TED STATES TO NEW HOLD THE STATES TO NEW HOLD

UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

REGION 2 290 BROADWAY NEW YORK, NY 10007-1866

JUL - 6 2011

CERTIFIED MAIL - RETURN RECEIPT REQUESTED

Article Number: 7005 3110 0000 5934 3500

Mr. Mark Klotz, Director Division of Water New York State Department of Environmental Conservation 625 Broadway Albany, New York 12233-3506

Re: Notice of Proposed Assessment of a Civil Penalty

In The Matter of Village of Suffern Sewage Treatment Plant

Docket No. CWA-02-2011-3318

Dear Mr. Klotz:

Enclosed is a copy of the Administrative Complaint and notice of proposed assessment of a civil penalty, and an offer of settlement which the United States Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) has issued to the Village of Suffern Sewage Treatment Plant ("Respondent", or "STP"), pursuant to Section 309(g) of the Clean Water Act ("Act"), 33 U.S.C. §1319(g). The EPA is issuing this Complaint to begin the process to assess administratively a Class I civil penalty of \$5,500 against the Village of Suffern Sewage Treatment Plant for violations of the Act. The EPA is offering an opportunity for you to confer with us regarding the proposed assessment because the violations have occurred in New York.

Given the nature of the violations, the number of violators and the need for prompt resolution of this matter, an offer of settlement for reduced penalty was offered to Respondent. This offer is contingent upon receipt of no adverse public comments in this matter.

Sincerely,

Dore LaPosta, Director

Division of Enforcement and Compliance Assistance

Enclosures

UNITED STATES **ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY REGION 2**

290 Broadway New York, New York 10007-1866

IN THE MATTER OF

Village of Suffern STP 61 Washington Avenue Suffern, NY 10901

Respondent

NPDES Permit No. NY0022748

Proceeding to Assess Class I Civil Penalty Under Section 309(g) of the Clean Water Act

Docket No. CWA-02-2011-3318

COMPLAINT FINDINGS OF VIOLATION, NOTICE OF PROPOSED ASSESSMENT OF A CIVIL PENALTY, AND NOTICE OF OPPORTUNITY TO REQUEST A HEARING

I. Statutory Authority

- This Findings of Violation, Notice of Proposed Assessment of a Civil Penalty, and Notice of 1. Opportunity to Request a Hearing ("Complaint") is issued under the authority vested in the Administrator of the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency ("EPA") by Section 309(g)(2)(A) of the Clean Water Act ("Act"), 33 U.S.C. §1319(g)(2)(A). The Administrator has delegated this authority to the Regional Administrator of EPA, Region 2, who in turn has delegated it to the Director, Division of Enforcement and Compliance Assistance ("DECA") of EPA, Region 2 ("Complainant").
- Pursuant to Section 309(g)(2)(A) of the Act, and in accordance with the "Consolidated Rules of 2. Practice Governing the Administrative Assessment of Civil Penalties, Issuance of Compliance or Corrective Action Orders, and the Revocation, Termination or Suspension of Permits" ("CROP"), 40 Code of Federal Regulations Part 22, a copy of which is attached, Complainant hereby requests that the Regional Administrator assess a civil penalty against the Village of Suffern Sewage Treatment Plant ("Respondent") for failure to comply with the reporting requirements imposed by EPA in violation of Section 405(d) of the Act, 33 U.S.C. §1345(d), at its Village of Suffern Sewage Treatment Plant (STP).

II. Findings of Violation

Respondent is a duly organized Municipality and is a "person" within the meaning of Section 1. 502(5) of the Act, 33 U.S.C. §1362(5).

- 2. Respondent owns and operates the Village of Suffern Sewage Treatment Plant, located in Suffern, New York ("the facility"), which is and was at all relevant times a "point source" within the meaning of Section 502(14) of the Act, 33 U.S.C. §1362(14).
- 3. Respondent holds a National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System (NPDES) permit, issued pursuant to Section 402 of the Act, 33 U.S.C. §1342, for its Suffern facility.
- 4. Under the authority of Section 405(d) and the Standards for the Use and/or Disposal of Sewage Sludge (40 CFR Part 503), the Respondent was required to comply with the reporting requirements in §503.18 for land application, §503.28 for surface disposal, and §503.48 for incineration by reporting annually on February 19, 1994 and every year thereafter, to EPA the information and data collected during the previous calendar year (the "Annual Sludge Report"). The ninth Annual Sludge Report was due by February 19, 2002 and was to include the information and data collected from January 1, 2001 to December 31, 2001.
- 5. On April 25, 2002, the Village of Suffern Sewage Treatment Plant (the Respondent), was issued an Administrative ORDER Docket CWA-02-2002-3091 for failure to have submitted the ninth Annual Sludge Report by February 19, 2002 for its Sewage Treatment Plant. The ORDER stated that "the Permittee shall fully comply with all subsequent 40 CFR Part 503 requirements by reporting annually, on February 19, 2003 and every year thereafter to EPA the information and data collected during the previous calendar year (the "Annual Sludge Report")."
- 6. On April 19, 2011, the Respondent, Village of Suffern Sewage Treatment Plant, was issued an Administrative ORDER Docket CWA-02-2011-3027 for failure to have submitted the eighteenth Annual Sludge Report by February 19, 2011 for its Sewage Treatment Plant. The ORDER stated that "the Respondent shall fully comply with all subsequent 40 CFR Part 503 requirements by reporting annually, on February 19, 2012 and every year thereafter to EPA the information and data collected during the previous calendar year (the "Annual Sludge Report")."
- 7. A letter, dated March 17, 2011 submitted by the Respondent, was received by EPA on March 22, 2011, confirmed that the Respondent failed to submit the Annual Sludge Report by February 19, 2011.
- 8. The Respondent failed to submit the eighteenth Annual Sludge Report for its STP by February 19, 2011.
- 9. The Respondent's failure to have submitted the Annual Sludge Report due on February 19, 2011 as described above constitutes a violation of Section 405(d) of the Act. Since this is the Respondent's second failure to submit a required report, EPA has determined that, under Section 309(g)(2)(A) of the Act, 33 U.S.C. §1319(g)(2)(A), the Respondent is liable for the administrative assessment of civil penalties in an amount not to exceed \$16,000 per violation, up to a maximum of \$37,500.

III. Notice of Proposed Order Assessing a Civil Penalty

Based on the foregoing Findings of Violation, and pursuant to the authority of Section 309(g) of the Act, 33 U.S.C. §1319(g), and the Debt Collection Improvement Act of 1996, EPA, Region 2

hereby proposes to issue a Final Order Assessing Administrative Penalties ("Final Order") to Respondent assessing penalty of \$5,500. EPA determined the proposed penalty after taking into account the applicable factors identified at Section 309(g)(3) of the Act, 33 U.S.C. §1319(g)(3). EPA has taken account of the nature, circumstances, extent and gravity of the violation (or violations), and Respondent's prior compliance history, degree of culpability, economic benefit or savings accruing to Respondent by virtue of the violations, and Respondent's ability to pay the proposed penalty. Based on the Findings set forth above, the Respondent has been found to have violated the Act in two (2) instances.

IV. Notice of Opportunity to Request a Hearing

- 1. Respondent may, within thirty (30) days of receipt of this Complaint and as part of any Answer filed in this matter, request a Hearing on the proposed civil penalty assessment and at the Hearing may contest the factual allegations set forth in the Findings of Violation contained in Section II above, and the appropriateness of any penalty amount. The procedures for the Hearing, if one is requested, are set out in the CROP, including Subpart I thereof.
- 2. Be aware that should Respondent request a hearing on this proposed penalty assessment, members of the public, to whom EPA is obligated to give notice of this proposed action, will have a right under Section 309(g)(4)(B) of the Act, 33 U.S.C. §1319(g)(4)(B), to be heard and to present evidence on the appropriateness of the penalty assessment. Should Respondent not request a hearing, EPA will issue a Final Order, and only members of the public who submit timely comment on this proposal will have an additional thirty (30) days to petition EPA to set aside the Final Order and to hold a hearing thereon. EPA will grant the petition and will hold a hearing only if the petitioner's evidence is material and was not considered by EPA in the issuance of the Final Order.

V. Filing an Answer

- 1. If Respondent wishes to avoid being found in default, it must file a written Answer to this Complaint with the Regional Hearing Clerk no later than thirty (30) days from the date of receipt of this Complaint. EPA may make a motion pursuant to §22.17 of the proposed CROP seeking a default order thirty (30) days after Respondent's receipt of the Complaint unless Respondent files an Answer within that time. If a default order is entered, the entire proposed penalty may be assessed without further proceedings.
- 2. The Answer must clearly and directly admit, deny or explain each of the factual allegations contained in the Complaint with respect to which Respondent has knowledge or clearly state that Respondent has no knowledge as to particular factual allegations in the Complaint. The Answer also shall state:
 - a) The circumstances or arguments which are alleged to constitute grounds of any defense;
 - b) The facts which Respondent disputes;
 - c) The basis for opposing the proposed relief;
 - d) Whether a Hearing is requested.

3. Failure of Respondent to admit, deny, or explain any material factual allegations in this Complaint shall constitute admission of the allegation.

VI. Filing of Documents

1. The Answer and any Hearing Request and all subsequent documents filed in this action should be sent to:

Regional Hearing Clerk U.S. Environmental Protection Agency 290 Broadway - 16th Floor (Room 1631) New York, New York 10007-1866

2. A copy of the Answer, any Hearing Request and all subsequent documents filed in this action shall be sent to **Nadine Orrell,** Esq., Assistant Regional Counsel, Office of Regional Counsel, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, 290 Broadway - 16th Floor, New York, New York 10007, (212) 637-3244.

VII. General Provisions

- 1. Respondent has a right to be represented by an attorney at any stage of these proceedings.
- 2. This Complaint does not constitute a waiver, suspension or modification of the requirements of the Act, regulations promulgated thereunder, or any applicable permit.
- 3. Neither assessment nor payment of an administrative civil penalty pursuant to Section 309(g) of the Act will affect Respondent's continuing obligation to comply with the Act, and with any separate Compliance Order issued under Section 309(a) of the Act, 33 U.S.C. §1319(a), for the violations alleged herein.

ISSUED THIS Ch DAY OF JULY , 2011.

Dore LaPosta, Director

Division of Enforcement and Compliance Assistance

U.S. EPA - Region 2

290 Broadway

New York, New York 10007-1866

To: Mr. Charles W. Sawicki, Director of Public Works Village of Suffern Sewage Treatment Plant 61 Washington Avenue Suffern, New York 10901

CWA-02-2011-3318

UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY REGION 2

290 Broadway New York, New York 10007-1866

IN THE MATTER OF

Village of Suffern Sewage Treatment Plant 61 Washington Avenue Suffern, New York 10901

Respondent

NPDES Permit No. NY0022748

CONSENT AGREEMENT AND FINAL ORDER
Docket No. CWA-02-2011-3318

CONSENT AGREEMENT

A. STATUTORY AUTHORITY

1. This Consent Agreement and Final Order ("CA/FO") is issued under the authority vested in the Administrator of the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency ("EPA") by Section 309(g)(2)(A) of the Clean Water Act ("Act"), as amended, 33 U.S.C. §1319(g)(2)(A). The Administrator has delegated this authority to the Regional Administrator of EPA, Region 2, who in turn has delegated it to the Director, Division of Enforcement and Compliance Assistance of EPA, Region 2. In accordance with the "Consolidated Rules of Practice Governing the Administrative Assessment of Civil Penalties, Issuance of Compliance or Corrective Action Orders, and the Revocation, Termination or Suspension of Permits" ("CROP"), 40 Code of Federal Regulations Part 22, the Director, Division of Enforcement and Compliance Assistance hereby issues this CA/FO.

B. <u>STIPULATIONS AND FINDINGS</u>

Upon Consent of the Parties by their attorneys or other authorized officials, the parties stipulate:

- 1. On EPA issued an Administrative Complaint, Docket No. CWA-02-2011-3318, pursuant to Section 309(g)(2)(A) of the Act, alleging that Respondent was in violation of Section 405(d) of the Act, 33 U.S.C. §1345(d), and proposing a penalty of \$5,500. In the Administrative Complaint, EPA alleged that the Respondent in two (2) instances failed to submit to EPA the Annual Sludge Reports which were due on February 19, 2002 and February 19, 2011, respectively.
- 2. Respondent admits the jurisdictional allegations in the Administrative Complaint as set forth above and admits the specific violations alleged in the Administrative Complaint.

3. Respondent knowingly and explicitly waives its right to a hearing under Section 309(g)(2)(A) of the Act, and to appeal this order under Section 309(g)(8) of the Act, 33 U.S.C. §1319(g)(8).

C. <u>SETTLEMENT TERMS</u>

1. A Class I Civil Penalty of \$1,100 is hereby assessed against Respondent. Respondent shall pay such penalty as follows.

Payment Terms

2. Respondent shall pay, by cashier's or certified check, a civil penalty in the amount of \$1,100 payable to the "Treasurer of the United States of America". The check shall be identified with a notation of the name and docket number of this case, set forth in the caption on the first page of this document.

Such check shall be mailed to:

US Environmental Protection Agency Fines and Penalties Cincinnati Finance Center PO Box 979077 St. Louis, MO 63197-9000

- 3. Respondent shall also send a copy of this payment to the Chief, Water Compliance Branch, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, 290 Broadway 20th Floor, New York, New York 10007-1866.
- 4. Payment must be <u>received</u> at the above address on or before forty five (45) calendar days after the effective date hereof, set out below (the date by which payment must be received shall hereafter be referred to as the "due date").
 - a. Failure to pay the penalty in full according to the above provisions may result in the referral of this matter to the U.S. Department of Justice for collection.
 - b. Further, if payment is not received on or before the due date, interest will be assessed, at the annual rate established by the Secretary of the Treasury pursuant to 31 U.S.C. §3717, on the overdue amount from the due payment handling charge of \$15.00 will be assessed for each thirty (30) day period (or any portion thereof) following the due date in which the balance remains unpaid.
 - c. In addition, pursuant to Section 309(g)(9) of the Clean Water Act, 33 U.S.C. §1319(g)(9), if payment is not received by the due date, a quarterly nonpayment penalty will be imposed for each calendar quarter during which such nonpayment persists. The quarterly nonpayment penalty is 20% of the aggregate amount of penalties and quarterly nonpayment penalties which are penalties and quarterly nonpayment penalties which are unpaid as of the beginning of such quarter. You may also be required to pay attorneys fees and costs for collection proceedings in connection with nonpayment.

D. GENERAL PROVISIONS

Village of Suffern Sewage Treatment Plant

- 1. Issuance of the CA/FO does not constitute a waiver by EPA of its right to enforce legal requirements underlying this penalty assessment, either administratively or judicially pursuant to Sections 309(a), (b) and (c). Pursuant to Section 309(g)(7) of the Act, 33 U.S.C. §1319(g)(7), issuance or compliance with this CA/FO does not exempt Respondent from responsibility to comply with all requirements of the Act and of any legal order or permit issued thereunder.
- 2. Respondent's execution of this CA/FO and payment of the penalty assessed by this CA/FO shall constitute a complete and final release by EPA of the Respondent of any civil penalties under Section 309 of the Act, 33 U.S.C. §1319, for violations alleged in the Administrative Complaint.
- 3. Respondent knowingly and explicitly waives its rights under Sections 309(g)(2) and (8) of the Act, 33 U.S.C. §§1319(g)(2) and (8), to a hearing on this penalty assessment, and to judicial review of this penalty assessment.
- 4. Respondent waives any right it may have pursuant to 40 CFR §22.08 to be present during discussions with or to be served with and to reply to any memorandum or communication addressed to the Regional Administrator, or Deputy Regional Administrator, where the purpose of such discussion, memorandum or communication is to persuade such officials to accept and issue this CA/FO.
- 5. Each undersigned representative of the parties to this CA/FO certifies that he or she is fully authorized by the party represented to enter into the terms and conditions of this CA/FO to execute and legally bind that party to it.
- 6. Each party shall bear its own costs and attorneys' fees in connection with the action resolved by this CA/FO.

Effective Date

7. The effective date of this order shall be thirty (30) calendar days from the date it is signed by the Division of Enforcement and Compliance Assistance Director, shown below.

Date:	
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Region 2	
Date:	Dore LaPosta, Director Division of Enforcement and Compliance Assistance

ISSUED AND ORDER THIS DAY	OF, 2011
	Dore LaPosta, Director
	Division of Enforcement and Compliance Assistance

Re: Mr. Charles W. Sawicki, Director of Public Works Village of Suffern Sewage Treatment Plant 61 Washington Avenue Suffern, New York 10901

CWA-02-2011-3318

UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY REGION 2

IN THE MATTER OF

Village of Suffern STP 61 Washington Avenue

Suffern, New York 10901

Respondent

Proceeding Pursuant to §309(g) of the Clean Water Act, 33 U.S.C. §1319(g)

Proceeding to Assess Class I

Administrative Penalty Under Section 309(g)

of the Clean Water Act

Docket No. CWA-02-2011-3318

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify that, on the date noted below, I caused to be mailed, by certified mail, return receipt requested, a copy of the foregoing "ADMINISTRATIVE COMPLAINT" and a copy of the "Consolidated Rules of Practice Governing the Administrative Assessment of Civil Penalties and the Revocation/Termination or Suspension of Permits,"40 Code of Federal Regulations Part 22 (July 1, 2000)) to the following persons at the addresses listed below:

> Mr. Charles W. Sawicki, Director of Public Works Village of Suffern Sewage Treatment Plant 61 Washington Avenue Suffern, New York 10901

Mr. Mark Klotz, Director Division of Water New York State Department of Environmental Conservation 625 Broadway Albany, New York 12233-3506

I hand carried / mailed the original and a copy of the foregoing Complaint to the office of the Regional Hearing Clerk, United States Environmental Protection Agency, Region 2.

[Signature of Sender]

[NOTE: must be over 18]