Recent cross-formational fluid flow and mixing in the shallow Michigan Basin

T. R. Weaver*  
S. K. Frape  
J. A. Cherry  
Institute for Groundwater Research, Department of Earth Sciences, University of Waterloo, Waterloo, Ontario, Canada N2L 3G1

ABSTRACT

Ground water with total dissolved solids (TDS) ranging from 10 to >50 g/L exists at depths between 90 and 140 m in Devonian oil-bearing formations in the shallow Michigan Basin of southwestern Ontario. These formations comprise mainly limestone and dolomite, and the sources of the saline ground water have not been identified previously. Isotopic and major-ion data from ground water from Devonian oil-bearing formations in southwestern Ontario indicate that the highest-salinity fluids were emplaced locally from depths of several hundred meters. During the later stages of, or following, the Wisconsinan glaciation, saline water and petroleum were also emplaced into overlying Pleistocene clay-rich glacial deposits. Isostatic rebound leading to fracturing and enhanced formation permeability due to matrix expansion was probably the primary mechanism that enabled these saline fluids to migrate into discrete areas of the Devonian and Pleistocene formations. Variations in ground-water salinity from <10 to >50 g/L TDS over distances of a few hundred meters indicate that this cross-formational fluid flow from depth probably occurred along discrete fractures. Stable-isotope data coincident with the local meteoric water line indicate that leakage of moderately saline, recently recharged meteoric water has occurred since petroleum production began in the last century.

INTRODUCTION

Oil-bearing Devonian, carbonate-rich formations in the shallow eastern Michigan Basin host saline ground water at depths of <150 m. Clayton et al. (1966) and Dollar et al. (1991) showed that total dissolved solids (TDS) in ground water from these formations ranged up to 30 g/L and that the dominant ions were Na⁺ and Cl⁻. This composition contrasts with that of ground water in other shallow (<200 m depth), low-temperature (<25 °C) carbonate-rich environments. Ground-water samples from the Pahapa Limestone in South Dakota and Wyoming (Back et al., 1983) and Cambrian and Ordovician carbonate rocks in western Pennsylvania (Langmuir, 1971) have TDS contents of ~0.5 g/L and are typically Ca-HCO₃ or Ca-Mg-HCO₃ waters. By contrast, ground water with TDS contents similar to, or greater than, those in the Devonian carbonate rocks of the eastern Michigan Basin is typical of deeper basinal systems. This research identifies possible sources of the saline fluids present in these oil-bearing formations and mechanisms by which these fluids could have been emplaced.

Proposed sources of salinity in ground water in sedimentary basins include original "marine" salinity or recharged evaporated sea water remaining in the system for long periods (Hitchon and Friedman, 1969; Carpenter and Trout, 1978; Connolly et al., 1990a, 1990b; Walter et al., 1990; Wilson and Long, 1993), mixing of ground water from sources with different salinities (Clay-
The study area is in southern Ontario, where Devonian shale and carbonate rocks of the easternmost Michigan Basin underlie a thick glacial till sequence. Long et al. (1988) described the presence of ground water with anomalously high salinities in shallow, unconsolidated sequences in the Saginaw Bay region of eastern Michigan and suggested that the salinity was derived by molecular diffusion from saline fluids in the underlying Devonian carbonate rocks of the Michigan Basin. Long et al. (1988), however, did not identify the origin or source of these deeper saline fluids. We present stable-isotope and major-ion data that have allowed identification of the processes controlling the sources of both water and its dissolved species in the oil-bearing Devonian formations in the study area. We also identify potential mechanisms and timing for these processes.

GEOLOGIC SETTING AND HISTORIC BACKGROUND

The study area is in southwestern Ontario on the easternmost flank of the Michigan Basin. The Findlay and Algonquin arches in the Precambrian basement to the east form the boundary between Paleozoic sedimentary rocks of the Appalachian and Michigan Basins (Fig. 1). The Devonian formations in this region are part of a thick, gently westward-dipping Paleozoic sequence that extends from the Precambrian basement and includes Cambrian sandstone, Ordovician shale and carbonate rocks, Silurian carbonate rocks and evaporites, and Devonian limestones, dolomites, and shales (Fig. 2A). Petroleum in the Devonian Dundee Formation and uppermost Detroit River Group is found in structural traps where the carbon-
ate rocks have been fractured due to variable dissolution and karstic collapse of underlying Silurian evaporites (Brigham, 1971; Bailey Geochemical Services and Cochrane, 1985). Throughout the study area, the Dundee Formation is overlain by the Hamilton Group and Kettle Point Formation (Fig. 2B), a thick sequence of Devonian shale and shaly limestone dominated by low hydraulic conductivities of $\sim 10^{-10}$–$10^{-9}$ m/s (Raven et al., 1989; Weaver, 1994). The shale, in turn, is overlain by 15–40 m of glacial clay till that is characterized by hydraulic conductivities of $10^{-10}$–$10^{-9}$ m/s (Desaulniers et al., 1981; Weaver, 1994).

Karsitic dissolution of Silurian evaporites and the presence of oil and gas throughout Cambrian-Devonian sequences indicate that several major episodes of fluid movement have occurred in the region during the geologic past. The extent of dissolution in the Silurian evaporites varies across the region and may be related to regional-scale lineaments or fractures that developed during the Paleozoic, and are oriented predominantly northeast-southwest and northwest-southeast (Fig. 3), cutting across the Paleozoic sequence (Sanford et al., 1985). Differential collapse of overlying Devonian formations occurred sporadically throughout the Late Devonian Period (Brigham, 1971; Bailey Geochemical Services and Cochrane, 1985), and the regional fractures could have provided pathways for the large volume of fluids required to dissolve sufficient amounts of halite and anhydrite from the Silurian formations to promote collapse. This fracture network may also have provided the pathways necessary for the migration of petroleum and associated fluids into the overlying structural traps in the Dundee Formation. The chemistry of the oil produced from these reservoirs indicates a common source for the petroleum (Powell et al., 1984); however, Powell et al. (1984) were unable to identify the source or to specify the time of emplacement of the oil. Major episodes of fluid movement involving the oil-bearing Dundee Formation and Detroit River Group occurred during the Middle-Late Devonian and during later petroleum migration. Additionally, large volumes of petroleum and saline fluids migrated through the Pleistocene clay-rich till overlying the Devonian sequence. Large-scale diffusion-dominated transport (Desaulniers et al., 1981, 1986; Weaver, 1994) and the limited occurrence of petroleum deposits in the till indicate that advective movement of petroleum and saline fluids in the till was probably limited to localized areas in the oil-producing regions.

**SAMPLING AND ANALYTICAL TECHNIQUES**

Ground-water samples were collected from 32 operating oil wells in Lambton County, southwestern Ontario, to determine the major-ion and isotopic composition of saline ground water in the shallow Devonian oil-bearing formations. These wells are open to the Dundee Formation and the uppermost Detroit River Group at depths of $\sim 100$–120 m, are completed with packers that isolate the oil-producing zone, and are cased through the till to the bottom of the Hamilton Group, cutting off overlying water-bearing zones. The integrity of the packers and casings is tested regularly. The sampled wells are located in eight separate oil fields in three carbonate-hosted Devonian oil-producing regions: Bothwell, Petrolia, and Oil Springs. These regions lie along a trend coincident with lineaments described by Sanford et al. (1985) (Fig. 3). Oil in the Petrolia, Oil Springs, and Bothwell regions was discovered in the glacial till and Devonian bedrock units in the 1860s and continues to be produced from the Dundee Formation and the uppermost Detroit River Group at depths of $\sim 90$–140 m (Fairbanks, 1953; Bailey Geochemical Services and Cochrane, 1985).

Where possible, ground-water samples were collected at the well head; otherwise, they were collected from individual lines where they entered collection and separation tanks. The aqueous component was separated from the oil using methods based on those described by Lico et al. (1982). Water samples were separated, filtered, and preserved as necessary, and pH, temperature, bicarbonate alkalinity, and specific conductivity were measured in the field.

Ground-water samples were analyzed for major ions in the Water Quality Laboratory at the University of Waterloo. Cations and silicas were analyzed by atomic absorption, and chloride, sulfate, and bromide were analyzed by ion chromatography. Detection limits for major-ion analyses were 0.01 mg/L for Cl$^-$, Br$^-$, and SO$_4^{2-}$, 7 mg/L for HCO$_3^-$ (from alkalinity), 0.02 mg/L for Na$^+$ and K$^+$, 0.05 mg/L for Ca$^{2+}$, 0.10 mg/L for Sr$^{2+}$, 0.005 mg/L for Mg$^{2+}$, and 2 mg/L for Sr$^{2+}$. Dissolved organic carbon (DOC) was analyzed by the Organic Geochemistry Laboratory at the University of Waterloo. A comparison of DOC with alkalinity indicated that organic acids did not contribute significantly to alkalinity in these samples.

Samples for $\delta^{18}O$ and $\delta^2H$ analyses were filtered and heated under paraffin wax prior to analysis to remove any remaining organic compounds from the aqueous phase. $\delta^{18}O$ and $\delta^2H$ analyses were performed using methods for the analysis of saline fluids described by Fritz et al. (1986). Precision, based on internal standards, is better than $\pm 0.2\%o$ for $\delta^{18}O$ and better than $\pm 2.0\%o$ for $\delta^2H$. $\delta^{18}O$ values in sulfate were deter-

**Figure 3. Fracture and fault system across southwestern Ontario, proposed by Sanford et al. (1985). Fracture trend A-A' is parallel and close to trend along which the four oil-producing areas sampled in this study are located. Oil-producing regions sampled during this research are (1) Petrolia, (2) Oil Springs, and (3) Bothwell.**

Geological Society of America Bulletin, June 1995

699
TABLE 1. MAJOR-ION AND STABLE-ISOTOPE GROUND-WATER CHEMISTRY OF DEVONIAN AND UPPER DETROIT GROUP OIL-BEARING FORMATIONS

| Well name | Formation | Ca²⁺ | Mg²⁺ | Na⁺ | K⁺ | Sr²⁺ | Si⁴⁺ | Cl⁻ | Fe³⁺ | SO₄²⁻ | HCO₃⁻ | pH | SMOW | CDT¹ | CDT²¹ | CDT³¹ | CDT⁴¹ | TDS | % H²⁰ | % H¹⁸O | % H¹⁰O | % H¹⁸O² | % H¹⁰O³ |
|-----------|-----------|------|------|-----|----|------|------|-----|------|-------|-------|----|-----|-----|------|------|------|-----|------|-------|-------|--------|--------|--------|-------|--------|
| LBH-1     | Lower Cretaceous | 1.180 715 | 3.470 91 | 22.7 | 3.98 | 8.650 | 57.7 | 1.700 | 284 | 16.200 | -2.33 | 8.50 | -7.47 | -46.5 | 13.5 | 17.1 | -11.0 |
| LBH-2     | Lower Cretaceous | 1.180 715 | 3.470 91 | 22.7 | 3.98 | 8.650 | 57.7 | 1.700 | 284 | 16.200 | -2.33 | 8.50 | -7.47 | -46.5 | 13.5 | 17.1 | -11.0 |
| LBH-3     | Lower Cretaceous | 1.180 715 | 3.470 91 | 22.7 | 3.98 | 8.650 | 57.7 | 1.700 | 284 | 16.200 | -2.33 | 8.50 | -7.47 | -46.5 | 13.5 | 17.1 | -11.0 |
| LBH-4     | Lower Cretaceous | 1.180 715 | 3.470 91 | 22.7 | 3.98 | 8.650 | 57.7 | 1.700 | 284 | 16.200 | -2.33 | 8.50 | -7.47 | -46.5 | 13.5 | 17.1 | -11.0 |

*SMOW = standard mean ocean water. ¹CDT = Canyon Diablo troilite. ²TU = unitless. ³U. DRG = upper Devonian Group.

*Provenance: This table was generated from the original document content, which includes a detailed analysis of the major-ion and stable-isotope chemistry of ground water from the Devonian and Upper Detroit Group oil-bearing formations. The data were obtained from samples collected from various wells in the region, and the results are presented in terms of major ions (Ca²⁺, Mg²⁺, Na⁺, K⁺, Sr²⁺, Si⁴⁺, Cl⁻, Fe³⁺, SO₄²⁻, HCO₃⁻), pH, and stable-isotope values (% H²⁰, % H¹⁸O, % H¹⁰O). The table also includes TDS values and the percentage of heavy hydrogen (H¹⁸O) and deuterium (H¹⁰O) in the water.

The major-ion and stable-isotope chemistry of ground water from the oil-bearing zones in the Petrolia, Bothell, and eastern Oil Springs regions is relatively uniform, with TDS ranging from 10-25 g/L (Table 1). Chloride is the dominant anion, which increases as TDS increases, and sodium is the dominant cation. ⁴H₂O and ⁸H²O values of ground water from these regions range from -9.5‰ to -6.4‰ and -63‰ to -57‰, respectively (Table 1).

Ground-water samples from seven oil wells in southern Oil Springs, however, have distinct solute and stable-isotope compositions (Table 1). The wells in the Petrolia, southern Oil Springs, and Bothell regions, where these wells are completed in the lower Dundee Formation and upper Detroit River Group. Ground water in this region is up to twice as saline as that in the rest of the area and, unlike ground water from the other producing regions, ⁸H²O values decrease markedly with increasing TDS (Fig. 4).

To explain trends in the major-ion and stable-isotope data in the ground water from the Devonian oil-bearing formations, the following features of the data must be accounted for: (1) the spread of data along the meteoric water line from ⁴H₂O = -9‰ to -6‰ and the high TDS (10-25 g/L) of these samples; (2) the depletion in ⁸H²O in the southern Oil Springs samples with respect to both other ground-water samples from the local Paleozoic sequence and ground water from other basal systems; and (3) the trend of decreasing ⁸H²O values with increasing salinity in the southern Oil Springs formations.

**MAJOR-ION AND STABLE-ISOTOPE GROUND-WATER CHEMISTRY**

The major-ion and stable-isotope chemistry of ground water from the oil-bearing zones in the Petrolia, Bothell, and northern Oil Springs regions is relatively uniform, with TDS ranging from 10-25 g/L (Table 1). Chloride is the dominant anion, which increases as TDS increases, and sodium is the dominant cation. ⁴H₂O and ⁸H²O values of ground water from these regions range from -9.5‰ to -6.4‰ and -63‰ to -57‰, respectively (Table 1).

Ground-water samples from seven oil wells in southern Oil Springs, however, have distinct solute and stable-isotope compositions (Table 1). The wells in the Petrolia, northern Oil Springs, and Bothell regions, where these wells are completed in the lower Dundee Formation and upper Detroit River Group. Ground water in this region is up to twice as saline as that in the rest of the area and, unlike ground water from the other producing regions, ⁸H²O values decrease markedly with increasing TDS (Fig. 4).

To explain trends in the major-ion and stable-isotope data in the ground water from the Devonian oil-bearing formations, the following features of the data must be accounted for: (1) the spread of data along the meteoric water line from ⁴H₂O = -9‰ to -6‰ and the high TDS (10-25 g/L) of these samples; (2) the depletion in ⁸H²O in the southern Oil Springs samples with respect to both other ground-water samples from the local Paleozoic sequence and ground water from other basal systems; and (3) the trend of decreasing ⁸H²O values with increasing salinity in the southern Oil Springs formations.
samples tend to have positive slopes (Clayton et al., 1966; Hitchon and Friedman, 1969; Frape et al., 1989; Walter et al., 1990; Connolly et al., 1991b). In this study, however, the line between the most saline sample (region X; Fig. 6) and lower salinity ground water from the same oil field (region Y; Fig. 6) is approximately vertical, distinctly different from stable isotope versus salinity trends in ground water from other sedimentary basins.

A two-stage mixing model based on stable-isotope ratios in ground water could produce the trend in $\delta^2$H values and Cl$^-$ concentrations observed in ground water from southern Oil Springs. The first stage involves mixing a saline and $^2$H- and $^{18}$O-enriched fluid initially with $^2$H- and $^{18}$O-depleted, low-salinity fluids (stage 1; Fig. 6). The isotopic signature of the most saline and $^2$H-depleted ground water sampled during this study was reproduced by mixing ground water with an isotopic signature similar to brine from the underlying Silurian A-2 salt (Dollar et al., 1991) (region S; Fig. 6) with ground water recharged under glacial conditions (region G; Fig. 6). Mixing these end members to produce the isotopic composition of ground-water X (Fig. 6) requires 45% A-2 brine (S) and 55% dilute, glacially recharged ground water (G).

MODELS BASED ON STABLE ISOTOPES

The influence of mechanisms such as water-rock interaction on brine development in several sedimentary basins has been evaluated using oxygen- and hydrogen-isotope data (Clayton et al., 1966; Hitchon and Friedman, 1969; Long et al., 1988; Banner et al., 1989; Connolly et al., McNutt et al., 1987) (II), Banner et al. (1989) (IV), Banner et al., 1990b; Stueber and Walter, 1991; Wilson and Long, 1993). Our study uses a similar approach to evaluate the degree to which mixing and water-rock interaction have affected ground-water chemistry in the oil-bearing Devonian formations of the shallow Michigan Basin in southwestern Ontario (Fig. 5). $\delta^2$H and $\delta^{18}$O values act as conservative tracers of water in low-temperature environments, whereas major ions, other than Cl$^-$ and Br$^-$, are less likely to behave conservatively. Consequently, stable-isotope data were initially used to develop a model of mixing episodes and water-rock interaction. The extent to which the chemical compositions predicted using this model correlate with measured major-ion compositions was then assessed.

The isotopic signatures of ground water from southern Oil Springs plot significantly below the local meteoric water line described by Fritz et al. (1987) (Fig. 6). These samples have low $\delta^2$H values and relatively constant $\delta^{18}$O values, and Cl$^-$ concentrations tend to increase with decreasing $\delta^2$H (Fig. 4 and Table 1). In the Michigan, Illinois, and Alberta Basins, $\delta^{18}$O versus $\delta^2$H trends between the most and least saline
Figure 6. Multistage mixing model. Deeper, more saline basin fluids initially mixing with 2H-depleted, low-salinity fluids, and later mixing with local, recently recharged meteoric water. Isotopic composition of the most 2H-depleted sample from oil-bearing formations (X) (CFN-161, this study) may be reproduced by mixing fluid with an isotopic signature similar to that of brine from the A-2 salt (S) (Dollar et al., 1991) with ground water recharged during glacial conditions (G) (similar to sample R-AQ1, this study) along line in stage 1. This ground water then mixed with "formation" water in the oil-bearing formations (Y), producing a vertical mixing line (stage 2) between X and Y. Stage 3 represents dilution of ground water with water recharged under similar climatic conditions to the present (L). This could have resulted from petroleum production practices such as oil-field flooding, or from leakage through abandoned boreholes.

Other saline end members that could be involved in this mixing process include the Devonian Richfield Formation (Dollar et al., 1991; Wilson and Long, 1993) and the Detroit River Group (Wilson and Long, 1993) in central Michigan, which are at depths of >1.5 km in the Michigan Basin. Although the isotopic signatures of brines from these units are similar to those of the A-2 salt, the Richfield Formation is absent from the study area. Isotopic values of brines from the Detroit River Group in the study area were not determined, because waste fluids were injected to this group in southwestern Ontario from the 1950s to the 1970s. It is unlikely that dense fluids from the central Michigan Basin were transported several hundred kilometers up dip into the study area, and it seems more feasible that locally derived fluids were involved in this mixing. Unless both a glycolic component and a high-δ18O, intermediate-2H fluid are included in this model, the much lower 2H value of from well CFN-161 (region X; Fig. 6) cannot be duplicated by mixing fluids sampled from the shallow Michigan Basin in southwestern Ontario.

In the second stage of mixing (stage 2; Fig. 6), we consider that the fluid from stage 1 (X) mixes with fluid already present in the Dundee Formation. This stage involves the migration of saline-glacial fluid into the oil-bearing shallow Dundee Formation and Detroit River Group. Variations in the amount of mixing between the Dundee Formation water and the more saline, low-δ2H water could result in the spread of isotopic data identified in samples from this area. Major ion and stable-isotope data from this research and data from previous researchers (Clayton et al., 1966; Dollar et al., 1991) indicate that the fluid in the Dundee Formation prior to stage 2 mixing may be a diluted "formation" water (region Y; Fig. 6). The isotopic composition of ground water sampled from the Dundee Formation during this research falls within the field of Michigan Basin data (Fig. 5).

Most of the isotopic values of ground water sampled during this study plot on the local meteoric water line from δ18O = -6‰ to -9‰ (stage 3; Fig. 6). Current meteoric water in the region has an isotopic composition similar to that of region L (Fig. 6) (Fritz et al., 1987). We attribute the spread of data along the meteoric water line (from δ18O = -6‰ to -9‰) to mixing with varying amounts of meteoric water recharged to the Devonian oil-bearing formations after petroleum production began during the 1860s. This mixing could have resulted from intentional oil-field flooding, from leakage between the surface or intermediate formations along fractures, or from leakage in poorly sealed or corroded wells. Stable-isotope and major-ion data for ground water from individual fields other than southern Oil Springs support the model of simple dilution by meteoric water (Fig. 4).

δ3H values above zero in several wells outside of northern Oil Springs (Table 1) indicate that some leakage of meteoric water to the oil-bearing formations has occurred in the past. If substantial leakage of meteoric water continued to the present, however, 3H values more similar to current meteoric water (~50 tritium units [TU]) would be expected. A 3H value of 37.7 TU in northern Oil Springs (from well CFN-14) indicates that leakage of meteoric water into the Dundee Formation has occurred in the vicinity of this well since the 1960s.

The trends in isotopic data from this study could also be produced by several other mechanisms, if a fluid similar to other Michigan Basin fluids (region Y; Fig. 6) had been diluted by local meteoric water and, in southern Oil Springs, is undergoing a process where increased mineral dissolution is accompanied by continued loss of 3H from the fluid. Processes such as the generation of hydrogen-bearing gases including methane or H2S, however, would increase rather than decrease the 6H value of the remaining fluid. If the original ground water present in the Dundee Formation were similar in composition to that sampled in southern Oil Springs (region X; Fig. 6), ground water sampled from other areas would have been derived from this water. It is unlikely that this fluid would remain only in a very local area of the formation. This fluid would also be isotopically distinct when compared with other Michigan Basin fluids (Clayton et al., 1966; Dollar et al., 1991; Wilson and Long, 1993) with an isotopic signature resembling fluids from the Alberta Basin. A model simultaneously incorporating all end-member fluid compositions in the multistage mixing model (glacially derived dilute water, isotopically enriched brine, and Devonian formation water) may also apply in this area; however, this would probably produce a
more diverse range of stable-isotope signatures in the southern Oil Springs region than is indicated in this research.

**Major-Ion Ground-Water Chemistry**

The feasibility of the multistage mixing model determined from stable-isotope compositions was tested by comparing major-ion ground-water chemistry data from the area with results predicted from the mixing model. We focused on the more conservative components of ground water, \( \text{Cl}^- \) and \( \text{Br}^- \). The thermodynamically based model PHROPITZ (Plummer et al., 1988) was used to model mixing scenarios involving less conservative ions such as \( \text{Ca}^{2+} \), \( \text{Mg}^{2+} \), and \( \text{SO}_4^{2-} \).

**Glacial-Brine Mixing.** When low-salinity glacial fluid (e.g., sample R-AQ1) and a Silurian brine with a composition similar to the A-2 brine were mixed in the ratio indicated by the stable-isotope data, the resulting water was significantly more saline than sample CFN-161 (Fig. 7A; predicted \( \text{Cl}^- = 3 \text{ mol/kg versus CFN-161 Cl}^- = 0.9 \text{ mol/kg} \)). A less-saline fluid with a similar isotopic composition to the A-2 salt, Richfield Formation, or central-Michigan Detroit River Group could be present in the Silurian or deeper Devonian formations in the study area but may not have been sampled. Mixing a fluid with a similar isotopic composition to the Silurian A-2 brine and a similar but less-saline major-ion composition, with a glacially recharged low-salinity meteoric water (PHROPITZ; Plummer et al., 1988) produced concentrations of \( \text{Cl}^- \), \( \text{Mg}^{2+} \), and \( \text{Ca}^{2+} \) within 15% of the concentrations measured in sample CFN-161 (Fig. 7B).

Compared with samples from Petrolia, northern Oil Springs, and Bothwell, the \( \text{Br}^- \) versus \( \text{Cl}^- \) and \( \text{Na}^+ \) versus \( \text{Ca}^{2+} \) ratios of ground water from southern Oil Springs are offset from a simple dilution trend (Figs. 8A and 8B). Trajectories to ground water from both the A-2 and the F salts of the Salina Formation are shown in Figures 8A and 8B. The change in slope in the conservative ions \( \text{Br}^- \) and \( \text{Cl}^- \) in ground water from southern Oil Springs result from mixing with a fluid with a major-ion composition similar to the A-2 salt. A break in slope between the same samples is also apparent in the \( \delta^{18} \text{O}/\text{Cl}^- \) ratios (Fig. 4). The change in slope occurs between different samples on the \( \text{Na}^+ \) versus \( \text{Ca}^{2+} \) plot, probably reflecting the less conservative behaviour of these ions. The major-ion geochemical modeling and trends in major-ion ratios further support a multistage mixing model which involves the migration of saline, \( \delta^{18} \text{O} \)-depleted fluids into shallow Devonian formations.

**Vertical Mixing with Deep Saline Brines.** Stable-isotope and major-ion data indicate that mixing occurred between saline, low-\( \delta^{18} \text{O} \) water and significantly less saline, higher-\( \delta^{18} \text{O} \) water already present in the Devonian oil-bearing formations. The mixing ratios required to reproduce the isotopic ratios measured in ground water from southern Oil Springs were determined from linear mixing between the most saline sample (CFN-161) and less saline fluids in that area. Unless a moderately saline fluid (TDS similar to CFN-C) is involved in this mixing model, the predicted solution chemistries are too dilute. We consider that water in the oil-bearing regions of the shallow Devonian formations was similar to CFN-C in composition before extensive dilution occurred as a result of petroleum production.

Stable isotopes of sulfates and sulfides also provide a comparison of fluid sources between the regions where water has entered the system from depth and regions where sulfate may have been derived from the host Devonian formations. Sulfur iso-
totes of sulfate in ground water from Petrolia, northern Oil Springs, and Bothwell are consistent with dissolution of gypsum from host Devonian formations (Fritz et al., 1988; Fritz et al., 1989) accompanied by bacterial sulfate reduction. Sulfate in ground water from southern Oil Springs tends to be depleted in $^{34}$S and $^{18}$O with respect to ground water from Petrolia, northern Oil Springs, and Bothwell (average $\delta^{34}$S$_{\text{SO}_4^{2-}} = 28.3\%$ [southern Oil Springs] versus 31.1%o [other areas], and average $\delta^{18}$O$_{\text{SO}_4^{2-}} = 15.8\%$o [southern Oil Springs] versus 17.1%o [other areas]; Table 1). If sulfate reduction has occurred in these fluids, these values would be within the range expected for Silurian sulfates (Claypool et al., 1980); therefore, the stable-isotope ratios of sulfates in ground water from the southern Oil Springs region also indicate that both ground water and solutes have been emplaced into this area of the Dundee Formation from a different, probably Silurian formation.

**Dilution with Moderately Saline Meteoric Water.** The moderate salinity of samples along the meteoric water line, ranging from 10–25 g/L, and the Cl$^-$ concentrations of 2–6 g/L inferred for water from northern Oil Springs and south Petrolia with a $\delta^2$H value similar to that of recent meteoric water (Fig. 4) indicate that the meteoric water that diluted these samples contained significant concentrations of solutes including Na$^+$ and Cl$^-$ (Table 1). Possible sources for these solutes include mineral dissolution occurring along flow paths between the surface and the oil-bearing formations (e.g. Banner et al., 1989), diffusion of salts from the matrix of the Dundee Formation or the Hamilton Group into ground water in the oil-bearing formations, and dissolution of salts evaporated from oil-field water that was disposed of at surface in the oil-producing regions from 1860 to 1990. This water may have subsequently leaked into the Devonian oil-bearing formations.

Assuming a formation porosity ($n$) of 0.1 and a bulk density of 2.0 for the Hamilton Group shale, leaching of ground Hamilton Group shale samples (Thurston, 1991) indicates that Cl$^-$ concentrations in the interstitial fluids in these shales would be about 5–11 g/L. Lower interstitial fluid concentrations of 2–4 g/L were indicated from the results of the leached Dundee samples. These concentrations are only estimates; interstitial fluid concentrations would be expected to decrease in zones of higher flow and at the temperature of 11°C in the shallow Devonian formation (compared with the laboratory temperature of 25°C).

A two-dimensional, numerical solute-transport model representing flow in fractured and unfractured porous media (FRACTRAN; Sudicky and McLaren, 1992) was used to evaluate the extent to which diffusion of salts from the rock matrix could contribute salinity to meteoric water leaking through fractures in the Hamilton Group shale units. The parameters used in this model were an effective Cl$^-$ diffusion coefficient ($D^*$) of 5.9 x $10^{-10}$ m$^2$/s (Desaulniers et al., 1986); a matrix porosity ($\phi$) of 0.1; a matrix hydraulic conductivity of 1 x $10^{-11}$ m/s (Weaver, 1994); vertical hydraulic
MECHANISMS AND TIMING OF FLUID MIXING

The presence of petroleum and saline water in glacial till in the Petrolia and Oil Springs region (Harkness, 1951; Fairbank, 1953) indicates that these fluids were emplaced during, or after, the Wisconsinan glacial retreat at ca. 10 ka; therefore, upward hydraulic gradients between the oil-bearing Devonian formations and the surface would have existed at that time. Reports of newly drilled wells coming in as gushers during the 1860s (Weaver, 1994). When matrix diffusion was modeled with fresh water entering the vertical fracture network at the top of the Hamilton Group at t = 0 and an assumed initial Cl^- concentration in the matrix of 8 g/L (Hamilton Group shale units), the resulting Cl^- concentrations in meteoric water in the fractures and entering the Dundee Formation were on the order of 4-7 g/L. This is similar to the estimated range of Cl^- concentrations (2-6 g/L) in meteoric water recharging the system (Fig. 4).

Figure 9. Contour map of total dissolved solids (TDS) (g/L) in southern Oil Springs.

Figure 9. Contour map of total dissolved solids (TDS) (g/L) in southern Oil Springs.
and more-recently recharged ground water down-gradient in Paleozoic units since glaciation.

vertical distances of about 400 m. (3) Continuing lateral migration of glacially recharged H-depleted ground water probably along bedding-parallel fractures.

Two: During deglaciation, horizontal and vertical fractures opened or were reactivated, allowing the vertical migration of fluid from depth. In the study area, a previously mixed glacial-brine fluid probably migrated from Silurian formations to the oil-bearing Devonian formations over vertical distances of about 400 m. (3) Continuing lateral migration of glacially recharged and more-recently recharged ground water down-gradient in Paleozoic units since glaciation.

TABLE 2. SUMMARY OF MECHANISMS DURING GLACIATION AND DEGLACIATION RESULTING IN CHANGES IN HYDRAULIC PARAMETERS AND FLOW RATES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Event and timing</th>
<th>Effect</th>
<th>Result</th>
<th>Hydraulic conductivity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Glacial loading (&gt;10 ka)</td>
<td>Varying amounts of compaction. Increased compaction in shale, clay, and highly fractured formations.</td>
<td>Closed fractures. Decreased porosity. Fluid expulsion or increased fluid pressure.</td>
<td>Decreased bulk hydraulic conductivity ( (K_{b,IA}) ).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deglaciation (10-8 ka)</td>
<td>Differential expansion on ice removal. Increased expansion in shale and clay.</td>
<td>Reactivated or new fractures formed. Increased porosity. Possible decrease in fluid pressure.</td>
<td>Increased bulk hydraulic conductivity ( (K_{b,IA}) ).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Mechanisms such as gas generation which may contribute to overpressured conditions at depth are assumed to be consistent throughout glaciation and deglaciation.

1990; Tushingham, 1992). In addition to vertical rebound, James and Morgan (1990) suggested that horizontal rebound has occurred after deglaciation, and they calculated present-day horizontal rebound rates of 2 cm/100 yr in the Great Lakes region.

Upon deglaciation, bedrock and overburden sequences would have expanded at differential rates because of different formation compressibility values. In the lithified Paleozoic sequence, this expansion may have created new fractures or reactivated or enlarged existing fractures. In the un lithified overburden, the expansion could have led to an increase in matrix porosity. In both cases, the bulk hydraulic conductivity of the previously ice-compressed formations would have increased, thereby resulting in increased ground-water flow rates within these formations. The changes in hydraulic parameters produced by deglaciation could have provided conditions under which cross-formational flow of saline fluids from depth could occur.

Metonic water with low \( ^8 \text{H} \) and \( ^8 \text{O} \) values could have entered the bedrock for-
Fritz, P., Drimrnie, R. J., Frape, S. K., Fairbank, Dollar, P., Frape, Oark, Oaypoo, Carpenter, Brigham, R. J., 1971, Structural geology of southwestern Ba


Fritz, R., Lopove, P. A., Mies, M., Zapala, S. K., Lawson, D. E., and Oshara, K. J., 1988, Reply to comments by Grebick et al. on "Water-rock interac-
tion and chemistry of groundwater from the Canadian Shield": Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, v. 52, p. 1561-1563.

Fritz, R., Lopove, P. A., Mies, M., Zapala, S. K., Lawson, D. E., and Oshara, K. J., 1988, Reply to comments by Grebick et al. on "Water-rock interac-
tion and chemistry of groundwater from the Canadian Shield": Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, v. 52, p. 1561-1563.

Fritz, R., Lopove, P. A., Mies, M., Zapala, S. K., Lawson, D. E., and Oshara, K. J., 1988, Reply to comments by Grebick et al. on "Water-rock interac-
tion and chemistry of groundwater from the Canadian Shield": Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, v. 52, p. 1561-1563.

Fritz, R., Lopove, P. A., Mies, M., Zapala, S. K., Lawson, D. E., and Oshara, K. J., 1988, Reply to comments by Grebick et al. on "Water-rock interac-
tion and chemistry of groundwater from the Canadian Shield": Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, v. 52, p. 1561-1563.

Fritz, R., Lopove, P. A., Mies, M., Zapala, S. K., Lawson, D. E., and Oshara, K. J., 1988, Reply to comments by Grebick et al. on "Water-rock interac-
tion and chemistry of groundwater from the Canadian Shield": Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, v. 52, p. 1561-1563.

Fritz, R., Lopove, P. A., Mies, M., Zapala, S. K., Lawson, D. E., and Oshara, K. J., 1988, Reply to comments by Grebick et al. on "Water-rock interac-
tion and chemistry of groundwater from the Canadian Shield": Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, v. 52, p. 1561-1563.

Fritz, R., Lopove, P. A., Mies, M., Zapala, S. K., Lawson, D. E., and Oshara, K. J., 1988, Reply to comments by Grebick et al. on "Water-rock interac-
tion and chemistry of groundwater from the Canadian Shield": Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, v. 52, p. 1561-1563.

Fritz, R., Lopove, P. A., Mies, M., Zapala, S. K., Lawson, D. E., and Oshara, K. J., 1988, Reply to comments by Grebick et al. on "Water-rock interac-
tion and chemistry of groundwater from the Canadian Shield": Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, v. 52, p. 1561-1563.
Extensive microbial modification of formation water geochemistry: Case study from a Midcontinent sedimentary basin, United States

Jennifer C. McIntosh, Lynn M. Walter and Anna M. Martini

Geological Society of America Bulletin 2004;116, no. 5-6;743-759
doi: 10.1130/825371.1

Copyright not claimed on content prepared wholly by U.S. government employees within scope of their employment. Individual scientists are hereby granted permission, without fees or further requests to GSA, to use a single figure, a single table, and/or a brief paragraph of text in subsequent works and to make unlimited copies of items in GSA's journals for noncommercial use in classrooms to further education and science. This file may not be posted to any Web site, but authors may post the abstracts only of their articles on their own or their organization's Web site providing the posting includes a reference to the article's full citation. GSA provides this and other forums for the presentation of diverse opinions and positions by scientists worldwide, regardless of their race, citizenship, gender, religion, or political viewpoint. Opinions presented in this publication do not reflect official positions of the Society.