due date through the date of payment. In addition, a late payment handling charge of fifteen dollars (\$15.00) will be assessed for each thirty (30) day

- period (or any portion thereof) following the due date in which the balance remains unpaid.
- e. A 6% per annum penalty also will be applied on any principal amount not paid within 90 days of its due date. Any such non-payment penalty charge on the debt will accrue from the date the penalty payment becomes due and is not paid.
- 5. The civil penalty provided for in this section constitutes a penalty within the meaning of 26 U.S.C. § 162(f).
- 6. By entering this Consent Agreement, Respondent hereby certifies to the best of the knowledge of the responsible official of Respondent that is in compliance with applicable FIFRA statutory and regulatory requirements with respect to any pesticide that it distributes and sells, offers for sale, holds for sale, holds for distribution and/or holds for shipment, and shall maintain such compliance.
- 7. Complainant shall mail to Respondent (to the representative designated below) a copy of the fully executed *CA/FO*, and Respondent consents to service of the *CA/FO* upon it by an employee of EPA other than the Regional Hearing Clerk of EPA, Region 2:

Benjamín Hernández Nieves, Esq. P. O. Box 8343 Fernández Junco Station San Juan, Puerto Rico 00910-0343

- 8. Respondent has read this Consent Agreement, understands its terms, and consents to the issuance of the Final Order accompanying this Consent Agreement and consents to making full payment of the civil penalty in accordance with the terms and schedule set forth above.
- 9. This CA/FO is not intended, and shall not be construed, to waive, extinguish or otherwise affect Respondent's obligation to comply with all applicable federal, state and local law and regulations, nor is it intended or to be construed to be a ruling on or determination of any issue related to any federal, state or local permit.
- 10. This Consent Agreement is being voluntarily and knowingly entered into by the parties to resolve (conditional upon full payment of the civil penalty in accordance with the terms and conditions set forth herein) the administrative claims alleged in the Complaint bearing docket number FIFRA-02-2010-5305. Notwithstanding the above, nothing herein shall affect the right of the EPA or the United States to pursue appropriate injunctive relief or otherwise seek equitable relief or criminal sanctions for any violation of law.
- 11. Respondent hereby waives its right to seek, or to obtain any hearing on the allegations made in the Complaint, and on the terms and conditions

- set forth in the Consent Agreement and its accompanying Final Order and/or on the EPA Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law, above.
- 12. This Consent Agreement and any provision herein shall not be construed as an admission of liability in any adjudicatory or administrative proceeding, except in an action, suit or proceeding to enforce this Consent Agreement or any of its terms and conditions.
- 13. Respondent voluntarily waives any right or remedy it might have pursuant to 40 C.F.R. § 22.8 to be present during discussions with, or to be served with and reply to any memorandum or other communication addressed to, the Regional Administrator of EPA, Region 2, or the Deputy Regional Administrator of EPA, Region 2,where the purpose of such discussion, memorandum or other communication is to recommend that such official accept this Consent Agreement and issue the accompanying Final Order.
- 14. Each party shall bear its own costs and fees in connection with this proceeding.
- 15. The undersigned signatory for Respondent hereto certifies that: a) he or she is duly and fully authorized to enter into and ratify this Consent Agreement and all the terms and conditions set forth in this Consent Agreement, and b) he or she is duly and fully authorized to bind Respondent (including any successors) to comply with and abide by all the terms and conditions of this Consent Agreement.

### Docket Number FIFRA-02-2010-5305

RESPONDENT: Oliver Exterminating
BY: Michael & State (Signature)
(Signature)
NAME: Michael E. Holston
(Please Print)
TITLE: General Manager
•
DATE: 12/22/2010
/ '

#### Docket Number FIFRA-02-2010-5305

Dore F. LaPosta, Director Division of Enforcement

and Compliance Assistance
U.S. Environmental Protection
Agency - Region 2

**COMPLAINANT:** 

DATE: 2/16/1/

#### Docket Number FIFRA-02-2010-5305

#### **FINAL ORDER**

The Regional Judicial Officer of the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency,
Region 2, ratifies the foregoing Consent Agreement. The Consent Agreement entered
into by the parties to this matter, is hereby approved, incorporated herein, and issued as
an Order. The effective date of this Order shall be the date of filing with the Regional
Hearing Clerk, United States Environmental Protection Agency, Region 2, New York,
New York.

Helen Ferrara

Regional Judicial Officer

U.S. Environmental Protection

Agency - Region 2 290 Broadway, 16<sup>th</sup> Floor

New York, New York 10007

DATE: February 16,0011

#### Docket Number FIFRA-02-2010-5305

#### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify that I have this day caused to be sent the foregoing fully executed Consent Agreement and Final Order, bearing the above-referenced docket number, in the following manner to the respective addressees listed below:

#### Original and copy Hand delivered to:

The Office of the Regional Hearing Clerk Region 2 U.S. Environmental Protection Agency 290 Broadway, 16<sup>th</sup> Floor New York, NY 10007-1866

#### Copy by facsimile, Overnight Mail to:

Benjamín Hernández Nieves, Esq. 268 Ponce de Leon Ave. The Hato Rey Center Building, Suite 513 Hato Rey, Puerto Rico 00918 Fax (787) 758-2399.

### Copy by facsimile, Overnight Mail to:

Chief Administrative Law Judge Honorable Susan L. Biro
Office of Administrative Law Judges
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
1099 14<sup>th</sup> Street, N.W., Suite 350
Washington, D.C. 20005
Fax (202) 565-0044.

Name: Mildred n. Bae

Date: FEB 1 7 2011