# ON THE D. STATES. TO A SEE THE STATES OF THE

#### UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

REGION 4 ATLANTA FEDERAL CENTER 61 FORSYTH STREET ATLANTA, GEORGIA 30303-8960

AUG 2 1 2008

**4APT-PTSB** 

Certified Mail - Return Receipt Requested

Warren U. Lehrenbaum Pillsbury, Winthrop, Shaw, Pittman, LLP 2300 N Street, NW Washington, DC 20037-1122

SUBJ: Docket No. FIFRA-04-2008-3030(b)

Syngenta Seeds, Inc.

Dear Mr. Lehrenbaum:

Enclosed is a copy of the ratified Consent Agreement and Final Order (CAFO) in the above-referenced matter. The original CAFO has been filed with the Regional Hearing Clerk and served on the parties as directed in Section 22.6 of the Consolidated Rules of Practice, 40 C.F.R. Part 22.

As stated in Section IV of the CAFO, the assessed penalty of \$17,550 is due within 30 days from the effective date. Please ensure that the face of your cashier's or certified check includes the name of the company and the docket number of this case.

Penalty payment questions should be directed to Ms. Lori Weidner either by telephone at (513) 487-2125 or by written correspondence to her attention at U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA), Cincinnati Accounting Operations address identified in the CAFO. Should you have any questions about this matter or your client's compliance status in the future, please call me at (404) 562-8979 or Ms. Cheryn Jones at (404) 562-9006.

Also enclosed is a copy of the October 2001 *Enforcement Alert* titled "U.S. EPA Notifying Defendants of Securities and Exchange Commission's Environmental Disclosure

Requirements." This document puts you on notice of your potential duty to disclose to the Securities and Exchange Commission any environmental enforcement actions taken by EPA. Please note that the contact phone number on page three of the Notice has been changed to (202) 551-3115.

Sincerely,

Jeaneanne M. Gettle

(pareanil) mi

Chief

Pesticides and Toxic Substances Branch

#### **Enclosures**

cc: Shannon Joyner

NC Department of Agriculture and Consumer Services

Tony Cofer
AL Department of Agriculture
& Industries

### UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY ATLANTA, GEORGIA

In the Matter of: ) 2			••
)	In the Matter of:	) 5d - 5	5
			$\sim$
Syngenta Seeds, Inc. ) Docket No. FIFRA-04-2008-3030(b)	Syngenta Seeds, Inc.	) Docket No. FIFRA-04-2008-3030(b)	<del>-</del>
			- 5
Respondent.	Respondent.	<b>男</b>	$\frac{1}{2}$
			50

## CONSENT AGREEMENT AND FINAL ORDER

#### I. Nature of the Action

- 1. This is a civil penalty proceeding pursuant to Section 14(a) of the Federal Insecticide,
  Fungicide, and Rodenticide Act, as amended, 7 U.S.C. § 136l(a) (hereinafter "FIFRA"),
  and pursuant to the Consolidated Rules of Practice Governing Administrative Assessment
  of Civil Penalties and the Revocation/Termination or Suspension of Permits
  (Consolidated Rules), 40 CFR Part 22. Complainant is the Director of the Air, Pesticides,
  and Toxics Management Division, United States Environmental Protection Agency,
  Region 4 (EPA). Respondent is Syngenta Seeds, Inc.
- 2. Complainant and Respondent have conferred for the purpose of settlement pursuant to 40 CFR § 22.18 and desire to resolve this matter and settle the allegations described herein without a formal hearing. Therefore, without the taking of any evidence or testimony, the making of any argument, or the adjudication of any issue in this matter, and in accordance with 40 CFR § 22.13(b), this Consent Agreement and Final Order (CAFO) will simultaneously commence and conclude this matter.

#### II. Preliminary Statements

- 3. The authority to take action under Section 14(a) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136l(a), is vested in the Administrator of EPA. The Administrator of EPA has delegated this authority under FIFRA by EPA Delegation 5-14, dated May 11, 1994.
- 4. Pursuant to 40 CFR § 22.5(c)(4) the following individual represents EPA in this matter and is authorized to receive service for EPA in this proceeding:

Cheryn L. Jones
Pesticides Management Section
U.S. EPA - Region 4
61 Forsyth Street
Atlanta, Georgia 30303-8960
(404) 562-9006.

- 5. Respondent Syngenta Seeds, Inc., is incorporated in the State of Delaware. Respondent owns and operates facilities in North Carolina, Puerto Rico, and Hawaii.
- 6. Respondent is a "person" as defined by Section 2(s) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(s), in that it is a corporation, and as such is subject to FIFRA and the regulations promulgated thereunder.
- 7. Respondent is a "registrant" as defined by Section 2(y) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(y) in that it is a person who has registered pesticides pursuant to the provisions of FIFRA.
- 8. Respondent is a "producer" as defined by Section 2(w) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(w), in that it is a person who manufacturers, prepares, compounds, propagates, or processes any pesticide.
- 9 "Pesticide" is defined by Section 2(u) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(u), to mean any substance or mixture of substances intended for preventing, destroying, repelling, or mitigating any pest.

- 10. Respondent produces pesticides "to distribute or sell" as that term is defined by Section 2(gg) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. §136(gg), in that the pesticides are held for distribution, held for sale, held for shipment, shipped, delivered for shipment, released for shipment or received and (having so received) delivered or offered to deliver.
- 11. On or about March 23, 2005, EPA issued an Experimental Use Permit (EUP),

  No. 67979-EUP-4, to Syngenta Seeds, Inc., Research Triangle Park, NC 27709,
  in accordance with Section 5 of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136c. On or about March 24 and 28,
  2006, inspectors with the Puerto Rico Department of Agriculture inspected Syngenta
  Seeds, Inc., Road #3 Km 155.0, Salinas, Puerto Rico. During the inspection, it was
  documented that Syngenta Seeds, Inc., did not obtain a State permit or license from the
  Commonwealth of Puerto Rico prior to the shipment and/or use of the mCRY3A corn
  that was the subject of the EUP. As stated in the EUP, a State permit or license must be
  obtained if such is required and issuance of the Federal EUP does not negate the need for
  permission from individual states. It is unlawful according to Section 12(a)(2)(H) of
  FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(2)(H), to use any pesticide which is under an experimental use
  permit contrary to the provisions of such permit.
- 12. Respondent violated Section 12(a)(2)(H) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(2)(H), and is therefore subject to the assessment of civil penalties under Section 14 of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136l.
- 13. On or about February 15 and 16, 2006, an inspector with the Hawaii Department of

  Agriculture and an authorized representative of the EPA conducted an inspection at the

  Vector Tobacco Research in Kekaha, Hawaii, and the Syngenta Seeds, Inc. facility

located at 7050 Kaumualii Highway, Kekaha, HI 96752. The two companies are located adjacent to each other in Hawaii. During the inspection of Syngenta Seeds, Inc., it was documented that the pesticide "Liberty," EPA Registration No. 264-660, was applied or sprayed from a hagie sprayer owned by Syngenta Seeds, Inc. onto a field at the Syngenta facility on February 15, 2006. The pesticide label lists a Restricted Entry Interval of 12 hours after application. The Central Notification Site at Syngenta Seeds, Inc., did not have a posting regarding the spraying of the pesticide Liberty, in violation of 40 CFR § 170.222 and Section 12(a)(2)(G) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(2)(G).

- 14. During the aforementioned inspection, the inspector documented that all personal protective equipment was not stored separately from personal clothing and apart from pesticide-contaminated areas, as required by 40 CFR § 170.240(f)(5), and in violation of Section 12(a)(2)(G) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(2)(G).
- 15. Respondent violated Section 12(a)(2)(G) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(2)(G), as described above, and is therefore subject to the assessment of civil penalties under Section 14 of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136l.
- 16. After consideration of the factors set forth in Section 14(a)(4) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136l(a)(4), EPA proposes to assess a total civil penalty of SEVENTEEN THOUSAND FIVE HUNDRED FIFTY DOLLARS (\$17,550) against the Respondent for the above-described violations. Civil penalties under Section 14(a) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136l(a), may be assessed by Administrative Order.

#### III. Consent Agreement

- 17. For the purposes of this CAFO, Respondent admits the jurisdictional allegations set forth above and neither admits nor denies the factual allegations.
- 18. Respondent waives its right to a hearing on the allegations contained herein and its right to appeal the proposed final order accompanying the consent agreement.
- 19. Respondent consents to the assessment of the penalty proposed by EPA and agrees to pay the civil penalty as set forth in this CAFO.
- 20. Respondent certifies that as of the date of its execution of this CAFO, it is in compliance with all relevant requirements of FIFRA.
- 21. Compliance with this CAFO shall resolve the allegations of the violations contained herein. This CAFO shall not otherwise affect any liability of Respondent to the United States. Other than as expressed herein, EPA does not waive any right to bring an enforcement action against Respondent for violation of any federal or state statute, regulation or permit, to initiate an action for imminent and substantial endangerment, or to pursue criminal enforcement.
- 22. Complainant and Respondent agree to settle this matter by their execution of this CAFO.
  The parties agree that the settlement of this matter is in the public interest and that this
  CAFO is consistent with the applicable requirements of FIFRA.

#### IV. Final Order

23. Respondent is assessed a civil penalty of SEVENTEEN THOUSAND FIVE HUNDRED FIFTY DOLLARS (\$17,550) which shall be paid within 30 days from the effective date of this CAFO.

24. Respondent shall remit the penalty by either a cashier's or certified check made payable to the "Treasurer, United States of America," and shall send the check via U.S. mail to the following address:

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Fines and Penalties Cincinnati Finance Center P.O. Box 979077 St. Louis, MO 63197-9000.

The check shall reference the name and the Docket Number of the CAFO ["Syngenta Seeds, Inc., FIFRA-04-2008-3030(b)"].

25. At the time of payment, Respondent shall send a separate copy of the check and a written statement that the payment is being made in accordance with this CAFO, to the following persons at the following addresses:

Regional Hearing Clerk U.S. EPA - Region 4 61 Forsyth Street, S.W. Atlanta, Georgia 30303-8960;

Cheryn L. Jones
Pesticides Management Section
U.S. EPA - Region 4
61 Forsyth Street
Atlanta, Georgia 30303-8960;

and

Saundi Wilson
Office of Environmental Accountability
U.S. EPA - Region 4
61 Forsyth Street
Atlanta, Georgia 30303-8960.

26. For the purposes of state and federal income taxation, Respondent shall not be entitled, and agrees not to attempt, to claim a deduction for any civil penalty payment made

- pursuant to this CAFO. Any attempt by Respondent to deduct any such payments shall constitute a violation of this CAFO.
- 27. Pursuant to 31 U.S.C. § 3717, EPA is entitled to assess interest and penalties on debts owed to the United States and a charge to cover the cost of processing and handling a delinquent claim. Interest will therefore begin to accrue on the civil penalty from the date of entry of this CAFO, if the penalty is not paid by the date required. A charge will also be assessed to cover the administrative costs, both direct and indirect, of overdue debts. In addition, a late payment penalty charge shall be applied on any principal amount not paid within 90 days of the due date.
- 28. Complainant and Respondent shall bear their own costs and attorney fees in this matter.
- 29. This CAFO shall be binding upon both parties and their successors and assigns.
- 30. The undersigned representative of the party to this CAFO certifies that he or she is fully authorized by the party represented to enter into this CAFO and legally binds that party to this CAFO.

Remainder of this page intentionally left blank.

AGREED AND CONSENTED TO:

sorisinal

Syngenta Seeds, Inc	igenta Seeds, In	eeds, Inc	S	enta	yng	S
---------------------	------------------	-----------	---	------	-----	---

D	Store (Signature	
Bv:	(Signature	"

Date: \_

Name:	Stare	Baret	
			_

\_\_\_ (Typed or Printed)

Title:	rp	Head	Logal

\_(Typed or Printed)

# U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

By: Carol & La	hash
By: CUO CO RO	MINUS GOT
Reverly H Banister	- /)

Director

Air, Pesticides and Toxics Management Division

61 Forsyth Street

Atlanta, Georgia 30303-8960

APPROVED AND SO ORDERED this 21 day of August 200 8.

Susan B. Schub

Regional Judicial Officer

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on the date set out below, I filed the original and one copy of the foregoing Consent Agreement and Final Order and served a true and correct copy of the foregoing Consent Agreement and Final Order, In the Matter of Syngenta Seeds, Inc., Docket Number: FIFRA-04-2008-3030(b), to the addressees listed below.

Warren U. Lehrenbaum Pillsbury, Winthrop, Shaw, Pittman, LLP 2300 N Street, NW Washington, D.C. (via Certified Mail, Return Receipt Requested)

Cheryn Jones
Pesticides Management Section
U.S. EPA Region 4
61 Forsyth Street, S.W.
Atlanta, GA 30303

(via EPA's internal mail)

(via EPA's internal mail)

Michiko Kono Associate Regional Counsel Office of Environmental Accountability U.S. EPA Region 4 61 Forsyth Street, S.W. Atlanta, GA 30303

Date: 0-21-08

Patricia A. Bullock, Regional Hearing Clerk

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region 4

Atlanta Federal Center 61 Forsyth St., SW Atlanta, GA 30303 (404) 562-9511

# EPA ACCOUNTS RECEIVABLE CONTROL NUMBER FORM TO BE COMPLETED BY THE ORIGINATING OFFICE: (Attach a copy of the final order and transmittal letter to Defendant/Respondent) This form was originated by: Saundi Wilson (Name) Region 4, ORC, OEA at (404) 5624:9504 (Office) (Telephone Number) Non-SF Judicial Order/Consent Decree Administrative Order/Consent Agreement FMO COLLECTS PAYMENT **USAO COLLECTS** Oversight Billing - Cost Package required: Sent with bill SF Judicial Order/Consent Decree DOJ COLLECTS Not sent with bill Other Receivable Oversight Billing - Cost Package not required This is a modification This is an original debt Yngen La Seed Inc. Namelof person and/or Company/Municipality making the payment) The Total Dollar Amount of the Receivable: \$\_ FIFRA OY 2008 3030(b) The Case Docket Number: The Site Specific Superfund Account Number: The Designated Regional/Headquarters Program Office: The IFMS Accounts Receivable Control Number is: \_ of the Financial Management Section at: \_\_\_ If you have any questions, please call:\_ DISTRIBUTION: A. JUDICIAL ORDERS: Copies of this form with an attached copy of the front page of the FINAL JUDICIAL ORDER bould be mailed to: Debt Tracking Officer Originating Office (EAD) ١.

Environmental Enforcement Section Department of Justice RM 1647

P.O. Box 7611, Benjamin Franklin Station Washington, D.C. 20044

- Designated Program Office
- B. ADMINISTRATIVE ORDERS: Copies of this form with an attached copy of the front page of the Administrative Order should be to:
- Originating Office

- Designated Program Office
- Regional Hearing Clerk
- Regional Counsel (EAD)