

Summary of Comparison of Alternatives

Evaluation Criteria		Alternative 1: No Further Action	Alternative 2: Air Stripping	Alternative 3: GAC Adsorption	Alternative 4, Option A: AWS Filtration System, O&M Conducted by Qualified Contractor	Alternative 4, Option B: AWS Filtration System, O&M Conducted by Local Water Association	Alternative 5: Point-of-Entry Household GAC Filtration	Alternative 6: New, Deeper, Clean Skyline Well	Alternative 7: Hookup to the City of Moses Lake Water Supply System
Implementability	Pros	· Could be put into effect immediately	· Technology readily available and well understood	· Technology readily available and well understood	· System constructed of standardized equipment and installed with minimum effort at one site	· System constructed of standardized equipment and installed with minimum effort at one site	· Technology readily available and well understood	· Technology readily available and well understood	· Technology readily available and well understood
	Cons	· None identified	· Requires acquisition of additional property and easements · Air emission permit may be required	· Requires periodic bed backwashing cone · Requires acquisition of additional property and easements	· Requires third-party certification of filter media for potable water use · Requires pilot testing to demonstrate effectiveness · Requires acquisition of additional property and easements	· Requires third-party certification of filter media for potable water use · Requires pilot testing to demonstrate effectiveness · Requires acquisition of additional property and easements · Also, requires Broadview Tracts Water Association to demonstrate financial viability and ability to provide a reliable source of drinking water	· Requires access to each household for installation	· Requires water right amendment to change withdrawal point · Need emergency backup · Requires abandonment of one Skyline well · Requires siting of new well within area that Skyline Water Company currently has rights	· Requires long-term agreement between the City of Moses Lake and Skyline water system's purveyor · Requires franchise through WDOT and purchase of easement on private property · Requires temporary water rights
Cost	Total Project Capital	\$0	\$590,000	\$580,000	\$580,000	\$570,000	\$510,000	\$500,000	\$400,000 ¹
	Annual O&M	\$18,000	\$39,000	\$36,000	\$43,000	\$37,000	\$37,000	\$18,000	\$36,000
	Monthly Water Bill	\$17	\$37	\$35	\$41	\$36	\$36	\$17	\$38
State Acceptance	Pros	· Will be incorporated following state review of EE/CA	· Will be incorporated following state review of EE/CA	· Will be incorporated following state review of EE/CA	· Will be incorporated following state review of EE/CA	· Will be incorporated following state review of EE/CA	· Will be incorporated following state review of EE/CA	· Will be incorporated following state review of EE/CA	· Will be incorporated following state review of EE/CA
	Cons	· Will be incorporated following state review of EE/CA	· Will be incorporated following state review of EE/CA	· Will be incorporated following state review of EE/CA	· Will be incorporated following state review of EE/CA	· Will be incorporated following state review of EE/CA	· Will be incorporated following state review of EE/CA	· Will be incorporated following state review of EE/CA	· Will be incorporated following state review of EE/CA
Community Acceptance	Pros	· Will be incorporated following community review of EE/CA	· Will be incorporated following community review of EE/CA	· Will be incorporated following community review of EE/CA	· Will be incorporated following community review of EE/CA	· Will be incorporated following community review of EE/CA · Recommended by Association	· Will be incorporated following community review of EE/CA	· Will be incorporated following community review of EE/CA · Probably acceptable to community	· Will be incorporated following community review of EE/CA · City approved design
	Cons	· Will be incorporated following community review of EE/CA	· Will be incorporated following community review of EE/CA	· Will be incorporated following community review of EE/CA	· Will be incorporated following community review of EE/CA	· Will be incorporated following community review of EE/CA	· Will be incorporated following community review of EE/CA	· Water may have different characteristics: taste, higher fluoride, and secondary contaminant levels	· Community opposition because: · Water bills would be increased · Some prefer unchlorinated water · Some oppose annexation to the City of Moses Lake

ARARs - applicable or relevant and appropriate requirements
 AWS - Advanced Water Systems
 EE/CA - engineering evaluation/cost analysis

EPA - U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
 GAC - granular activated carbon
 MCL - maximum contaminant level

O&M - operation and maintenance
 TCE - trichloroethylene
 VOC - volatile organic compound

WDOH - Washington State Department of Health

¹This figure is the amount for the entire project. However, USACE has an approved hookup design, easements and permits thus reducing future capital costs to \$330,000. However, these expended costs could be incurred again if design approval, easements and permits expire before they are used.